1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8	REPORTER'S RECORD VOLUME 4 OF 5 VOLUMES TRIAL COURT CAUSE NO. 2004882 FILED IN COURT OF APPEALS NO. 14-15-00 14th COURT OF APPEALS HOUSTON, TEXAS THE STATE OF TEXAS) IN THE COUNT 1/2/1/2/15/17/19/2/3 AMOURT CHRISTOPHER A. PRINE VS.) AT LAW NO. Clerkof) JOSE A. GARCIA) HARRIS COUNTY, T E X A S				
9	TRIAL ON MERITS				
10					
11					
12	On the 15th day of July, 2015, the following				
13	proceedings came on to be held in the above-titled and				
14	numbered cause before the Honorable Paula Goodhart,				
15	Judge Presiding, held in Houston, Harris County, Texas.				
16	Proceedings reported by computerized stenotype				
17	machine.				
18					
19					
20					
2122					
23					
24					
25					

```
1
                           APPEARANCES
2
   Mr. Raymundo J. Vazquez
   SBOT NO. 24094996
3
   and
   Ms. Catina Haynes
4
   SBOT NO. 24055638
   Assistant District Attorneys
5
   1201 Franklin
   Houston, Texas 77002
6
   Telephone: 713-755-5800
   Counsel for the State of Texas
7
   Mr. Juan L. Guerra, Jr.
   SBOT NO. 24031407
8
   Attorney at Law
9
   4101 Washington Avenue, 3rd floor
   Houston, Texas 77007
10
   Telephone: 713-529-6606
   Counsel for the Defense
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
```

1	TRIAL ON MERITS - VOLUME 4 OF 5 July 15, 2015				
2	STATE'S WITNESSES:		PA	GE VOL.	
3	Seth Gillham	Direct 8 v4	Cross	V.Dire	
4	By Mr. Vazquez By Mr. Guerra		32 v4		
5	By Mr. Vazquez By Mr. Guerra	69 v4	73 v4		
6	By Mr. Vazquez By Mr. Guerra	79 v4	81 v4		
7	Defense Motion to Suppress82				
8	Court's Ruling			86 4	
9	C. Morales	Direct	Cross	V.Dire	
10	By Mr. Vazquez By Mr. Guerra	87 v4	96 v4		
11	By Mr. Vazquez By Mr. Guerra	100 v4	101 v4		
12	Tasha Israel	Direct	Cross	V.Dire	
13	By Mr. Vazquez By Mr. Guerra	102 v4	125 v4		
14	By Mr. Vazquez By Mr. Guerra	146 v4	147 v4		
15	State rests		1	50 4	
16	Motion for Directed Verdict		1	50 4	
17	Court's ruling on Motion	• • • • • •	1	51 4	
18	DEFENSE WITNESS:	5.	a		
19	Jose A. Garcia By Mr. Guerra	Direct 152 v4	Cross	V.Dire	
20	By Mr. Vazquez		180 v4		
21	Defendant rests		2	08 4	
22	Jury Retired for Deliberations		2	26 4	
23	Defense Motion for Mistrial	• • • • • •	2	27 4	
24	Court's Ruling		2	30 4	
25	Verdict		2	30 4	
۷3	Sentencing by the Court		2	32 4	

1	Reporter's Certificate					
2	ALPHABETICAL INDEX OF WITNESSES					
3			Direct	Cross	V.Dire	
4	Garcia, Jose	Α.	152 v4	180 v4		
5	Gillham, Seth			32 v4		
6			69 v4 79 v4			
7	Israel, Tasha		102 v4			
8			146 v4			
9	Morales, C.		87 v4 100 v4			
10						
11						
12	EXHIBITS OFFERED BY THE STATE					
13						
14	Use is indicated as follows: J - Jury R - Record Only D - Demonstrative					
15	EXHIBIT	B - Bill of Ex DESCRIPTION	ceptions OFFER	ED ADMIT	TED USE	
16	3	DIC-24	30 v	4 30	v4	
17	4	Breath test slip	115 v	4 115	v4	
18						
19		EXHIBITS OFFERED	BY DEFENS	SE.		
20						
21	J - Jury		D - 1		itive	
22		B - Bill of E>	ceptions			
23	EXHIBIT	DESCRIPTION	OFFER	ED ADMIT	TED USE	
24	1	Breath test slip	135 v	4		
25	2	Breath test slip	135 v	4		

		oury 13,	2013			
1	3	Breath test slip	135	v4		
2	4	Breath test slip	135	v4		
3	5	Breath test slip	135	v4		
4	6	Breath test slip	135	v4		
5	7	Breath test slip	135	v4		
6	8	Breath test slip	135	v4		
7	9	Breath test slip	135	v4		
8	10	Breath test slip	135	v4		
9	11	Breath test slip	135	v4		
10	12	Breath test slip	135	v4		
11	13	CD	137	v4		
12	18	Copy of a photo	40	v4	41 v	<i>r</i> 4
13	19	Copy of a photo	40	v4	41 v	<i>r</i> 4
14	20	Copy of a photo	40	v4	41 v	<i>r</i> 4
15	21	Copy of a photo	40	v4	41 v	<i>r</i> 4
16	22	Copy of a photo	40	v4	41 v	<i>r</i> 4
17	23	DVD of 911 recordings	227	v4	229 v	<i>r</i> 4
18		recordings				
19						
20						
21						
22						
23						
24						
25						

```
1
                  (Jury not present)
2
                 THE COURT: All right. Do we have any
3
   issues that need to be addressed before we resume? Any
4
   issues that need to be addressed?
5
                 MS. HAYNES: After this witness, Your
6
   Honor, I will urge my Motion to Suppress. The next
7
   thing is the breath test, so I will urge it after.
8
                 THE COURT: All right.
9
                 MR. VAZQUEZ: Nothing from the State, Your
10
   Honor.
11
                 THE COURT: All right. Let's bring in the
12
   jury. We will take a break in one hour.
13
                  (At the Bench)
14
                 MR. VAZQUEZ: Yesterday we admitted the
15
   video.
16
                 THE COURT: Right.
17
                 MR. VAZQUEZ: Was that admitted only as to
   the portion with Officer Morales?
18
19
                 THE COURT: No. The video is in, but I've
20
   only allowed you to publish the part that was testified
21
   to by the officer --
22
                 MR. VAZQUEZ: So, now with Officer
23
   Gillham -- he's in the rest of the video --
24
                  THE COURT: If he's here to testify, he
25
   can testify about his participation in the video. At
```

```
that point, then I will allow it to be published, when
1
2
   it becomes relevant.
3
                 MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you, Your Honor.
4
                 THE COURT: Okay. Bernie, we are ready.
5
                 THE BAILIFF: All rise.
6
                 (Jury enters courtroom)
7
                 THE COURT: All right. Please be seated.
8
                 Okay. Welcome back, ladies and gentleman.
9
   Thank you very much for your patience this morning. You
10
   know we always have the best laid plan of starting at
11
   10:00 o'clock as much as possible. But if you would
12
   have been here at 10:00 o'clock, what you would have
13
   seen is standing room only. So we were trying to get to
14
   a point where we could reasonably take a break for all
15
   of the folks having stuff pending this morning. So, I
16
   do appreciate your patience. Sometimes those things are
   unavoidable. We will now continue.
17
18
                 Yesterday the case -- the State was still
   in their case in chief. So, Mr. Vazquez, you may call
19
20
   your next witness, sir.
21
                 MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you, Your Honor.
                                                        The
22
   State calls Officer Seth Gillham.
                 THE COURT: Come on up, Officer Gillham.
23
24
   Please raise your right hand for me.
25
                 (Oath administered)
```

```
1
                  THE COURT: All right. Thank you, sir.
2
   Have a seat.
3
                  When you are ready, you may proceed.
4
                  MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you, Your Honor.
5
                         SETH GILLHAM,
6
   having been first duly sworn, testified as follows:
7
                       DIRECT EXAMINATION
8
   BY MR. VAZQUEZ:
9
       Q. Good morning, Officer Gillham.
10
       A. Good morning.
11
            Will you please state your name and spell it
   for the record?
12
13
            My name is Seth Gillham. It's spelled S-e-t-h
       Α.
14
   G-i-l-l-h-a-m.
15
            And you are a police officer, correct?
       Q.
16
       Α.
            Yes, sir.
17
            With what agency?
       Q.
18
            The Houston Police Department.
       Α.
19
            Are you a certified police officer in the State
       Q.
20
   of Texas?
21
       Α.
            I am.
22
       Q.
            And how long have you been a certified police
23
   officer?
24
       Α.
           For approximately two years.
25
       Q.
            What kind of training did you have to go
```

through to become a certified police officer?

- A. Well, we go through a six-month-long police academy. Within that we get numerous certifications that range anything from how to deal with people that have mental illness, victims of domestic violence, and then also D.W.I. with field sobriety tests.
 - Q. And where are you currently assigned?
 - A. Currently until Saturday I'm at North Patrol.
 - Q. Until Saturday?
 - A. Yes, sir.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

- Q. What's happening on Saturday?
- 12 A. On Saturday, conveniently, I'm moving over to 13 the D.W.I. Task Force.
 - Q. And how do you get on the D.W.I. Task Force?
 - A. Well, I did 30 -- first, I did a 30-day rotation where instead of going patrol, I went in and rode with a D.W.I. Task Force for 30 days. I submitted my resume, and I completed an interview with the supervisors over at the Task Force.
 - Q. And is that fairly difficult to get into?
- A. Yes, sir. There are a lot of people that apply, yes, sir.
 - Q. What is the purpose of the D.W.I. Task Force?
- A. Well, the D.W.I. Task Force mission is to reduce alcohol and drug-related motor vehicular

accidents through public-awareness education and strategic enforcement.

- Q. So you've had specialized training in dealing with intoxicated drivers --
 - A. Yes, sir.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

17

18

19

20

21

22

- Q. -- in addition to the training you had at the academy?
- A. No extra training, just training -- or just 30 days riding with the Task Force members.
- Q. And had you done 30 days at the time of this incident?
 - A. No, sir, not at that time yet.
- Q. You were still learning at the time?
- 14 A. Yes, sir.
- 15 Q. Are you certified to do field sobriety tests?
- 16 A. I am.
 - Q. And how did you get certified to do the field sobriety tests?
 - A. We took an approximate five-day course where there is an instructor that came in and taught us; and then at the end of that, we took a written test and we demonstrated the field sobriety tests.
 - Q. Have you done any field training --
- 24 A. Yes, sir.
- Q. -- before the date of the incident?

A. Yes, sir.

- Q. What kind of field training did you do?
- A. Well, there's a field training program that every police officer has to complete. We ride on different shifts. Within that, we have a more senior police officer that's there to train us and we complete that and we have to meet the standards in order to pass.
- Q. And has all of your training led you to be able to identify intoxicated drivers?
 - A. Yes, sir.
 - Q. What are some classic signs of intoxication?
- A. There are numerous signs; red, bloodshot eyes, odor of alcoholic beverage emitting from his breath and person, trouble maintaining balance, trouble walking, staggering.
- Q. Based on your training and experience, does it take an expert to identify an intoxicated driver?
- MR. GUERRA: Object, Your Honor. That calls for speculation.

THE COURT: Overruled.

- A. I wouldn't think an expert, no, sir.
- Q. (BY MR. VAZQUEZ) When you come across somebody who has all of those signs as a driver, what are you supposed -- what are you trained to do as a police officer?

- A. Well, as a police officer, we never like to jump to conclusions. You take into -- everything that's going on, the totality of the circumstances, and we go from there. We are supposed to perform the field sobriety tests if we do believe they are intoxicated.
 - Q. Do you detain the drivers?
 - A. Yes, sir.

- Q. And why do you detain them?
- A. For their safety and everyone else's safety on the road. We just detain them just long enough to determine if they are intoxicated or not.
 - Q. Do you handcuff the detained suspects?
- A. Yes, sir, temporarily.
 - Q. So, what is the point of -- what is the purpose of a field sobriety test?
 - A. A field sobriety test, the main purpose is to determine if they lost mental and physical faculties in order to drive, if they can still safely drive or not.
- Q. So if you come across somebody like that, you can just write them a ticket and let them go?
- 21 A. No, sir.
 - Q. So you have to determine if they are safe to drive?
- A. According to our G.O.s, which is our general orders, which is our rules and regulations for the

police department, we do have to. It says we shall do
that.

Q. Now, Officer Gillham, on January 18, 2015, were
you working that day?

A. I was.

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

17

18

- Q. And what shift were you working?
- A. I was working night shift, so from 11:00 o'clock at night to 7:00 o'clock in the morning.
- Q. And you and your partner were responding to an accident?
- A. Yes, sir. We checked by, meaning we provided a traffic controller back up that night. Since it was on the freeway we wanted to try to slow cars down and keep other cars from hitting the R.D. or wrecked vehicle.
- Q. Did you come in contact with Jose Garcia?
- 16 A. I did.
 - Q. And did you move Jose Garcia from one vehicle to another, to your vehicle?
- 19 A. Yes, sir.
- Q. Was he detained at the time?
- 21 A. He was.
- Q. Was he handcuffed?
- A. He was.
 - Q. Why was he handcuffed?
- 25 A. Just so we can determine if he was sober or

not, if he could safely operate a motor vehicle as far as if he was intoxicated.

- Q. Is it the department's policy to handcuff people?
 - A. When they are detained, yes, sir.
- Q. What did you notice about the defendant when you first made contact with him?
- A. Well, the first thing I noticed is he had a strong odor of alcoholic beverage emitting from his breath and person. He had red, bloodshot eyes. When we got him out of the vehicle, he was having trouble maintaining his balance; and he was staggering.
 - Q. Did you notice anything else about his person?
 - A. Yes, sir, I did.
 - Q. What's that?
- A. We noticed that he had a strong odor of urine on him. His pants were wet -- and his pants were wet.
 - Q. Did you notice any signs of injury?
- 19 A. No, sir.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

- MR. VAZQUEZ: May I approach, Your Honor?

 THE COURT: You may.
- Q. (BY MR. VAZQUEZ) Officer Gillham, I'm going to show you what has previously been admitted as State's Exhibit 5, once this warms up. Do you recognize that picture, Officer Gillham?

1 Yes, sir. Α. 2 And who is that? Ο. 3 Α. That's the defendant, Jose Garcia, sir. 4 And is that the night of the incident? Q. 5 Yes, sir. Α. 6 Ο. Do you notice any bruising on his face? 7 No, sir. Α. 8 Q. Do you notice any marks or injuries to his face 9 or head? 10 Α. No, sir. 11 If you had noticed any kind of injuries or if 12 he had told you he had been injured in any way, what 13 would you have done? 14 We would have obviously provided him medical Α. 15 attention. We already had H.F.D. check by on the scene 16 as well. 17 So, the Houston Fire Department was there as Ο. 18 well? 19 Yes, sir. Yes, sir. Α. 20 Q. Had they checked with him? 21 Yes, sir. They cleared him medically. Α. 22 Had -- did the defendant tell you if he had any Q. 23 medical issues? 24 Α. Yes, sir, he did. 25 What did he tell you he had? Q.

- A. He said he was suffering from hypertension.
- Q. Did he tell you he took any medications?
- A. No, sir, he didn't.

- Q. Officer Gillham, after you transported -- you and your partner transported the defendant to -- or made contact with him, what did you do after that?
- A. Well, we swapped handcuffs, meaning Officer Carroll who arrived first on scene that detained him -- I just put my pair of handcuffs on him and then gave Officer Carroll's back, and he was placed in the back seat of our marked patrol car.
 - Q. And did you clear the accident scene?
- A. Yes, sir. We always try to get the accidents off the freeway as soon as possible.
 - O. Did it take a while to do that?
 - A. I wouldn't say any longer than normal, no, sir.
- Q. After you cleared the accident scene, what did you do?
- A. We then went -- took the nearest exit which would be the -- I believe it's the Greens Road which is the Greenspoint Mall parking lot and we finished up everything there, all of our paperwork and everything there.
 - Q. And after that?
- A. We transported him to Central Intox.

1 Q. And why would you transport him to Central 2 Intox? 3 To further investigate whether he could safely Α. 4 operate the motor vehicle or not. 5 And at some point did you make contact with Ο. Officer Morales? 6 7 I did, yes, sir. Α. 8 0. And why did you make contact with Officer 9 Morales? 10 A. Well, Officer Morales who was at the time with 11 D.W.I. Task Force was working Central Intox that night and he offered to assist in the investigation. 12 13 Q. But you were certified to conduct D.W.I. 14 investigations? 15 Α. I am, yes, sir. 16 Q. And you had done D.W.I. investigations before? 17 I did, yes, sir. Α. 18 Q. So, yesterday we heard that Officer Morales did 19 the --20 MR. GUERRA: Object, Your Honor. That is 21 a violation of the Rule. 22 THE COURT: Go ahead and finish your 23 question first. You heard what? 24 (BY MR. VAZQUEZ) -- that Officer Morales

25

conducted the H.G.N.

THE COURT: That's overruled.

- Q. (BY MR. VAZQUEZ) Why did you do the H.G.N.?
- A. He just offered to help. When you get down to Intox, there is a lot of paperwork to complete. And while he just offered, I accepted. There is no reason in particular or anything like that.
- Q. But you did -- did you conduct any field sobriety tests?
 - A. Yes, sir, I conducted two.
 - Q. And what field sobriety tests did you conduct?
- A. I conducted the one-leg stand and the walk and turn.
 - Q. What is the purpose of the one-leg stand?
- A. The one-leg stand, it divides your mental and physical attention, so to speak. So, it requires the subject to perform mental tasks and physical tasks at the same time, much like if you were driving.
- Q. And what is an individual asked to do in this test?
- A. Well, first, we ask the individual to stand in a designated yellow square. We ask him to put his feet together, his hands down by his side. We ask him to raise either his left or right foot, whichever one he chooses, approximately 6 inches; and I always say that's about the height of a dollar bill. We ask him to count

out loud, a thousand one, a thousand two, 1,003. During that time we ask him to keep his foot parallel to the ground, his toes pointed out, and for him to look at his toes while doing so. And we tell him to do that until I say to stop which is 30 seconds, sir.

- Q. Are there any clues you are looking for on this test?
 - A. Yes, sir, there are four clues.
 - Q. What are the clues you are looking for?
- A. First clue is whether they use their arm, meaning that their arm separates from their side more than 6 inches. The second is if they sway. The third is if they hop, and the fourth is if they drop their foot or not.
- Q. Is this a good indicator of physical or mental impairment?
 - A. Yes, sir, it is.
- Q. And how is that?
- A. Well, it's been studied by NHTSA. It's been studied numerous times; and, like I said previously, it's a great indicator because it asks them to divide their mental and, you know, physical attention.
 - Q. Did you demonstrate the test for the defendant?
- 24 A. I did.

Q. Did you ask the defendant if he had any

```
1
   handicaps or disabilities that would interfere with him
2
   to be able to perform?
3
       Α.
            Yes, sir.
4
            How did the defendant perform on his
       0.
5
   evaluation?
6
       Α.
           He showed three clues.
7
            And there are how many possible?
       Ο.
8
       Α.
            Out of four.
9
            In your opinion did the defendant pass or fail
       Q.
10
   this test?
11
            He showed signs of impairment. So, you could
       Α.
12
   say he failed, yes, sir.
13
            And was this test conducted on video?
       Q.
14
            Yes, sir, it was.
       Α.
15
       O.
            And were you present at -- was the -- sorry.
16
   You were present during the recording of the video?
17
            Yes, sir.
       Α.
18
            And you are able to identify voices and names,
19
   people on the video?
20
       Α.
            Yes, sir.
                  MR. VAZQUEZ: Your Honor, at this time I
21
22
   would like to publish the one-leg stand portion of the
23
   video.
24
                  THE COURT: All right. You may.
25
                  MR. GUERRA: Your Honor, before that's
```

```
1
   done, may I take this officer on voir dire to determine
2
   whether he was qualified at the time he administered
3
   these tests to administer the standardized field
4
   sobriety tests?
5
                 MR. VAZQUEZ: I believe I've already
6
   established that, Your Honor. He's a certified police
7
   officer.
8
                 THE COURT: Who has been certified in
9
   field sobriety tests. So, you will have an opportunity
10
   to cross-examine him.
11
                 MR. GUERRA: Thank you, Your Honor.
12
                 THE COURT: You may publish that.
13
                 MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you, Your Honor.
14
                  (State's Exhibit 2 published to the jury.)
15
            (BY MR. VAZQUEZ) Officer Gillham, it appears
       Ο.
16
   that you are reading the instructions off of something.
17
   What is that?
18
       Α.
            That is instructions that are published at the
19
   Central Intox room. It's in every Intox room.
20
       Q. And why are those there?
            Because just to follow a standardized manner
21
       Α.
22
   that's published by NHTSA.
23
            So, are those NHTSA standards or Houston Police
24
   standards?
25
       A. Those are NHTSA standards.
```

- Q. (BY MR. VAZQUEZ) Officer Gillham, you were looking at your watch while the defendant was doing that test. Why was that?
- A. Because they are supposed to hold their foot up for 30 seconds; and we want to get the most accurate time, obviously.
- Q. Well, the defendant was counting the time. Is that not accurate?
- A. Well, with intoxicated people and even, you know, possibly sober people, you know, it's hard to keep an accurate 30-second count. So we obviously look at our watch to make it as most accurate as possible.
 - Q. And what test did you do next?
 - A. I did the walk and turn, sir.
- O. And what is the walk and turn?
- A. The walk and turn again is a standardized field sobriety test. It divides the mental and physical attention of the subject.
 - O. So, it's a divided-attention test?
- 22 A. Yes, sir.

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

- 23 O. Are there clues on this test?
- 24 A. Yes, sir.
- Q. And what are the clues that you are trying to

```
look for?
1
2
            Well, there are eight clues on this test. The
3
   first is: Does the subject or defendant have trouble
4
   maintaining balance during the instruction phase?
5
                  Second, does he or she start too soon?
6
                  Third, does he or she use arms when
7
   walking?
8
                  Fourth, does the defendant step off the
9
   line?
10
                  Fifth, does he fail to touch heel to toe?
                  Sixth, improper turn.
11
12
                  Seventh, takes too many steps.
13
                  And eighth is -- excuse me -- I'm sorry, I
14
   just drew a blank. I apologize.
15
       Ο.
            But there are eight total?
16
       Α.
            Yes, sir.
17
            Okay. Is this a good test to test the physical
       Ο.
18
   or mental impairment?
19
            Yes, sir, it is.
       Α.
20
       Q.
             In what way?
21
            Again, it divides their attention; and so much
22
   like if they were driving, they are having to perform
23
   physical tasks and mental tasks at the same time.
             In your opinion, based on your training and
24
       Q.
25
   experience, does nervousness impede the ability of
```

```
1
   someone to perform this test?
2
             No, sir.
       Α.
3
             Did you demonstrate the test for the defendant?
       Ο.
4
             I did.
       Α.
5
            Did you ask if he had any handicaps or
       Q.
6
   disabilities that would interfere with his ability to
7
   perform?
8
       Α.
            Yes, sir.
9
            How did the defendant perform on his
       Q.
10
   evaluation?
11
       Α.
           He showed seven clues.
12
       Q.
            Seven out of the eight clues?
13
       Α.
             Yes, sir.
14
             Now, part of the test is to stand -- well, we
15
   will see that on video.
16
                  MR. VAZQUEZ: I will withdraw that
17
   question, Your Honor.
18
       Q.
            (BY MR. VAZQUEZ) Was the test conducted on the
19
   video?
20
       Α.
             Yes, sir, it was.
            And you were there?
21
       Q.
22
       Α.
             I was.
23
                  MR. VAZQUEZ: Your Honor, at this time I
24
   would like to publish the walk-and-turn portion of the
25
   video.
```

1 THE COURT: You may. 2 MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you. 3 (State's Exhibit 2 published to the jury.) 4 (BY MR. VAZQUEZ) Officer Gillham, why is the 0. 5 defendant standing like that? 6 Α. Why? Because that's NHTSA's -- they ask him to 7 get in that position and stay in that position, sir. 8 Ο. And most people usually don't stand that way. 9 Why is this an important factor of the test? 10 Because, once again, it requires them to listen Α. 11 and -- which is usually the mental side, and the 12 physical side is standing in one position. 13 Okay. Now, on the video, you seem a little Q. 14 relaxed in there. 15 Yes, sir. Α. 16 Q. Why are you so relaxed? 17 I'm not very aggressive or --Α. 18 MR. GUERRA: Object as to relevance, Your 19 Honor. 20 THE COURT: Overruled. Go ahead. 21 I'm not a very aggressive or Type A person. I Α. 22 feel that once you are respectful to everyone that you 23 meet, you can still get your point out without getting 24 in everyone's face. 25 Q. (BY MR. VAZQUEZ) Thank you.

Officer Gillham, based on your training and experience, if a person is intoxicated, can they perform better on one test and poorly on another?

A. Oh, yes, sir.

- Q. And did the defendant perform better on one test and poorly on another in this case or did he perform both --
- A. I would say he probably performed poorly on both because he had three out of four clues on the one-leg stand and seven out of eight on the walk and turn. So --
- Q. And, officer, you are not saying that because somebody has a strong odor of alcohol on his breath, he's intoxicated, right?
- A. Oh, no, absolutely not. You know, I talk to numerous people that have had odor of alcohol on their breath, but they weren't intoxicated by any stretch of the imagination. That's why we look at everything and we do the standardized field sobriety tests.
- Q. And so having glassy, bloodshot eyes, also not immediately intoxicated?
- A. No, sir. I mean, that could be from numerous things. You know, it could be from working late, you know. I get bloodshot eyes when I work long hours. It could be from smog. It could be from a lot of things.

- Q. Slurred speech means they are intoxicated?
- 2 A. No not necessarily.
 - Q. Poor balance means they are intoxicated?
 - A. No, sir.

- Q. So, based on the totality of the circumstances, it would take a lot of things to show intoxication?
- A. Yes, sir. It's not -- it's never just one thing that that's the reason why.
- 9 Q. And did the defendant show signs of 10 intoxication?
 - A. Yes, sir.
 - Q. And in your opinion, based on your training and experience, was the defendant intoxicated?
 - A. Yes, sir.
 - Q. What do you base your opinion on?
 - A. Just like you just said, the totality of the circumstances, how he performed poorly on the standardized field sobriety tests. He had a strong odor of alcoholic beverage emitting from his breath and person. He had red, bloodshot eyes and he had trouble maintaining balance and he staggered obviously when he walked. And obviously, the urine, he had trouble controlling his bladder.
 - Q. So, on your training and experience, had he lost his physical faculties?

Yes, sir. Α.

1

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

15

17

23

- 2 Based on your training and experience, had he Ο. lost his mental faculties?
 - Yes, sir. Α.
 - In your opinion, what was the source of the Q. defendant's impairment?
 - I believe it was alcohol. Α.
 - Ο. And why is that?
 - Once again, because of how he performed on the Α. field sobriety tests and everything that's mentioned.
- 11 So, after you formed this opinion, what did you 12 do next?
- 13 We -- after we finished, then Officer Morales Α. 14 conducted the -- well, we read him his DIC-24.
 - You read him his DIC-24? Q.
- 16 Α. I did.
 - And what is the DIC-24? O.
- It's a standardized sheet that we read to 18 Α. 19 everyone placed under arrest for D.W.I., and that's when 20 they are formally under arrest at that point.
- 21 And did you inform the defendant of the Ο. 22 consequences of refusing a breath or blood test?
 - Α. I did.
 - And what are those consequences? Q.
- 25 A prolonged period of their license being Α.

```
1
   suspended.
2
            Did the defendant tell you he refused to give
3
   any evidence in this case?
4
             No, sir.
       Α.
5
                  MR. VAZQUEZ: May I approach, Your Honor?
6
                  THE COURT: Yes.
7
             (BY MR. VAZQUEZ) Officer Gillham, I am handing
       Ο.
8
   you what's been previously marked as State's Exhibit No.
9
       Do you recognize that?
   3.
10
             Yes, sir.
       Α.
11
             And what is that?
       Q.
12
             That's the DIC-24.
       Α.
13
            And is that the same form that was done at the
       Q.
   night or at the date in question?
14
15
             Yes, sir.
       Α.
16
       Q.
             Does it appear to be altered in any way?
17
             No, sir.
       Α.
18
       Q.
             Is that your signature on the paper?
19
             It is.
       Α.
20
                  MR. VAZQUEZ: Your Honor, I am now showing
21
   this to opposing counsel.
22
                  MR. GUERRA: One question, Your Honor.
                                                            Is
23
   this going to be on video?
24
                  THE WITNESS: I read it to him on video,
25
   yes.
```

```
1
                  MR. GUERRA: Okay. No objections.
2
                  THE COURT: State's Exhibit No. 3 is
3
   admitted.
4
                  MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you, Judge.
5
   Permission to publish the portion of that, Your Honor?
6
                  THE COURT: Yes, you may.
7
                  MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you.
8
                  (State's Exhibit 3 published to the jury.)
9
            (BY MR. VAZQUEZ) Did he consent to giving a
       Q.
10
   breath specimen?
11
       Α.
            Yes, sir.
12
                  MR. VAZQUEZ: Permission to publish
13
   State's Exhibit 3, Your Honor?
14
                  THE COURT: Yes, you may.
15
                  (State's Exhibit 3 published to the jury.)
16
       Q.
            (BY MR. VAZQUEZ) Mr. Gillham, is this the same
17
   form you just read on video?
            Yes, sir.
18
       Α.
19
            And had the defendant refused to give a breath
20
   specimen, what would have happened?
21
                  MR. GUERRA: Object to relevance, Your
22
   Honor.
23
                  THE COURT: Overruled.
24
            Well, in Harris County, if he refused to give a
       Α.
25
   breath test, then we would apply for a warrant through a
```

```
1
   judge, a search warrant; and then if the judge signs it,
2
   then we have a search warrant to conduct a blood test at
3
   that point.
4
           (BY MR. VAZQUEZ) I'm sorry, Mr. Gillham.
       Ο.
                                                       I'm
5
   referring to this form. What would you need on this
6
   form if he refused?
7
            Oh, I would have -- well, what box I would have
8
   checked?
9
       Q.
            Correct.
10
       A. Oh, blood.
11
           And then --
       Q.
12
       Α.
            Oh, yes, and --
13
            The defendant would have had to --
       Q.
14
            It would be the subject refused to the taking
       Α.
15
   of a specimen and further refused to sign to blow.
16
           Okay. Did the defendant refuse to sign or
17
   refuse to give a specimen?
18
       Α.
            No.
19
                 MR. GUERRA: Objection asked and answered,
20
   Your Honor.
21
                 THE COURT: Sustained.
22
                 MR. GUERRA: No further questions, Your
23
   Honor.
24
                 THE COURT: All right. Mr. Guerra.
25
                 MR. GUERRA: Thank you, Your Honor.
```

1 CROSS-EXAMINATION 2 BY MR. GUERRA: 3 Good morning, Officer Gillham. How are you? Q. 4 I'm good. Α. 5 Good. I represent Mr. Garcia. I would like to Q. 6 ask you a few questions, if that's okay? 7 Yes, sir. Α. 8 Ο. Let's talk about you testified that you have 9 been on the force two years; is that correct? 10 Α. Approximately, yes, sir. 11 As of today? Q. 12 Α. Yes, sir. 13 Q. So, back on January 18th of this year, you 14 would have been on the force for approximately a year and a half? 15 16 Α. Approximately, yes, sir. 17 Now at that point, back in January of this Ο. 18 year, how many D.W.I. investigations have you conducted? 19 In January, I would say conservatively anywhere Α. 20 from 10 to 15 in January, conservatively. 21 Ο. So, 10 to 15 back in January? 22 Α. Yes, sir. 23 And back in January, you didn't have this 24 30-day course that you have now as you are going through 25 the Task Force, correct?

1 No, sir, at that point, I did not. Α. 2 And to be clear, back in January -- you were Ο. 3 obviously not in the D.W.I. Task Force? No, sir. 4 Α. 5 D.W.I. Task Force officers are obviously more Ο. 6 experienced and more trained than you were back in 7 January? 8 Α. Yes, sir, they are definitely more specialized. 9 Okay. Now, Officer Gillham, you wrote a police Q. 10 report in this case, correct? 11 I did, yes, sir. Α. 12 Q. Now, in your training in the academy, they 13 teach you how to write these reports? 14 Yes, sir. Α. 15 And it's important to be detailed? O. 16 Α. Yes, sir. 17 It's important to be thorough? Ο. 18 Α. Yes, sir. 19 And it's important to be complete? O. 20 Α. Yes, sir. 21 So -- and you want all of those things in your O. 22 report, correct? 23 Α. Of course. 24 Now, these reports -- this report that you Q.

wrote was written back in January, correct?

```
1
            Yes, sir.
       Α.
2
             Where the facts of this case were fresher on
3
   your mind?
4
             Yes, sir.
       Α.
5
             Now, that report that you wrote, you also
       Q.
6
   talked to other officers when you wrote that report?
7
            What do you mean by that? What are you
       Α.
8
   referring --
9
             In other words, you included information that
       Q.
10
   Officer Carroll provided to you?
11
             In the interest of being thorough and complete,
12
   yes, sir.
13
       Q.
             Right. And that's documented in your report?
14
            Yes, sir.
       Α.
15
       O.
             Now, when you made the scene, this was about
16
   2:30-ish in the morning?
17
             Approximately 2:30 Sunday morning.
       Α.
18
             And your shift is from 7:00 to 11:00?
       Q.
19
             No, sir.
       Α.
20
       Q.
             7:00 p.m. to 11:00 a.m.?
21
             No, sir.
       Α.
22
             Tell me your shift.
       Q.
23
             I'm sorry. It's from 11:00 p.m. to 7:00 a.m.
       Α.
24
             I'm sorry. I got that wrong.
       Q.
25
             Yes, sir.
       Α.
```

```
1
       Q.
             7:00 p.m. --
2
       Α.
            That's my permanent assigned shift, yes, sir.
3
            Okay. To 11:00 a.m.?
       Q.
4
            No. I think you've still -- it's from 11:00
       Α.
5
   o'clock at night to 7:00 in the morning.
6
             So you were about in the middle of your shift,
7
   correct?
8
       Α.
            That's correct, yes, sir.
9
            Now, you were called out to the scene of a
       Q.
10
   major accident, correct?
11
            Yes, sir.
       Α.
12
       Q.
            It was nonfatal, correct?
13
       Α.
            That's how it was reported, yes, sir.
14
            But indeed a major accident?
       Ο.
15
            Yes, sir.
       Α.
16
       Q.
            Do you recall if the airbags were deployed in
17 l
   that vehicle?
18
       Α.
            I do. They were.
19
            Do you recall whether or not the vehicle --
20
   that vehicle was not drivable after the accident,
   correct?
21
22
       A. No, sir, I don't believe so.
                                            I'm not a
23
   mechanic, but I wouldn't believe so.
24
       Q. Well, was it -- did a tow truck -- a tow truck
25
   came and took the car away, correct?
```

1 Yes, sir, that's correct. Α. 2 Q. Now, in your report, you indicate what the 3 license plate is, correct? 4 Yes, sir. Α. 5 Of the vehicle that was in an accident? Q. 6 Α. The Jetta? 7 Ο. Yes. 8 Α. Yes, sir. 9 And you also indicate the VIN number, correct? Q. 10 Α. That VIN number, yes, sir. 11 That's documented in your report? Q. 12 Α. Yes, sir. 13 Q. Okay. Now, were you the first -- you weren't 14 the first officer to get there on the scene? 15 Α. No, sir. 16 You were the second officer? 17 I can't remember if we were -- we had multiple Α. 18 officers that came by that scene. We were not first, 19 but we were there shortly thereafter. 20 Q. And you were not the first one -- you didn't 21 make contact with Mr. Garcia initially, correct? 22 Α. No, sir. Officer Carroll did. 23 Right. You transported Mr. Garcia from Officer 24 Carroll's car to your car?

25

Α.

That's correct.

```
And at this time, that's when you observed the
1
       Q.
2
   odor of urine?
3
       Α.
             Yes, sir.
4
             His eyes?
       Q.
5
             Yes, sir.
       Α.
6
        O.
             His unbalance?
7
             Well, the unbalance we wait till -- I would say
       Α.
8
   I waited until obviously he was unhandcuffed.
9
             Okay. So at the police department?
       Q.
10
        Α.
             At Central Intox, yes, sir.
11
             So the observations that you made transporting
12
   Mr. Garcia were his eyes?
13
             Yes, sir.
       Α.
14
            -- the odor of urine?
        O.
             Yes, sir.
15
       Α.
16
        Q.
             -- and the odor of alcohol?
17
             And alcoholic beverage and his slurred speech
       Α.
18
   as well.
19
             Okay. Now, before this night, you never met
20
   Mr. Garcia?
21
       Α.
            No, sir.
22
             You never talked to Mr. Garcia?
        Q.
23
             No, sir.
       Α.
24
            You don't know his speech is slurred naturally
        Q.
25
   like -- you never -- you don't know whether or not his
```

```
1
   speech is slurred naturally?
2
             Well, like I said earlier, yeah, obviously that
3
   he could have a speech impediment which is something I
   consider, like I said earlier, yes, sir.
5
            Now, as far as his eyes, we saw a picture of
       Ο.
6
   them up on the screen. Do you remember that?
7
            Yes, sir.
       Α.
8
       O.
            Was he wearing glasses there?
9
            At that time, no, sir.
       Α.
10
       O.
             Is he wearing glasses here today?
11
            Yes, sir.
       Α.
12
       Ο.
            Did you ask him where his glasses were on the
13
   scene?
14
       Α.
             On scene, once we -- well, on the freeway, we
15
   just wanted to get it off the freeway.
16
       Q.
             I understand that.
17
            Uh-huh.
       Α.
18
       Q.
            Did you ask him about his glasses?
19
            We asked him if he wore glasses or contacts,
       Α.
20
   yes, sir.
21
       Ο.
            When did you ask him that?
22
       Α.
            When we were off the freeway in the Greenspoint
23
   Mall parking lot, sir.
24
            Okay. But you didn't give him his glasses,
25
   correct?
```

- A. We couldn't find them.
- Q. Okay.
- A. I mean, I don't know if he had the glasses with him or not is what I'm saying.
- Q. You couldn't find them because of the airbags that were deployed, correct?
 - A. No, not necessarily.

MR. GUERRA: May I approach the witness,

9 | Your Honor?

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

121

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

THE COURT: Yes, you may.

- Q. (BY MR. GUERRA) I'm showing you what's marked Defendant's Exhibits 18 through 22.
 - A. Uh-huh.
- Q. I'm going to draw your attention to obviously the pictures. There is a VIN number there. There is a year, and there is a model there. If you can check that with your offense report and make sure we are talking about the same vehicle.
- A. Well, the -- we don't actually get the VIN from the car. Usually -- especially when it's damaged like that, usually we will run the license plate; and there is a VIN registered within our computer system and we will use that VIN.
 - Q. Is it in your report?
- 25 A. There is a VIN in my report, yes, sir.

```
1
            Do you want to check it?
       Q.
2
            Yes, sir. Just give me one second to find it.
3
   Here it is, yes, sir.
4
            Do you want to check all five of the pictures
       O.
5
   and make sure it's the same Jetta?
6
       Α.
            Okay. Yes, sir. Yes, sir.
7
            Okay. Now, officer, do these pictures truly
       Ο.
8
   and accurately depict this vehicle after the accident?
9
       A. It exhibits the damage that occurred from the
10
   accident.
11
       Q. So, they truly, accurately depict the vehicle
12
   after the accident?
13
            Yes, sir.
       Α.
14
       0.
            Okay.
15
                 MR. GUERRA: Your Honor, I'm going to show
16
   these to the State and ask for them to be published to
17
   the jury.
18
                  THE COURT: You are offering
19
   Defendant's --
20
                 MR. GUERRA: 18 through 22, Your Honor.
21
   Sorry.
22
                 MR. VAZQUEZ: Your Honor, the only thing
23
   we would object to is the part of the beginning, at the
24
   very top of the pictures. Hearsay, not relevant to
25
   the --
```

```
1
                 THE COURT: All right. May I see them,
2
   please.
3
                 (At the Bench)
4
                 MR. GUERRA: Your Honor, they are not
   important to me. If you want me to black them out, I
5
6
   don't have any issues.
7
                 MR. VAZQUEZ: It really didn't -- I guess
8
   just making an objection for the record, Your Honor.
9
                 THE COURT: Your objection is overruled.
10
   They are really of no consequence, the information on
11
   there.
12
                 MR. VAZQUEZ: Yes, Your Honor.
13
                 (Jury present)
14
                 THE COURT: All right. Defendant's
15
   Exhibits 18 through 22 are admitted.
16
                 MR. GUERRA: May I publish, Your Honor?
17
   Do you want me to give it to the bailiff?
18
                 THE COURT: You do it on the overhead.
19
                 MR. GUERRA: Can I just hand it to them,
20
   so they can look at it?
                 THE COURT: Sure, just hand it to them.
21
22
            (BY MR. GUERRA) Okay. Officer Gillham, let me
23
   turn your attention to the accident with Mr. Garcia.
24
   Now you testified that he was in handcuffs, correct?
25
       A. Yes, sir.
```

```
1
            He was detained, correct?
       Q.
2
            He was temporarily detained after the accident,
3
   yes, sir.
4
             He was not free to leave?
       Q.
             No, sir.
5
       Α.
6
       O.
             All right. Officer Gillham, let me talk to you
7
   about these standardized field sobriety tests.
8
       Α.
            Yes, sir.
9
             You testified that you had taken some courses
       Q.
10
   and are trained to administer those tests, correct?
11
             I am.
       Α.
12
       0.
            Now, in your training, you learned that those
13
   tests can be compromised by not giving the exact
14
   instructions, correct?
15
       A. No, sir. Certain -- would you want me to
16
   clarify or --
17
                  THE COURT: I think you answered his
18
   question.
19
                  THE WITNESS:
                                Okay.
20
       Q.
             (BY MR. GUERRA) Are the tests compromised if
21
   you don't -- well, these are standardized field sobriety
22
   tests?
23
             The ones I administered?
       Α.
24
            Yes.
       Q.
25
             Yes, sir.
       Α.
```

Which means the directions have to be given the Q. same way, correct?

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

20

21

22

- They have to be given in a certain order, yes, Α. sir.
- The demonstration aspect of it has to be given the same way, correct?
- I believe the NHTSA manual says you have to Α. demonstrate it and then you ask if the subject understands.
- Q. Okay. So that's part of giving the instructions the same way; the demonstration has to be given the same way, correct?
- Α. Well, there's the instruction phase and the demonstration phase, yes, sir.
- And they have to be given in the same manner as 0. 16 NHTSA provides, correct?
- 17 MR. VAZQUEZ: Object, asked and answered, Your Honor. 18
- 19 THE COURT: Overruled. You may answer.
 - Α. I'm sorry. Will you repeat the question?
 - (BY MR. GUERRA) The instruction and the demonstration phase has to be done the same way as NHTSA asks you to do it, correct?
- 24 Yes, sir. It has to be done in a certain Α. 25 order, yes, sir.

- All right. Now, you've also learned that these Q. tests can be compromised if there is a recent head injury, correct?
 - Certain tests, yes, sir. Α.
- Okay. If there's certain medications, they can Q. be compromised?
- That's why we asked him if he was taking any Α. medication or not.
- 9 Right. And you testified that you asked him; Q. 10 is that correct?
- 11 Α. Yes, sir.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

15

- 12 O. So, that's on the video, correct?
- 13 Α. Not everything -- not all interaction is on the 14 video, no, sir.
- Okay. So where did you ask him -- you had --Ο. 16 the field sobriety tests are on this video, right?
 - The field sobriety tests, yes, sir. Α.
- 18 Q. NHTSA asks you to determine medical conditions 19 or medications before you administer these tests, 20 correct?
- 21 A. Yes, sir. It doesn't say you have to do it 22 directly before, though. It just says you have to ask 23 them.
- 24 So, if so -- you asking Mr. Garcia about his 25 medical conditions is on this video?

1 No, sir. Α. 2 Okay. It's not on the video? 3 No, not -- like I said, not -- our entire interaction is not on the video. We are not issued 4 5 cameras. 6 Q. All right. Let me go back to recent head 7 injuries, okay? 8 Α. Yes, sir. 9 That includes concussions, correct? Q. 10 Α. Yes, sir, head injuries is a concussion or 11 would be classified --12 THE COURT: Hold on. Hold on. What was 13 your answer? 14 I would say that a concussion is classified under a head injury, yes, sir. 15 16 (BY MR. GUERRA) And a concussion would 17 compromise these tests, right? 18 Α. They could compromise some tests, I would 19 assume. 20 Q. Okay. All right. Are you aware that a symptom 21 of a concussion is someone not thinking clearly? 22 Α. I am aware that there are numerous symptoms to 23 concussions. All of them I am not aware of. Q. Okay. Well, let me ask you each one. Are you 24

aware that specifically someone that's suffered a

```
1
   concussion does not think clearly?
2
                 MR. VAZQUEZ: Objection, Your Honor.
3
   is not a medical expert, and he's not here to testify on
4
   a medical capacity.
5
                 THE COURT: Sustained.
6
                 MR. GUERRA: May I approach, Your Honor?
7
                 THE COURT: Sure.
8
                 (At the Bench)
9
                 MR. GUERRA: This is the whole point.
                                                         Our
10
   defense is that -- my defense is that he suffered a
11
   concussion.
12
                 MR. VAZQUEZ: He's not trained.
13
                 MR. GUERRA: Do you want me to lay a
14
   better foundation?
15
                 THE COURT: Hold on. Then ask him that
16
   question, okay? He's not a medical expert. He knows
17
   there are numerous symptoms of concussion, of which he
18
   doesn't know what they are. He's already told you that.
19
   I don't think you should -- he's aware of them. He's
20
   not qualified as an expert. So, don't ask scaled
21
   questions that require that he be qualified as an
22
   expert. You have already established that he doesn't
23
   know or that's beyond --
24
                 MR. GUERRA: Okay. I will.
25
                 THE COURT: Just --
```

```
1
                  MR. GUERRA: That makes sense, but I --
2
   okay. I got it.
3
                  THE COURT: Okay.
4
                  (Jury present)
5
            (BY MR. GUERRA) All right. Officer Gillham,
6
   you are not an E.M.S. expert, correct?
7
            By no means, sir. Just a police officer.
       Α.
8
       Ο.
            You are aware, however, that concussions could
9
   affect or compromise standardized field sobriety tests,
10
   correct?
11
            Yes, sir. That has been established through
       Α.
12
   NHTSA.
13
       Q.
            Okay. Now you were at a scene of a major
14
   accident, correct?
            Yes, sir.
15
       Α.
16
       Q.
            Okay. The vehicle is in very bad condition,
17
   correct?
18
       Α.
            It's severely damaged, yes, sir.
19
            The airbags are deployed, correct?
       O.
20
       Α.
            That is correct.
21
            They are deployed specifically on the driver's
       Ο.
22
   side, correct?
23
            Yes, sir. I believe they are deployed all over
       Α.
24
   in the vehicle but, yes, sir.
25
       Q.
            To the point where Mr. Garcia no longer has his
```

```
1
   glasses, correct?
2
            No, sir. There is no way I would know if he
3
   would have had glasses in the first place.
4
            Did Mr. Garcia have glasses when you initially
5
   made contact with him?
6
       Α.
            No, sir.
7
            Does he have glasses here today?
       0.
8
       Α.
            That doesn't mean that he had glasses.
9
                  MR. GUERRA: Objection, nonresponsive.
10
                  THE COURT: That is sustained.
11
   question was: Does he have glasses here today?
12
                  THE WITNESS: Yes, Your Honor.
13
       Α.
            Yes, yes, he does.
14
            (BY MR. GUERRA) I'm asking you what happened.
15
   That's it. Okay?
16
       Α.
            Yes, sir.
17
            So, if you are aware that a concussion could
18
   affect the outcome or compromise standardized field
19
   sobriety tests, should you -- do you not know any of
20
   those symptoms of a concussion?
21
            No, sir. There's several steps that we take
       Α.
22
   when administering the field sobriety tests to ensure
23
   that. Secondly, he stated he had no injuries; and he
24
   told that to the H.F. -- excuse me -- Houston Fire
```

Department. They are medical professionals. So, we had

```
1
   no reason to believe that he suffered from a concussion
2
   at that time.
3
       Ο.
           Okay. That's it. Let me ask you: You
4
   testified that there was E.M.S. there, correct?
5
            That's the Houston Fire Department, yes, sir.
       Α.
6
       O.
            That's an important detail to put in your
7
   report, correct?
8
       Α.
            No, sir.
9
            It's not an important detail to document in
       Q.
10
   your report?
11
            No, sir, because you could subpoena the call
       Α.
12
   slip and it would show that there is a fire slip drop.
13
   So, there would be no confusion as to whether they were
14
   there or not.
15
            Do you have those call slips with you?
       Ο.
16
       Α.
             I was not asked to bring them. No, sir.
17
            Okay. So, the other officers that were there
18
   on the scene can testify that there was E.M.S. out
19
   there, correct?
20
       Α.
            That there was H.F.D. -- Houston -- is it okay
21
   that I refer to them as H.F.D.?
22
                  THE COURT: Yes. You've established that
23
   it was Houston Fire Department.
24
                  THE WITNESS: Okay.
25
            Yes, sir.
       Α.
```

- Q. (BY MR. GUERRA) So, when you get to the accident, Mr. Garcia is in Officer Carroll's car, correct?
 - A. The back seat, yes, sir.
 - Q. And he's transported to your car, correct?
- A. We switched handcuffs, and he's placed in our back seat.
 - Q. And he's taken off the freeway, correct?
- 9 A. Yes, sir.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

14

15

16

17

18

19

- Q. And then he's taken to Central Intox, correct?
- 11 A. Yes, sir.
- Q. Okay. And just to be clear here, you have no idea what the symptoms of a concussion are?
 - A. No, I never said that.
 - Q. Okay. Do you know that -- are you aware, sir, that a symptom of a concussion could be poor balance?
 - A. I said that there's NHTSA standards that we go through to establish that.
 - Q. My question is: Are you aware that a symptom of a concussion could be poor balance?
- A. I am aware there are numerous symptoms of a concussion, yes, sir.
- Q. My question is very specific: Are you aware that a symptom of a concussion could be poor balance?

 Yes or no?

1 Yes, sir. Α. 2 Okay. Are you aware that a symptom of a 3 concussion could be dizziness? Yes or no? 4 No, sir. I'm not a trained medical 5 professional; and I cannot go through and list every 6 symptom of a concussion, if that's what you are asking 7 for me to do. 8 Q. Are you aware that a symptom of a concussion is 9 that somebody doesn't think clearly? Yes or no? 10 I have no formal training. I mean, I've heard Α. that, but I'm -- I've never had a trained medical 11 12 professional list to me the symptoms of a concussion, so 13 I wouldn't feel comfortable testifying to what they 14 might be. 15 Q. Officer Gillham, yes or no, are you aware that 16 a symptom of a concussion causes somebody not to think 17 clearly? 18 MR. VAZQUEZ: Asked and answered, Your 19 Honor. THE COURT: Sustained. 20 21 Q. (BY MR. GUERRA) Are you aware, sir, a symptom 22 of concussion is that someone can't remember 23 information? 24 MR. VAZQUEZ: May we approach, Your Honor?

THE COURT: Do you have an objection?

```
1
                 MR. VAZQUEZ: I have an objection. Are we
2
   to keep going down this line of questions?
3
                 THE COURT: What is your legal objection?
4
                 MR. VAZQUEZ: My legal objection is
5
   Officer Gillham has already testified that he is not a
6
   medical expert, and this is irrelevant to his testimony
7
   today.
8
                 THE COURT: Sustained.
9
            (BY MR. GUERRA) So, in your observations of
       Q.
10
   Mr. Garcia, you were not looking for any symptoms of
11
   concussions, correct?
12
       Α.
            No, sir, we did --
13
            Because you don't know what they are, correct?
14
            No, sir. Like I said, there's NHTSA
       Α.
15
   standards --
16
                 MR. GUERRA: Objection, nonresponsive.
17
                 THE COURT: Overruled. Go ahead.
            There are NHTSA standards that we look for to
18
       Α.
19
   establish whether they've had recent head injuries or
20
   had head injuries in the past two years. Would you like
   me to list those?
21
22
       Q. (BY MR. GUERRA) No. Let me ask you: Was
23
   E.M.S. called out to the scene?
24
            H.F.D. was present on scene. They were called
       Α.
25
   out and they did arrive.
```

```
1
            E.M.S., were they called?
       Q.
2
            Yes, they were E.M.S. Or, actually, I think
3
   the correct term is E.M.T. They were E.M.T. trained,
4
   yes, sir.
5
       Q. So, your testimony is that there was an
6
   ambulance out there?
7
            There was a pumper truck. Whether they send an
       Α.
8
   ambulance or not -- usually from my experience -- and I
9
   don't know their general protocols -- they will send a
10
   fire --
11
                 MR. GUERRA: Objection, nonresponsive,
121
   Your Honor.
13
                  THE COURT: Sustained.
14
       Ο.
            (BY MR. GUERRA) Okay. E.M.S., an ambulance,
15
   were they out there?
16
       Α.
            No, sir.
17
       Q.
            Okay.
18
       Α.
            I can respond --
19
                 MR. GUERRA: Objection, nonresponsive.
20
                  THE COURT: That's two questions. Was
21
   E.M.S. out there?
22
       Α.
            There were trained E.M.S. professionals on
23
   scene, yes, sir.
24
                  THE COURT: Was there an ambulance out
25
   there?
```

1 There was not an ambulance. Α. 2 Ο. (BY MR. GUERRA) Okay. All right. Let's move 3 to the police station. 4 Central Intox? Α. 5 Q. Yes. Yes, sir. 6 Α. 7 Central Intox. And we saw that portion here on Ο. 8 the video, correct? 9 That is correct, yes, sir. Α. 10 All right. Can you -- how many people were in 11 that Central Intox, in this video? 12 Α. That -- there was my permanent partner who I believe testified earlier, Officer Parker; and there was 13 14 Officer Morales who was part of the D.W.I. Task Force at that time. 15 16 Q. So, we had three officers? 17 Total, yes, sir. Α. 18 A room with four walls? Q. 19 Yes, sir. Α. 20 Q. One door in and out? 21 Yes, sir. Α. 22 We see on the video that yourself and Officer Q. 23 Morales are talking to Mr. Garcia? 24 Α. Uh-huh.

Both are giving Mr. Garcia instructions?

25

Q.

1 Yes, sir. Α. 2 Ο. Tell me how big that room is. 3 Like in feet or --Α. 4 Yeah, feet, inches, whatever you --Q. 5 You know, I'm not too good at estimating in 6 measurements. I mean, it's enough to walk the nine 7 heel-to-toe steps back and forth, you know, so --8 Q. 10 by 10? 9 Maybe 15 by 15, approximately. Α. 10 Ο. Okay. 11 Like I said, I have no clue exactly. Α. 12 THE COURT: Let me pause you for just a 13 moment. Ladies and gentlemen, we need to take a break 14 so I can handle some court matters because I indicated to the lawyers that I would take a break at 11:55. So I 15 16 do need to handle those matters. It will take about 15 17 minutes; and then when you come back in, we will work 18 until 12:45, 12:50, which is when your lunch will be 19 delivered. So if you will go with Deputy Kiminski right 20 now, please. THE BAILIFF: All rise. 21 22 (Jury leaves courtroom) 23 THE COURT: All right, sir. You can step 24 down for 15 minutes. 15-minute trial break, and every

25

one can be seated.

```
1
                  (Recess taken)
2
                  THE COURT: All right. Bernie, I think we
3
   are ready.
4
                  THE BAILIFF: All rise.
5
                  (Jury enters courtroom)
6
                  THE COURT: All right. Be seated, please.
7
                  All right. Mr. Guerra, you may resume,
8
   sir.
9
                  MR. GUERRA: Thank you, Your Honor.
10
       Ο.
             (BY MR. GUERRA) Officer, we were in the police
11
   station, specifically the Intox room, correct?
12
       Α.
            Yes, sir.
13
       Q.
            Okay. Three people, three officers including
14
   yourself, in the room?
            Yes, sir.
15
       Α.
16
       Q.
            Fairly small room?
17
            Like I said, it's tough for me to --
       Α.
18
            Very small room?
       Q.
19
            No, I wouldn't say it's really small. I mean,
       Α.
20
   it has plenty of space to do the field sobriety tests.
21
   There were never any issues with that.
22
       Q.
             15 by 15?
23
            Like I said, that's very approximate.
24
            And yourself and Officer Morales are giving
       Q.
25
   Mr. Garcia instructions, correct?
```

1 Yes, sir. Α. 2 All right. Now, we've already -- you've 3 already testified about a recent head injury and a 4 concussion could affect the results, correct? 5 Yes, sir. Α. 6 O. Now, let's talk about other things that may 7 affect results, also. 8 Α. Yes, sir. 9 Someone's weight, correct? Q. 10 Α. I believe the NHTSA manual states that people 11 that are severely overweight, it could affect it, yes, 12 sir. 13 In other words, weight would affect the Q. 14 results? If they are severely overweight, yes, sir. 15 Α. 16 Q. About 50 pounds? 17 Okay. Yes, sir. Α. 18 Q. Is that correct? 19 I don't recall the exact pound or the exact Α. 20 amount over. I know it is --21 Ο. 50 pounds sounds about right, correct? 22 If it -- well, you are saying that, yes, sir. Α. 23 Now, the shoes that somebody wears could affect 24 the results, right? 25 Yes, sir. The manual states that if they are Α.

```
1
   wearing high heels, they should be given the opportunity
2
   to take those off. But it never says that, you know, if
3
   they are -- if they do perform the test in high heels,
   it makes it invalid.
5
            So, my question is: Shoes may affect the
       Ο.
6
   result?
            Yes or no?
7
            It could, yes, sir.
       Α.
8
       O.
            Now, we see Mr. Garcia in the video, correct?
9
            Yes, sir.
       Α.
10
            He's wearing some kind of boots with a heel,
11
   correct? Yes or no, officer?
12
       Α.
            Whether -- I don't believe it was a severely
13
   elevated heel like it says in the NHTSA manual, if
14
   that's what you are trying to say.
15
       Ο.
            My question is: Was he wearing boots with a
16
   heel? Yes or no?
17
            There was a heel to the boots, yes, sir.
       Α.
            All right. Now, in the video you don't ask
18
19
   Mr. Garcia if he wants to do it without shoes or with
20
   his shoes, correct?
21
       Α.
            Well, sir --
22
            That's a yes or no, officer.
       Q.
23
                  THE WITNESS: I don't feel like I can
241
   answer that question yes or no accurately, Judge.
25
                  THE COURT: Okay.
```

```
1
             (BY MR. GUERRA) Yes or no, did you ask
        Q.
2
   Mr. Garcia if he wanted to take off his shoes?
3
             Well, sir, like I said, the NHTSA --
       Α.
4
                  MR. GUERRA: Objection, nonresponsive.
5
                  THE COURT: Bottom line, did you ask him
6
   whether he wanted to take his shoes off?
7
             No, sir. Actually, no, I did not.
       Α.
8
        Ο.
             (BY MR. GUERRA) Bottom line, yes or no?
9
             Yes.
       Α.
10
             Now, you administered two tests, correct?
        O.
11
             Two field sobriety tests, yes, sir.
       Α.
             You administered the walk and turn?
12
       Ο.
13
       Α.
             Yes, sir.
14
       Ο.
             And the one-leg stand?
15
       Α.
             That's correct, yes, sir.
16
        Q.
             Now, you testified that at that point you had
17
   about a year and half experience, correct?
18
       Α.
             Approximately, yes, sir.
19
             10 to 15 D.W.I. investigations?
        Ο.
20
       Α.
             Conservatively, yes, sir.
21
             Now, in the Intox room, we had Officer Morales,
       Ο.
22
   correct?
23
             Yes, sir, that is correct.
       Α.
24
             He at that pint was with D.W.I. Task Force,
25
   correct?
```

1 Yes, sir. Α. 2 However, you are the one who administered these 3 two tests, right? 4 That's correct, yes, sir. Α. 5 All right. So, you testified about certain Q. 6 clues that you saw on specifically the one-leg stand? 7 Yes, sir. Α. 8 O. You testified about three clues, correct? 9 There were three clues that I observed. Α. First one, sways, right? 10 O. 11 Yes, sir. Α. 12 Q. All right. Tell me what the NHTSA manual says 13 about swaying as to the amount or the distance that 14 somebody must sway before you document that clue? 15 Sir, I notice you -- I just have a question. 16 notice you are referencing the manual. Are you using --17 MR. GUERRA: Objection, nonresponsive. 18 THE COURT: Well, do you have a question? 19 THE WITNESS: Yes. 20 THE COURT: What is your question? 21 THE WITNESS: Are you using the 2012 or 22 2006 manual? 23 (BY MR. GUERRA) I'm using anything. 0. 24 Oh, you are referencing --Α. 25 I'm looking at your report. Q. No.

```
1
                  THE COURT: When you reference its manual,
2
   if you could reference which one you are referencing.
3
             (BY MR. GUERRA) The newest and greatest manual,
       Ο.
4
   2012.
5
            Thank you, sir.
       Α.
6
            Yeah. No problem.
7
            Yes, sir. Well, the 2012 one states that the
       Α.
8
   separation -- you observe swaying if they use their arms
9
   more than 6 inches separate from their body.
10
            Okay. Now, uses arms for balance. What does
11
   the 2012 NHTSA manual say about when to document that
12
   clue?
13
       Α.
            That again also is used separating their
14
   body -- separating their arm more than 6 inches.
15
            Both of them are 6 to 8 inches, correct?
       Q.
16
       Α.
            No, sir.
17
             I'm sorry, you said 6 to 8 inches?
       0.
18
            No, I did not.
       Α.
19
            I'm sorry. What did you say?
       0.
20
       Α.
             I said more than 6 inches.
21
            Oh, okay. So, more than 6 inches. And that's
       O.
22
   for both sways and uses arms for balance?
23
            Yes, sir. But there's also more to the
24
   swaying. I don't know if you would like me to add to it
25
   or not.
```

```
1
                  THE COURT: Just answer his questions.
2
                  THE WITNESS: Okay. Yes, sir. Yes,
3
   Judge.
4
             (BY MR. GUERRA) Are you a little nervous?
       Q.
5
            Not at all.
       Α.
6
       Ο.
             Now, hops, you observed that clue.
7
   pretty obvious what that means, correct?
8
       Α.
             Yes. Yes, sir.
9
             Now, on the video that we see of Mr. Garcia,
       Q.
10
   the hopping that you documented, that was at about --
11
   when he reaches about 23 to 25 seconds or so; is that
12
   accurate?
13
       Α.
             Yes, sir. It was at the end.
14
             So it's towards the end, correct?
       O.
15
             Yes, sir.
       Α.
16
       Q.
             So, he performs well up to about 23, 25
17
   seconds, correct?
18
       Α.
            No, sir.
19
             Okay. Let me rephrase the question. So, the
       Ο.
20
   clue of hopping that you observed is at the 23, 25
21
   seconds?
22
       Α.
             That particular clue, yes, sir.
23
             That's exactly what I'm asking.
       0.
24
             Yes, sir.
       Α.
25
             25 to 23 seconds?
       Q.
```

1 23 to 25, yes, sir. Α. 2 Q. That's accurate, right? 3 Approximately, yes, sir. Approximately. Α. 4 And you testified that you wanted him to count Q. 5 to 30 seconds, correct? 6 Α. Yes, sir. 7 All right. Okay. Let's move on to the --0. 8 Α. Oh, wait. I did not. That's incorrect. 9 MR. GUERRA: Objection, nonresponsive. 10 THE COURT: Overruled. Did you want to 11 change your answer? 12 THE WITNESS: Yes. I just realized I told him -- I just told him when to count. I didn't tell him 13 14 when he would stop counting. I just told him to count. I didn't count to 30. 15 16 (BY MR. GUERRA) But here, before this jury, you wanted him to count to 30 seconds. That's what you 17 testified; is that not accurate? 18 19 That's what time we go to. I did not actually Α. 20 tell him -- they are not actually to count to 30 21 seconds. They are told, as you can see in the video, 22 that count until I tell you to stop. 23 Okay. I am aware of that. But your testimony 24 was you wanted him to go to 30 seconds? 25 MR. VAZQUEZ: I believe the officer has

```
1
   already cleared -- objection, Your Honor. I believe the
2
   officer has already clarified that, so that's asked and
3
   answered.
4
                  THE COURT: Sustained.
5
            (BY MR. GUERRA) The testimony will speak for
6
   itself; is that right?
7
            Yes, sir.
       Α.
8
       O.
            Okay. Let's move on to the walk and turn. All
9
           Now you testified about seven clues that you
   right.
10
   observed, correct?
11
            Yes, sir.
       Α.
12
       Q.
            Can't keep balance, correct?
13
       Α.
            Yes, sir.
14
            Steps off line?
       Ο.
15
            Yes, sir.
       Α.
16
       Q.
            Now let's talk about stepping off line.
17
            Uh-huh.
       Α.
            What does the 2012 NHTSA manual require for you
18
       Q.
19
   to mark that clue? How many inches or how far up the
20
   line does he need to step?
            There is no actual -- to my knowledge, there is
21
       Α.
22
   no actual exact measurement if his foot steps off the
23
   line.
24
            Okay. Is there a requirement by NHTSA as to
25
   the line that Mr. Garcia walks, how wide that line has
```

1 to be? 2 The only requirement that I am aware of for Α. 3 that line is that it must be generally flat, dry, and 4 preferably -- I think it states that it needs to be well 5 visible, very visible. 6 O. But no 4-inch requirement, 2-inch requirement, 7 no requirement as to the width of the line? 8 Α. I'm not aware of one. 9 Okay. The third clue is uses arm for balance, Q. 10 correct? 11 That's correct, yes, sir. Α. 12 Ο. And what does the 2012 NHTSA manual say as to when to mark that clue, distance away from the body? 13 14 Α. Again, 6 inches away from the body. 15 O. 6 inches. Stop walking, that's pretty 16 apparent, correct? 17 I believe so, yes, sir. Α. Misses heel to toe? 18 Q. 19 Yes, sir. Α. 20 Q. What does the 2012 NHTSA manual say about that? 21 If they miss more than half an inch apart, 22 meaning if they are walking along the line and their 23 feet separate more than half an inch. 24 Okay. Now, you've testified that these tests, Q.

both of these tests are divided-attention tests,

1 | correct?

2

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

- A. That's correct, yes, sir.
- Q. They talk about mental faculties, following directions?
 - A. That's correct.
 - Q. And the physical faculties which is performance on the test, correct?
 - A. Yes, sir, doing the calisthenics, so to speak.
 - Q. Now, we know that certain things affect, could affect, the results of these tests, correct, like concussions, weight and shoes, correct?
- 12 A. Yes, sir.
 - Q. Okay. Now, what those things could affect is the physical aspect of it, correct?
 - A. I don't believe the manual says exactly what -what specifically it affects. It just states that it
 could be affected, so I can't testify as to what would
 be affected by that.
 - Q. Okay. Well, if somebody is having problems keeping their balance, aside from the introduction of alcohol in their body, that could affect the physical part of these tests, correct?
 - A. Can you rephrase that? I'm sorry.
- Q. Sure. If there is a condition which affects a person from being able to keep their balance, that would

1 affect the physical nature of these tests, correct? 2 Α. I guess it would depend on the condition, yes, 3 sir. 4 Sure. And the condition is unable to keep Ο. 5 balance, unsteady balance, and that obviously would 6 affect the physical aspect of these tests? 7 Yes, sir. Α. 8 Ο. Okay. Now, like you testified before, you gave 9 Mr. Garcia some instructions? 10 I gave him the NHTSA instructions, yes, sir. Α. 11 And you read them from the notes that are there Q. 12 in the room, correct? 13 Α. I didn't have to read them, no, sir. 14 O. But you did? 15 Yes, sir, just to be as standard as possible 16 and follow everything as closely as possible. 17 Sure, sure. And Mr. Garcia listened to your O. 18 instructions? 19 Α. Yes, sir. For the most part, yes, sir. 20 Q. And for the most part, he followed your 21 instructions? 22 Α. For the most part, yes, sir. 23 The same as you observed when Mr. Morales asked

him some questions, asked him -- gave him some

instructions. Mr. Garcia followed those instructions?

24

- 1 A. Yes, sir, I think he stated he had nothing to 2 hide.
 - Q. Right. And you were there. You observed that and saw that take place, correct?
 - A. Along with other comments, yes, sir.
- Q. Sure, sure. Okay. Now, the latter part of that test or that video, you read these rights, correct, the DIC-24?
 - A. Those aren't rights, sir.
- 10 Q. I'm sorry. You read that form?
- 11 A. I read the DIC-24, yes, sir.
- 12 Q. Okay. And in that form, you read it verbatim?
- 13 A. Yes, sir.

3

4

5

- Q. You didn't deviate from that form?
- 15 A. No, sir, not to my knowledge.
- Q. Okay. So, you at no point told Mr. Garcia that he had a right to refuse that breath test, correct?
- A. My exact verbiage was, I am now requesting a specimen of your breath and/or blood.
- Q. Okay. Now, once you asked that of
- 21 Mr. Garcia --
- 22 A. Yes, sir.
- 23 O. -- without hesitation --
- 24 A. Uh-huh.
- 25 Q. -- he says, "Yes"?

Seth Gillham - July 15, 2015 Redirect Examination by Mr. Vazquez

```
1
            Yes, sir.
       Α.
2
            Okay. He says, I have nothing to hide?
       Ο.
3
            Yes, sir.
       Α.
4
                  MR. GUERRA: I will pass the witness, Your
5
   Honor.
6
                  THE COURT: Mr. Vazquez.
7
                  THE WITNESS:
                                Thank you, sir.
8
                  MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you, Your Honor.
9
                  THE COURT: He has some more questions for
10
   you.
11
                  THE WITNESS: Oh, yes, Judge.
12
                      REDIRECT EXAMINATION
13
   BY MR. VAZQUEZ:
14
            Officer Gillham, why was the vehicle towed
15
   aside from the damage on it?
16
       Α.
             It's the Houston Police Department policy, any
17 l
   vehicle involved in a D.W.I. arrest, that we tow that
18
   vehicle, is the reason why that I couldn't -- somebody
19
   way higher up than me made that decision.
20
       Q.
            Officer Gillham, did you go over your report in
21
   preparation for your testimony today?
22
       Α.
            Yes, sir, I did.
23
             Is there a spot on the form on your offense
24
   report that asks about the attitude of the defendant?
25
       Α.
            Yes, sir.
```

Seth Gillham - July 15, 2015 Redirect Examination by Mr. Vazquez

- 1 And in that report that you wrote, what does it Q. 2 say that the defendant was? 3 Α. It says talkative, sir. 4 And in the video, indeed, we see him talking a Ο. 5 bit, correct? 6 Α. That is correct, yes, sir. 7 At any point did he ask you where his glasses 8 were? 9 None, not at all. Α. 10 At any point did he tell you he was on 11 medication? 12 Α. No, sir. He stated he wasn't. 13 At any point did he tell you he was injured? Q. 14 No, sir. He stated he wasn't. Α. 15 At any point did he tell you he had a headache? Q. 16 Α. No, sir. 17 At any point did he tell you he was dizzy? O. 18 Α. No, sir. 19 At any point did he tell you he couldn't Ο. 20 perform any tests because of his shoes? 21 Α. No, sir. 22 At any point did he tell you he couldn't
 - Q. If he had told you any of those things, would

perform any tests because of a physical disability?

23

24

25

Α.

No, sir.

you have conducted the tests?

- A. Well, it just depends on which one; but, yes, sir. No matter what, it would have been noted in my report multiple times, in multiple places.
- Q. He did tell you that he had blood pressure, high blood pressure, correct?
 - A. Yes, sir.
- Q. And what -- in your experience, does high blood pressure medication affect the ability to perform these tests?
- A. Well, he told me that he wasn't taking any medication. He just suffered from hypertension. But in experience, no, sir, it wouldn't.
- Q. Officer Gillham, we heard a lot about the room that this was done in. Have you ever -- prior to this incident, have you ever done D.W.I. investigations in the field?
 - A. Prior to that incident?
- 19 O. Yes.
 - A. Well, we've done the preliminary tests; but we don't have a dash camera. So anything that we do, we like to have it first -- as far as the standardized field sobriety tests, we like to do it in there. So I have done them in the field, just not recorded on video.
 - Q. So, you have done them in the field?

1 Yes, sir. Α. 2 And when you do a D.W.I. investigation in the 3 field, is that ideal conditions? 4 They can be. I mean, they may and they may Α. 5 not. We try to make it as ideal as possible. 6 Ο. Is a controlled environment when you are out in 7 the field? 8 Α. No, sir. 9 Do you have a nice, big, black line that the Q. 10 defendant can walk across? 11 No, sir. Α. 12 0. Do you have a nice, little, yellow square where 13 the defendant can stand in? 14 No, sir. Α. 15 So, in your experience and training, what would Ο. 16 be more ideal? Out in the field or in the Intox room? 17 Definitely in the Intox room since everything Α. is well lit. Like I say, they have the clear, black 18 19 line that contrasts with the white floor; and they have 20 plenty of space to move around to perform the tests. 21 MR. VAZQUEZ: Nothing further, Your Honor. 22 THE COURT: All right. Mr. Guerra, 23 anything else? 24 MR. GUERRA: Yes, Your Honor. 25

1 **RECROSS-EXAMINATION** 2 BY MR. GUERRA: 3 So, you just testified about what Mr. Garcia Ο. 4 did not say to you. 5 Let me ask you: Did you ask Mr. Garcia if 6 he was thinking clearly? 7 I asked him if he had any head injuries. 8 Did you ask him if he was thinking clearly? 9 Yes or no? 10 Α. Specifically? 11 Yes, sir, specifically. Q. 12 Α. No. No, sir, I did not. 13 Did you ask him if he felt a little slow? Yes Q. 14 or no? 15 Α. That's not standard questions to ask. So, no, I did not. 16 17 Did you ask him? Yes or no? Ο. 18 Α. No, sir. 19 Did you ask him if he was able to remember new 20 information? Yes or no? 21 We've never been trained to ask that question. Α. 22 No. 23 Did you ask him if he was able to concentrate? 24 Yes or no? 25 Once again, we had never been trained to ask Α.

```
1
   that question. It's not in the NHTSA manual. So, no, I
2
   did not.
3
            Did you ask him if he had a headache?
       Ο.
4
            Once again, not in the NHTSA manual. So, no, I
5
   did not ask him.
6
       Ο.
            Did you ask him whether he had fuzzy or blurry
7
   vision? Yes or no?
8
       Α.
            Once again, sir, I've never been trained to do
9
   that. It's not in the NHTSA manual. I would not
10
   deviate from that manual. So, no, I did not.
11
            Did you ask him if he was dizzy? Yes or no?
       Q.
12
       Α.
            Once --
13
                  THE COURT: Just answer.
14
                  THE WITNESS: Yes, Judge.
15
            No, sir, I did not.
       Α.
16
       Q.
             (BY MR. GUERRA) Did you ask him if he was
17 l
   having trouble keeping his balance? Yes or no?
18
       Α.
            Well, that would be evident -- no, no, I did
19
   not.
20
       Q.
            Did you ask him if he was feeling sensitive to
21
   light or noise? Yes or no?
22
       Α.
            No, sir, I did not.
23
            Did you ask him if he was feeling tired or no
       Ο.
24
   energy?
            Yes or no?
```

Well, that would be a symptom of intoxication.

25

Α.

```
1
   But, no, I did not.
2
       Q. Did you ask him if he was nervous or anxious?
3
   Yes or no?
4
            I could tell by his demeanor he wasn't nervous
       Α.
5
   or anxious. But, no, sir.
6
             So, you didn't ask any of these things?
7
            None of those are in the NHTSA manual. And,
   no, sir, I did not.
8
9
       Q. You weren't looking for any of these things,
10
   correct?
11
       Α.
            We haven't been trained to do that so I
12
   wouldn't deviate from my training.
13
       Q.
            Yes. We know you are not a trained E.M.S.,
14
   correct?
15
       Α.
            I am not.
16
            Neither is Officer Parker?
       Q.
17
            No, sir, he is not.
       Α.
18
            Neither is Officer Carroll?
       Q.
19
            No, sir.
       Α.
20
       Q.
            Okay. Now, one final point here. You
21
   testified on redirect that it is standard operating
22
   procedure for a vehicle to be towed from a D.W.I.
   arrest, correct?
23
24
       A. Yes, sir.
25
            Yes or no?
       Q.
```

```
He was not under arrest. But, yes, it is.
1
       Α.
2
            Well, then why was his car towed? You just
3
   testified that that's standard procedure --
4
                  THE COURT: Okay. Just ask the question.
5
   No arguments.
6
                  MR. GUERRA: I'm sorry, Your Honor.
7
            (BY MR. GUERRA) Okay. Your testimony was
       0.
8
   D.W.I. arrest; the car is towed?
9
            He was detained but, yes, sir.
       Α.
10
       Ο.
            D.W.I. arrest; car is towed?
11
            What's the question?
       Α.
12
       Q.
            Policy, D.W.I. arrest, tow the vehicle?
13
       Α.
            Even though they are detained on scene, yes,
14
   sir. They are not arrested until the DIC-24 is read.
15
   The reason it -- I can elaborate or no?
16
       Q.
            That's okay.
17
            Okay. Yes, sir.
       Α.
18
            Your testimony, he wasn't under arrest,
19
   correct?
20
       Α.
            He was temporarily detained until I read him
21
   the DIC-24.
22
       Q.
           He was in handcuffs?
23
            Yes, sir. But he was in handcuffs.
       Α.
            Back of the different patrol cars?
24
       Q.
25
            He was moved from Officer Carroll's to mine,
       Α.
```

```
yes, sir.
1
2
            Transported to Central Intox?
       Q.
3
            That's correct.
       Α.
4
            What time did you get to Central Intox?
       Q.
5
            Once again, that would be on my call slip that
6
   you could subpoena --
7
             Is it in your report?
       Q.
8
       Α.
            In the call slip. That's different from my
9
   report, sir.
10
            Do you have something different than your
11
   report here?
12
       Α.
            No, sir.
13
       Q. Can I see your report?
14
       Α.
            Are you going to give it back?
15
            Yes.
       Q.
16
       Α.
            Okay.
17
                  MR. GUERRA: May I have a moment, Your
18
   Honor?
19
                  THE COURT: You may.
20
       Α.
            Here you go. It's a little crumpled. I
21
   apologize.
22
                  MR. GUERRA: May I have a moment, Your
23
   Honor?
           I haven't seen these.
24
                  THE COURT: You haven't seen his, right?
25
                  MR. GUERRA: Correct.
```

Seth Gillham - July 15, 2015 Further Redirect Examination by Mr. Vazquez

```
1
                 THE COURT: Yes, you may have a moment.
2
                 MR. GUERRA: May I have a seat while I do
3
   this, Your Honor?
4
                 THE COURT: Yes.
5
                 MR. GUERRA: And I will give it back to
6
   you.
7
                 THE WITNESS: I appreciate it, sir.
8
                 MR. GUERRA: Just one point. May I
9
   approach, Your Honor?
10
                 THE COURT: Yes.
11
            (BY MR. GUERRA) You testified that Mr. Garcia
12
   told you he was taking some medication for high blood
13
   pressure?
14
            No, I did not. I specifically said he stated
       Α.
15
   that he was not, multiple times, sir.
16
       Q.
           Okay. So, your testimony is that he was not on
17
   any medication?
18
       Α.
            That's not my testimony at all, sir. I'm just
19
   relaying to you what was stated to me which is he told
20
   me he suffered from hypertension but he was not taking
21
   any medication at the time.
22
       Q.
            Okay. Thank you.
23
            Thank you, sir.
       Α.
24
                 MR. GUERRA: Pass the witness.
25
```

1 FURTHER REDIRECT EXAMINATION 2 BY MR. VAZQUEZ: 3 Q. Officer Gillham, why would it be important not 4 to allow somebody that you suspect of D.W.I., driving 5 while intoxicated, to continue driving their vehicle? 6 Α. Well, I mean, I -- you know, it seems like in 7 Houston we see it every week. Harris County leads the nation in D.W.I. related fatalities. 8 9 MR. GUERRA: I will object to relevance, 10 Your Honor. 11 THE COURT: Overruled. 12 Α. You know, we lead -- or this county leads the 13 nation in D.W.I. fatalities; and it's very important to 14 ensure that the person that is intoxicated or suspected to be impaired, to not let them get behind the vehicle 15 16 until they can operate in a safe manner because --17 THE COURT: All right. Next question, 18 please. 19 THE WITNESS: Sorry. 20 Q. (BY MR. VAZQUEZ) So, if you suspect somebody of 21 D.W.I. and you want to get them to Central Intox, are 22 you going to call them a cab? 23 No, sir. Α. 24 Are you going to allow them to drive their own

25

vehicle?

Seth Gillham - July 15, 2015 Further Redirect Examination by Mr. Vazquez

1 No, sir, definitely not. Α. 2 Ο. Are you going to call Uber? 3 No, sir. Α. 4 How are you going to get them to Central Intox? Q. 5 In the back seat of a marked patrol vehicle, Α. 6 seat-belted in. 7 And in order to get them in the back seat of a Ο. 8 marked patrol vehicle, what is your department's policy? 9 We put -- anyone that goes in the back seat of Α. 10 our patrol car are handcuffed because they are behind us 11 and that's just an officer's safety issue. I mean, we 12 are operating the vehicle, so they need to be restrained 13 some way. We don't know, you know, who we are dealing 14 with. 15 O. And are they under arrest at that point? 16 Α. No, sir. 17 When are they under arrest? Q. Once the DIC-24 is read. 18 Α. 19 MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you. No further 20 questions, Your Honor. 21 THE COURT: Mr. Guerra. 22 MR. GUERRA: Just a few more questions, 23 Your Honor. 24 25

1 FURTHER RECROSS-EXAMINATION 2 BY MR. GUERRA: 3 Was Mr. Garcia allowed to take any belongings Ο. 4 from the scene to Central Intox? 5 I don't remember what property -- I mean, he didn't ask -- I can't remember if he asked. If he would 6 7 have -- I'm saying if he would have asked, Can I grab my 8 cell phone? Can I grab my glasses? Can I grab 9 anything, of course, you are more than willing to. 10 This brown bag, have you seen this before with 11 Mr. Garcia? 12 A. I couldn't tell you. No, sir, I don't recall. 13 Q. Okay. 14 MR. GUERRA: No more questions. 15 THE COURT: Mr. Vazquez. 16 MR. VAZQUEZ: Nothing further, Your Honor. 17 THE COURT: May this witness be excused? 18 MR. VAZQUEZ: Yes, Your Honor. 19 MR. GUERRA: Yes, Your Honor. 20 THE COURT: Any objections? 21 MR. GUERRA: No objections. 22 THE COURT: All right, sir. You are 23 excused. 24 THE WITNESS: Thank you. 25 THE COURT: Perfect timing because your

```
1
   lunch has just arrived. Ladies and gentlemen, we are
2
   going to take a lunch break for 45 minutes today instead
3
   of an hour. I think we can all accomplish lunch in 45
4
   minutes. So, if you will go with the deputy. We will
5
   start back in 45 minutes.
6
                 THE BAILIFF: All rise.
7
                  (Jury leaves courtroom)
8
                  THE COURT: Okay. Y'all may be seated.
9
                  (Luncheon recess)
                 MR. GUERRA: Your Honor, at this point
10
11
   Mr. Jose Garcia and defense counsel would urge our
12
   Motion to Suppress the breath test results.
   Specifically for -- at this point, we've heard testimony
13
14
   from three different officers -- four different
15
   officers, three of them which were on the scene. They
16
   all testified that they spent approximately two minutes
17
   observing Mr. Garcia. They testified that they are
18
   not -- E.M.S.s are not trained in E.M.S. issues, if you
19
   will. They testified that they smelled an odor of
   urine, odor of alcohol, bloodshot eyes and unsteady
20
21
   balance. It is our position that the officers did not
22
   inquire as to whether or not Mr. Garcia had sustained a
23
   head injury in the vehicle that he was in. The accident
24
   was a major accident.
25
                 There's pictures in the record which
```

demonstrate that the airbags were deployed. Mr. Garcia was, in fact, unsteady on his feet. However, it is our position that it was due to the injury or concussion that he had suffered. These officers cannot distinguish between what they observed as to his balance being a result of an injury or the accident that took place.

Furthermore, Your Honor, they -- two minutes after observing him, they handcuffed him, put him in a vehicle without any further observations until some time later where two other officers, Gillham and Parker arrived. Again, they observed him for a couple of minutes, put him in a different patrol car and, yes, took him off the freeway but ultimately took him to the police station or Central Intox without any further observations, without any further standardized field sobriety tests.

When they get to the Intox station, they do perform an H.G.N. test. However, Officer Morales testified as to performing the H.G.N. test. However, he has testified that that test can be compromised by a recent head injury which it is our position. He didn't inquire as to -- he may have inquired, but he wasn't diligent in performing the test. If you look at the video, the part where he's checking for a possible injury or head injury, he passes through it fairly --

very quickly, and it is our position that he didn't administer that part of the test correctly and missed a very obvious concussion or head injury based on the accident.

Furthermore, he also testified that he was not aware of the seriousness of that accident. He was told there was an accident but wasn't told that the vehicle was totaled or potentially totaled. Wasn't told that the airbags were deployed. Airbags being deployed, Your Honor, on the passenger -- or the driver's side, obviously, those airbags hit Mr. Garcia. He is not wearing glasses in the picture that the State has put up. Clearly, he is wearing glasses here. And Officer Gillham testified that he never asked for his glasses. Well, in fact, if you look at the video, he does ask for his glasses.

Aside from that, Your Honor, at the time where the breath test is actually administered, it is approximately two hours after the fact. For those reasons, Your Honor, we respectfully ask as stated in our motion that these blood or breath test results be suppressed.

THE COURT: Response.

MR. VAZQUEZ: Your Honor, I hear no legal grounds for his motion. All he has stated is that the

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

officers didn't have reasonable suspicion and that is not legal grounds. They had every reasonable suspicion to detain him. They suspected him of driving while intoxicated and they've all testified that they had experience in detecting intoxicated drivers. It was at the accident scene. It did take some time to clear it. The officers did testify that they tried to clear the accident scene as quickly as possible. As we know, Your Honor, sometimes that takes a little bit longer.

Officer Morales did testify that one of the parts of the H.G.N. is to check for equal size, equal pupil size, and he checked for that and he said that is a sign of a head injury and he noted that his eyes were equal. He did notice smooth pursuit which is also designed to test forehead injuries. Again, Your Honor, the defendant at no point told any of the officers in all of his ranter in the video that he needed medical attention, that he had a headache, that he was dizzy. The only thing he told him was he hadn't had anything to drink. He told them that he wanted their names. He asked them for their names, their badges. He told them he had nothing to hide. He was very talkative the entire time, Your Honor. He never once asked for medical attention. The officers had no reason to suspect that he would be injured. Fire

```
1
   department was on the scene. There were no signs of
2
   injuries. There were no signs of injuries on his face.
3
   There were no signs of injury on his head. Officers
   didn't know that he wore glasses because he didn't have
   them on at the time. I don't see how they could have
5
6
   any indication that he was injured, Your Honor.
7
                 THE COURT: All right. Your motion is
   denied.
8
9
                 MR. GUERRA: Thank you.
10
                 THE COURT: All right. Let's bring in the
11
   jury and your next witness, please.
12
                 MR. VAZQUEZ: Yes, Your Honor. Do you
13
   want me to get him now?
14
                 THE COURT: Go ahead and bring them in.
15
                  (Jury enters courtroom)
16
                 THE COURT: Welcome back.
17
                 THE WITNESS: Thank you. I guess.
18
                 THE COURT: The jury is coming in so just
19
   remain standing, please. We're ready.
                 THE BAILIFF: All rise.
20
21
                  (Jury enters courtroom)
22
                 THE COURT: All right. Call your next
23
   witness.
24
                 MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you, Your Honor.
                                                        The
25
   State recalls Officer Morales.
```

```
1
                 THE COURT: All right. Officer Morales is
2
   still under oath. You may proceed when you are ready.
3
                 MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you, Your Honor.
4
                 FURTHER REDIRECT EXAMINATION
5
   BY MR. VAZQUEZ:
            Officer Morales, we met you yesterday, correct?
6
       O.
7
            Yes, sir.
       Α.
8
            Probably don't need to go through and introduce
9
   yourself, but just remind the jury who you work for.
10
           I'm employed with the Houston Police Department
11
   for 13 years.
12
       0.
            And how were you employed? What division were
13
   you assigned to?
14
            At the time of the incident, I was with the
       Α.
   D.W.I. Task Force.
15
16
       Q. Okay. Are you certified to run the Intoxilyzer
17 l
   machine?
18
       Α.
           Yes, sir, I am.
19
            And so what are your duties as an Intoxilyzer
20
   operator?
21
       A. As the operator, we have some requirements we
22
   have. We are required to observe the subject for 15
23
   minutes prior to administering the breath test. Once
24
   that has expired, we get -- we prepare the instrument
25
   by -- it runs a self-diagnostic test and verifies that
```

1 everything is working well on the instrument itself, and 2 then we also verify that the temperature is at the right 3 setting with the instrument. 4 Okay. So, I'm sorry, I need to do this. 5 obviously misspoke. It is an instrument, correct? 6 Α. Yes, sir. 7 I believe I stated it was a machine, but that's 8 my fault. I'm sorry about that. Thank you for 9 clarifying that. 10 Α. Yes, sir. 11 Okay. So, did you have to take any kind of 12 specialization courses to run the instrument? Yes, sir. The training was with the Texas 13 Α. 14 Department of Public Safety. They put it on. I believe 15 it was a two-day class, if I'm not mistaken. 16 Q. All right. Officer Morales, let me direct your 17 attention. Do you recall the incident that happened on January 18, 2015, correct? 18 19 Yes, sir. Α. 20 Q. And let me direct your attention to 21 approximately 4:30 in the morning of that day. You were 22 still on duty, correct? 23 Α. That's correct.

And did you perform -- did you administer an

24

25

Q.

Intoxilyzer test to the defendant?

A. Yes, sir.

- Q. Now, in the video that we saw yesterday, you had mentioned the H.G.N., correct?
 - A. Yes, sir.
- Q. And then after that, Officer Gillham administered the walk and turn and one-leg stand?
 - A. Yes.
 - Q. And then after that, what did you do?
 - A. After that, we administered the breath test.
- Q. Okay. Did you wait at least 15 minutes prior to administering the test?
- A. Yes, sir. I started my observations upon contact with -- my 15-minute observation period upon contact with the defendant at the time.
- Q. And what's the purpose of observing the defendant?
- A. The observation first is to verify there is nothing in the mouth, that the defendant doesn't throw up or burp or have any residual -- anything residual in his mouth. The 15 minutes allows it to dilute so that it will be a good breath sample.
- Q. And did any of that -- any of those things happen?
 - A. None of those things happened, sir.
- 25 Q. And what Intoxilyzer model did you use to

conduct this test?

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

- A. The Intoxilyzer 5000.
- Q. Do you remember the serial number for that test?
 - A. I would have to look at the -- no, sir.
- Q. Could you please walk us through how the Intoxilyzer test is done.
- Α. Okay. Like I mentioned earlier, there is -- we have -- there is a display on it. There is a green button and red button. The red button is the power The instrument stays on all the time. Once you press the green button, it will do a self-diagnostic test and run a system check and make sure it's working. If it's not, it will give an error, just like any other instrument you deal with. If it's working fine, then you will input the defendant's information, my information, and the arresting officer's information in the instrument. Once that's completed, it will then prompt you -- well, before it will prompt you for that, it will ask you to review, review all of the information you put in. You review that, verify that everything is correct the first time; and then it will prompt you to start the breath test.
- Q. And did you do all of that in the morning in question?

```
1
            Yes, sir.
       Α.
2
            And was that recorded on video?
       O.
3
       Α.
            It was.
4
            Would that be the same video that we saw
       Q.
5
   yesterday?
6
       Α.
            Yes, sir.
7
                  MR. VAZQUEZ: Your Honor, at this time I
8
   would ask to publish the Intoxilyzer instrument of the
9
   video -- portion of the video.
10
                  THE COURT: You may.
11
                  MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you, Your Honor.
12
                  There's some feedback in the image, Your
13
   Honor. We are trying to clear that up.
14
                  (Sotto voce discussion off the record)
15
                  MR. VAZQUEZ: Your Honor, I think there is
16
   something wrong with the system here.
                  THE COURT: All right. Well, work on it.
17
18
   Get it fixed. If you could try removing it and starting
19
   over. Do you want to try that?
20
                  MR. VAZQUEZ: It's showing fine on the
21
   screen, Your Honor. I think it's from the feed here
22
   and, I did try to restart this to see if that is what it
23
   is.
24
                  THE COURT: Okay. Did y'all plug anything
25
   new in over the break?
```

```
1
                  MR. VAZQUEZ: No, Your Honor. While we
2
   are waiting for IT folks, Judge, I will just continue
3
   on.
4
                  THE COURT: Okay. Sounds like a good
5
   plan.
6
                  MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you, Judge.
7
            (BY MR. VAZQUEZ) So, you operated the
       Ο.
8
   machine -- the instrument, correct?
9
       Α.
            Yes, sir.
10
            Okay. I'm now going to show you what's been
11
   previously marked as State's Exhibit No. 4. Do you
12
   recognize that?
13
            Yes, sir. It's a printout of the results of
       Α.
14
   the Intoxilyzer.
15
            Okay. Is this a printout of the results made
       Ο.
16
   at or around the time that you administered the test?
17
            Yes, sir.
       Α.
18
       Q.
            Is that your signature there at the bottom?
19
            It is my signature.
       Α.
20
       Q.
            Is this a true and accurate depiction of
21
   everything that was done that night?
22
       Α.
            Yes, sir.
23
            Has it been altered in any way to your
       O.
24
   knowledge?
25
       Α.
            No, sir.
```

```
1
                 MR. VAZQUEZ: Your Honor, I would like to
2
   admit what's been previously marked as State's Exhibit
3
   No. 4.
4
                 MR. GUERRA: Your Honor, I would object at
5
   this time, Your Honor. I think it's a little premature
6
   to admit it at this time.
7
                 THE COURT: That's sustained.
8
                 MR. VAZQUEZ: It looks like we've gotten a
9
   result, Your Honor. May we publish the video now?
10
                 THE COURT: Yes.
11
                  (State's Exhibit No. 4 published.)
12
       Ο.
            (BY MR. VAZQUEZ) Officer Morales, that's a
   different view than what we saw yesterday. Why is that?
13
14
       Α.
            There are multiple cameras in the Intox room.
15
   It is that way so that you can get -- if you need to see
16
   different angles from the test, you can see it.
17
       0.
            Thank you.
18
                 MR. GUERRA: May I approach briefly, Your
19
   Honor?
20
                 THE COURT: Yes.
21
                 (At the Bench)
22
                 MR. GUERRA: I want to make sure that they
23
   are not going to play the part where Officer Morales
24
   states what the results are on the video.
25
                 THE COURT: Is it on there?
```

```
1
                  MR. GUERRA: It is, Your Honor. It is.
2
                  MR. VAZQUEZ: I think he tells him he has
3
   to wait.
4
                  THE COURT: We need to verify, because it
   is not in response to -- you need to get the technical
5
6
   supervisor to testify.
7
                  MR. VAZQUEZ: Right.
8
                  MR. GUERRA: I just want to make you aware
9
   of that. And he asks --
10
                  MR. VAZQUEZ: I will stop before he asks.
11
                  THE COURT: Make sure that doesn't get
12
   out.
13
                 MR. VAZQUEZ: I will make sure. I'm
14
   pretty confident, I think we can get to the second.
15
                  THE COURT: Get to the second?
16
                  MR. GUERRA: Right, and then stop it right
17
   there.
18
                 MR. VAZQUEZ: That's fine.
19
                  (Jury present)
20
                  MR. VAZQUEZ: May I proceed, Your Honor?
21
                  THE COURT: Yes.
22
                  (State's Exhibit 2 published.)
23
            (BY MR. VAZQUEZ) Officer Morales, after you
24
   conducted the -- after you administered the test, did
25
   you get a test result?
```

1 Yes, sir. Α. 2 And is that the same slip I showed you earlier? Q. 3 Α. Yes. 4 And to your knowledge, was the instrument Q. 5 functioning properly that night? 6 MR. GUERRA: Objection. That calls for 7 speculation on the part of this witness. 8 THE COURT: As long as it's in the context 9 of this witness' exposure to the instrument. Overruled. 10 0. (BY MR. VAZQUEZ) Officer Morales, we heard the 11 defendant talking quite a bit to you during that whole interaction, correct? 12 13 Α. Yes, sir. 14 At any point did he tell you that he had a 15 headache? 16 Α. No, sir. 17 At any point did he tell you he was feeling Ο. 18 dizzy? 19 No, sir. Α. 20 Q. At any point did he tell you he felt he needed 21 medical attention? 22 Α. No, sir. 23 And just to clarify, as far as your knowledge 24 as to the operation of the instrument, it was working 25 properly, correct?

```
1
            Yes, that is correct.
       Α.
2
                  MR. VAZQUEZ: Nothing further, Your Honor.
3
                  THE COURT: Mr. Guerra.
4
                  MR. GUERRA: A couple of questions.
5
                  FURTHER RECROSS-EXAMINATION
6
   BY MR. GUERRA:
7
             Officer Morales, as far as the -- there is a
       Ο.
8
   15-minute observation period, correct?
9
       Α.
            Yes, sir.
10
            And you testified that that 15 minutes began as
11
   soon as you made contact with Mr. Garcia?
12
       Α.
            Yes, sir.
13
           And that's when he came into the Central Intox?
       Q.
14
       Α.
            I made contact just outside the room.
15
            Okay. So, as he was coming in?
       Q.
16
       Α.
            Yes, sir.
17
             So, the 15-minute observation period would be
       Ο.
   on this video?
18
19
            Yes, sir.
       Α.
20
       Q.
            Okay. And according to your training, it has
21
   to be at least 15 minutes, a minimum requirement,
22
   correct?
23
             That's right.
       Α.
24
             If it's not at least 15 minutes, this test
       Q.
25
   would be invalidated, correct?
```

Yes, sir. Α.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

9

10

11

13

14

15

16

18

- So, if we take a look at this video and it began at the time where Mr. Garcia walks in and this test is administered one minute before the 15-minute observation period, that's a disqualification of this result, correct?
 - You are asking if? Α.
- 8 O. Yes, I'm asking if.
 - Oh, yes, sir. That is correct. Α.
- Okay. All right. Now, let me talk to you a little bit about Mr. Garcia and what we saw on video as to the -- him taking the test. There were two tests 12 or -- two tests taken or two samples taken, correct?
 - Yes, sir. Α.
 - And we see Mr. Garcia having trouble taking a Ο. deep breath and blowing into the machine, correct?
- 17 Yes, sir. Α.
 - Q. You had to -- you asked him a couple times to take a deep breath and blow into the machine, correct?
- 20 Α. That's correct.
- 21 And that's on the first test and on the second Ο. 22 test?
- 23 Yes, sir. Α.
- 24 Now -- and this may seem trivial to you; but Q. 25 you hear Mr. Garcia asking for his glasses clearly on

```
this video, correct?
1
2
       Α.
            Yes.
3
            Not once but twice, right?
       Q.
4
            Yes, sir.
       Α.
5
            On the video we don't see any glasses on
       Q.
   Mr. Garcia, correct?
6
7
       Α.
            Correct.
8
            And he clearly is wearing glasses here today;
9
   is that correct?
10
       Α.
            Yes, sir.
11
            All right. Now I want to talk to you a little
12
   bit about what -- a question from the State. They asked
13
   you if Mr. Garcia ever complained of headache, correct?
14
            Yes, sir.
       Α.
15
            Asked you if he ever complained of him being
       Ο.
16
   dizzy?
17
            Right.
       Α.
18
       Q.
            Correct?
19
            Yes, sir.
       Α.
20
       Q.
            Also asked you whether he asked you for medical
21
   attention. Do you recall that?
22
       Α.
            Yes, sir.
23
            Well, let me ask you a couple questions.
24
   you at any time ask Mr. Garcia if he was thinking
   clearly?
25
```

1 I did not. Α. 2 Did you at any time ask Mr. Garcia if he was 3 feeling slowed down? 4 No, sir. Α. 5 Did you at any time ask Mr. Garcia if he was Q. 6 not able to remember any information or knew 7 information? 8 Α. No, sir. 9 Did you at any time ask Mr. Garcia if he was Q. not able to concentrate? 10 11 No, sir. Α. 12 Ο. Did you at any time ever ask Mr. Garcia if he 13 had a headache? 14 No, sir. Α. 15 Did you at any time ever ask Mr. Garcia if he Ο. 16 was fuzzy or had blurred vision? 17 No, sir. Α. 18 Q. Did you at any time ask Mr. Garcia if he felt 19 dizzy? 20 Α. No, sir. 21 Did you at any time ask Mr. Garcia if he had Ο. 22 trouble maintaining his balance? 23 Α. No, sir. Did you at any time ask Mr. Garcia if he had 24 25 any sensitivity to light?

```
1
            No, sir.
       Α.
2
            Did you at any time ask Mr. Garcia if he was
3
   feeling tired or had no energy?
4
            No, sir.
       Α.
5
            Did you at any time ask Mr. Garcia if he was
       Q.
6
   nervous or anxious?
7
       A. No, sir.
8
                 MR. GUERRA: I will pass the witness.
9
                 THE COURT: Mr. Vazquez.
                 MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you, Your Honor.
10
11
                 FURTHER REDIRECT EXAMINATION
12
   BY MR. VAZQUEZ:
13
           Officer Morales, defense counsel just asked you
       Q.
14
   a whole list of questions and I'm not going back through
15
   them. I'm sure you probably remember most of them.
   Would any of those affect the outcome of the results on
16
17
   the Intoxilyzer instrument?
18
            Not at all.
       Α.
19
            Thank you. Nothing further, Your Honor.
       0.
20
                 THE COURT: Mr. Guerra.
21
                 MR. GUERRA: One more question.
22
                 THE COURT: All right. I'm sorry. I
23
   thought you said no more.
24
                 MR. GUERRA: One more. I'm sorry.
25
```

```
1
                  FURTHER RECROSS-EXAMINATION
2
   BY MR. GUERRA:
3
            You testified yesterday about standardized
       Ο.
4
   field sobriety tests, correct?
5
       A. Correct.
6
       0.
            You are D.W.I. Task Force?
7
            Yes, sir.
       Α.
8
            Very well trained and versed in these
9
   standardized field sobriety tests?
10
            Yes, sir.
       Α.
11
            You are very aware that a concussion after a
   recent head injury could affect the results of
12
13
   standardized field sobriety tests?
14
       A. It could.
                  MR. GUERRA: Pass the witness.
15
16
                  THE COURT: Mr. Vazquez.
17
                  MR. VAZQUEZ: Nothing further, Your Honor.
18
                  THE COURT: May he be excused? Any
19
   objections from the State?
20
                  MR. VAZQUEZ: None from the State, Your
21
   Honor.
22
                  MR. GUERRA: None from the defense.
23
                  THE COURT: You are hereby excused.
24
   you for coming down again.
25
                 All right. Next witness, please.
```

Tasha Israel - July 15, 2015 Direct Examination by Mr. Vazquez

```
1
                 MR. VAZQUEZ: Your Honor, the State calls
2
   Tasha Israel.
3
                 THE COURT: Tasha Israel.
4
                 THE BAILIFF: Your Honor, this witness has
5
   not been sworn.
6
                 THE COURT: Come on up, Ms. Israel. Good
7
   afternoon, ma'am. Will you please raise your right
8
   hand.
9
                  (Oath administered)
10
                 THE COURT: Thank you, ma'am. Come on up.
11
   Have a seat. Please keep your voice up so we can all
12
   hear what you have to say here today.
13
                 You may proceed when you are ready.
14
                 MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you, Your Honor.
15
                         TASHA ISRAEL,
16
   having been first duly sworn, testified as follows:
17
                      DIRECT EXAMINATION
   BY MR. VAZQUEZ:
18
19
            Good afternoon, Ms. Israel. Can you please
       Ο.
20
   state your name for the jury, please?
21
            My name is Tasha Israel.
       Α.
22
            And could you please spell that for the record?
       Q.
23
            T-a-s-h-a I-s-r-a-e-l.
       Α.
24
            Thank you, ma'am. How are you presently
       Q.
25
   employed?
```

- A. I work for the Texas Department of Public Safety.
- Q. And what do you do for the Texas Department of Public Safety?
- A. I'm a technical supervisor in the Breath Alcohol Section.
- Q. And how long have you been employed as a technical supervisor?
 - A. I hired on with the department in April, 2014.
- Q. And all of that time you've been a technical supervisor for Harris County?
 - A. Yes.

- Q. How did you become a technical supervisor? What educational background do you have to have?
- A. You have to have a Bachelor's in some sort of related science. I have a Bachelor of Science in biology with a minor in both chemistry and criminal justice from Sam Houston State University.
- Q. And do you hold any memberships in any scientific or professional organizations?
- 21 A. Yes.
 - Q. And could you please tell the jury what those are?
- A. I am a member of both the Alcohol Testing

 25 Alliance and the International Association for Chemical

1 Testing. 2 Q. Have you written or contributed to any of 3 the -- any professional publications or articles to 4 those organizations? 5 Α. No. 6 0. Let's talk a little bit about your current 7 duties. What are your current duties and 8 responsibilities as a technical supervisor? 9 As a technical supervisor, we are in charge of Α. 10 the monthly maintenance and monitoring of the 11 instruments in our area, which is area 003. We are also in charge of storing our certified reference materials. 12 13 We ensure that our operators are current with their 14 certification and proficiency in using the instrument, and we are also the custodian of records. 15 16 Q. What agency certifies the breath and alcohol 17 testing program? 18 Α. The Texas Department of Public Safety. 19 Are you presently certified by the Texas O. 20 Department of Public Safety? 21 Yes, sir. Α. 22 Q. On January 18, 2015, were you certified --23 Α. Yes. 24 -- as a technical supervisor? Q.

25

Α.

Yes, sir.

- Q. Thank you. What training must you undergo before receiving such certification?
- A. When you are hired on with the department, you attend the same 40-hour operator's course that the breath test operators attend. You then help monitor and teach one of those courses. You also attend the Borkenstein School on alcohol and safety at the Indiana University. You also have to receive training from C.M.I., the manufacturer of the Intoxilyzer, on the maintenance and upkeep of the instrument; and you then have to take and pass a certification exam.
 - Q. And is this the same for all technical supervisors?
 - A. Yes.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

18

19

20

- 15 Q. And why is that?
- A. It's what's set forth in our standard operating guidelines.
 - Q. And do you recall where you went to school or received the specialized training?
 - A. In Austin and in Houston.
- Q. Have you ever done any experiments on your own as to the reliability of the Intoxilyzer instrument number 5000?
 - A. No.
- Q. Now let's move on to the science behind it all.

Are you familiar with the underlying scientific theory of the Intoxilyzer 5000 instrument?

A. Yes.

- Q. And what is that? Will you explain it to the jury?
- A. The instrument uses infrared spectroscopy. So on one end of the instrument you have a light source. You then have a sample chamber and a photo detector at the other end. When that sample chamber is 100 percent clear and there is nothing present, that photo detector will see 100 percent of that light coming through.
- Now, if there are substances present, that photo detector can detect how much is there and turn that into a concentration.
- Q. And is that scientifically valid or is that a valid theory in the scientific community?
 - A. Yes.
- Q. And how does that apply to the Intoxilyzer 5000 instrument?
- A. The instrument applies that by using the Lambert Beer Law. The Lambert Beer Law states that molecules will absorb infrared energy at a known amount. So each molecule has like a fingerprint. It's very specific. So the amount of infrared energy absorbed is directly equivalent to the amount of molecules present.

So when that light shines through the chamber and those ethanol molecules absorb that infrared energy, that photo detector can see how much of that energy is being absorbed and calculate that out into a concentration.

- Q. Based on your training and experience, was the theory properly applied in this case?
 - A. Yes.

- Q. All right. So, when somebody goes to give a breath test sample, do they just walk right up to the machine and give the sample?
 - A. No.
 - Q. What has to happen?
- A. The first thing the officer must do is what we call a 15-minute waiting period which is where the officer has to be in the continuous presence of the subject for the 15 minutes exactly prior to the test. And that's to ensure that the subject doesn't place anything in their mouth, belch, regurgitate, vomit, anything that could bring stomach contents which might have alcohol into the mouth. When that happens, you have residual mouth alcohol which can cause falsely high results. That dissipates in about 12 minutes, but we ask our operators to do 15.
- Q. Okay. And what -- once the 15-minute period has passed, what has to happen?

- A. Once that 15-minute waiting period is over, the operator will hit the green start test switch that is on the front of the instrument.
- Q. Okay. Does the instrument have an automatic self check?
- A. Yes. The instrument will first perform a circuitry check which is where it goes through and checks several of the internal workings. That must pass for them to continue on with the test.
 - Q. What happens if it doesn't pass?

- A. If it doesn't pass, what it will do is print out what we call a System A Report which let's us know where in the diagnostics it failed. So, for them to call us, let us know this is where the instrument failed and we go and check it out.
 - Q. What happens if it successfully passes?
- A. If it successfully passes, then the operator can continue on with the testing sequence.
 - Q. And do they have to look for any data?
- A. Yes. They will enter pertinent information such as subject name, date of birth, their information and certificate number and any arresting officer information.
 - Q. Okay. And then after that, what happens?
- A. After that the instrument will start into its

```
1
   self modulated-testing sequence. So, the instrument
2
   will run through several steps which are -- which is
3
   what the breath test is composed of.
4
            Obviously, there have to be people who operate
5
   these. Do you know an operator, Intoxilyzer operator,
6
   by the name of Christopher Morales?
7
       Α.
             Yes.
8
            And was Officer Morales certified on
9
   January 18, 2015 to operate by the Texas Department of
10
   Public Safety as an Intoxilyzer operator?
11
            Yes, he was.
       Α.
12
       O.
            Are you familiar with the Intoxilyzer
13
   instrument Model 5000, Serial Number 68-012803?
14
       Α.
            Yes.
15
            How are you familiar with that instrument?
       O.
16
       Α.
             It is one of the instruments in our area.
17
            And where is it located?
       O.
            At this time it was located at the Central B
18
       Α.
19
   Intox, Downtown Houston.
20
       Q.
             In what -- what's the corresponding area number
21
   that that was in?
22
       Α.
             003.
23
            And that falls within your area?
       O.
24
            Yes, sir.
       Α.
25
             Is the Intoxilyzer instrument number 5000
       Q.
```

1 certified, this particular one, certified by the 2 scientific director of the Texas Department of Public 3 Safety? 4 Yes, it is. Α. 5 And was it certified on the date of January 18, 0. 6 2015? 7 Α. Yes. 8 Ο. And was that instrument operated as part of the 9 Breath Alcohol Testing Program on that date? 10 Α. Yes, it was. 11 In your capacity as technical supervisor, are Q. 12 you responsible for the maintenance and monitoring of 13 this particular Intoxilyzer 5000 instrument, Serial No. 68-012803? 14 15 Yes, I am. Α. 16 Are there other technical supervisors responsible for the same? 17 18 Yes. There are two other ladies that are in Α. 19 the area, and their names are Carly Bishop and Nakethia 20 Rogers. 21 And to your knowledge, were the other technical Ο. supervisors certified by the Texas Department of Public 22 23 Safety on January 18, 2015? 24 Α. Yes. 25 To your knowledge, did they undergo the same Q.

training in maintaining the Intoxilyzer and preparing the reference solution as you did?

A. Yes.

- Q. How do you know that?
- A. It is what's set forth in our standard operating guidelines.
- Q. And finally, to your knowledge, do all technical supervisors in the State of Texas have to take and pass a test to demonstrate that they are qualified?
 - A. Yes.
- Q. All right. Can you walk us through a little bit about maintaining and monitoring the Intoxilyzer instruments?
- A. Once a calendar month, we actually go out to the testing site and do an inspection of the instrument. That includes running an acetone vapor through the instrument to ensure that it will detect substances other than ethanol and flag them as an interferent. We also do what we call an Inspect TS. Set off to the right of the instrument is a jar with a solution. That solution is a .08 ethanol solution. When stirred and heated constantly, the vapor above that solution is approximately the same as the concentration of the liquid. So what we do is we run -- we switch out that solution, and we run basically the same exact thing as a

1 subject test, providing two breaths of our own. 2 again, that's just to ensure that the instrument is 3 calibrated and still working properly.

- Okay. In your capacity as a technical supervisor for area 003, are you considered a custodian of records for the Intoxilyzer 5000 instrument, Serial No. 68-012803?
 - Α. Yes.
- And did you bring any -- as custodian of Q. records, are you required to keep records of the maintenance and monitoring of the Intoxilyzer?
- 12 Α. Yes.

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

13

19

20

21

22

23

- And did you bring any of those with you today? Q.
- 14 Yes, I did. Α.
- 15 Are those records kept in the ordinary course O. 16 of business of the Breath Alcohol Testing Program for the Department of Public Safety? 17
- Yes, sir. 18 Α.
 - Did an employee or representative of the Breath Alcohol Testing Program for the Texas Department of Public Safety, Area 003, make it or transmit the information?
 - Yes, they did. Α.
- Were the records made at or near the time soon Q. 25 after?

- 1 Α. Yes. 2 Were the records made actually soon after the 3 knowledge of the event? 4 Α. Yes. 5 Ο. Are the records with you originals or 6 duplicates? 7 They are duplicates. Α. According to your records, what is the closest 8 0. 9 date before the date of January 18, 2015 that this 10 particular Intox instrument was checked? 11 This instrument was inspected on January 16th of 2015. 12 13 And what was the operational condition of the Q. instrument at the time? 14 15 Α. The instrument was functioning properly. 16 Q. And you said that was checked on January 16? 17 Yes, sir. Α. 18 Q. So, that would be the closest date to 19 January 18, correct? 20 Α. Yes, sir, the closest date before. 21 To your knowledge, did the instrument require 22 any repairs between the dates that it was checked and 23 the date it was used?
 - A. No, sir.

Q. Based on your training and experience as to the

```
operational condition of the Intoxilyzer 5000
1
2
   instrument, Serial No. 68-012803, on January 18, 2015,
3
   what is your opinion of that instrument?
4
             That the instrument was functioning properly.
       Α.
5
             I'm now going to show you what's been
       Q.
6
   previously marked as State's Exhibit No. 4.
7
                  MR. VAZQUEZ: May I approach, Your Honor?
8
                  THE COURT: You may.
9
       Q.
             (BY MR. VAZQUEZ) Do you recognize that?
10
       Α.
             Yes, sir.
11
            And what is it?
       Q.
             This is this breath test slip in the case.
12
       Α.
13
            And is this record kept in the ordinary course
       Q.
14
   of business of the Breath Alcohol Testing Program for
15
   the Department of Public Safety --
16
       Α.
             Yes.
17
             -- and Houston Police Department?
       Ο.
18
       Α.
            Yes.
19
            Did an employee or representative of the Breath
20
   Alcohol Testing Program for the Houston Police
21
   Department, Area 003, make or transmit this information?
22
       Α.
             Yes.
23
             Is it a regular practice of the Houston Police
24
   Department to make this record?
25
       Α.
             Yes.
```

```
1
            Were the records made at or near the time of
       Q.
2
   the event or reasonably soon thereafter?
3
       Α.
            Yes.
4
            And did a representative who made the entries
       Q.
5
   have actual knowledge of the event?
6
       Α.
            Yes.
7
            Based upon your training, does the test record
8
   indicate the proper operational methods and testing
9
   techniques were followed during the administration of
10
   the test?
11
       A. Yes.
12
                  MR. VAZQUEZ: I will tender to opposing
13
   counsel.
14
                  MR. GUERRA: Just all of our prior
15
   objections, Your Honor.
16
                  THE COURT: Are you offering State's
17
   Exhibit No. 4?
18
                  MR. VAZQUEZ: I would like to offer
19
   State's Exhibit No. 4, Your Honor.
20
                  THE COURT: Your objections are overruled.
21
   State's Exhibit No. 4 is admitted.
22
                  MR. VAZQUEZ: Permission to publish,
23
   Judge.
24
                  THE COURT: You may.
25
                  MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you.
```

- Q. (BY MR. VAZQUEZ) All right. Can you tell from looking at this record if the circuitry test had been conducted?
 - A. Yes, sir.

- Q. And how can you tell that?
- A. The bottom line, at the end of the top paragraph, says, "Circuitry check okay."
- Q. And what is the significance of the phrase "Circuitry check okay"?
- A. That means that the instrument performed its circuitry check and everything passed.
- Q. Okay. The test record says, "Alcohol concentration" in the bottom, center column. What does that mean?
- A. In breath, we do alcohol concentration in grams per 210 liters of breath.
 - Q. What is "Air blank"?
 - A. "Air blank" is something that the instrument does and there's several reasons: A, it's to clear the sample chamber of anything that can be inside. It checks the ambient conditions to the room air to ensure there's nothing in the room that can cause a weird result. And it also allows that light and the photo detector to set a zero reference point before we start our measurement.

- Q. And after the air blank, what does the operator do?
- A. The operator will then instruct the subject to provide their first breath sample.
- Q. Is that what the first term "subject test" means?
 - A. Yes, sir.

- Q. What happens after the subject blows?
- A. Once the subject has met the minimum sampling requirements and the sample is accepted, the instrument will yet again do another air blank.
- Q. And after the first sample, what -- why does the operator perform a second air blank?
- A. Again, that is to clear that sample chamber of any ethanol, to check those ambient conditions, and to ensure that it has a zero setting.
 - Q. And what happens after the second air blank?
- A. After the second air blank is when the instrument tests the vapor and that solution that we change. You don't want to measure two unknowns without measuring a known. You want to make sure your results are accurate, and so that is what your reference sample is.
- Q. So the reference sample is verified that it's operating correctly?

A. Yes.

- Q. And who prepares the solution used for the reference sample?
 - A. We do.
 - Q. Technical supervisors?
 - A. Yes, sir.
- Q. Based on your training and experience, is the preparation technique for the solution used in the reference samples standardized for all of Texas?
- A. Yes, sir. We all use the same formula to prepare our solution.
 - Q. How is that prepared?
- A. For us, since we make such a large volume, we have a small bottling plant in Austin at headquarters. So we make several liters of the solution at once. We submerge a UV light in it for two or three hours to kill any microbes that could be in; and then we bottle that solution, label it, and bring it back to our lab and run it against a NIST traceable solution on a certified Intoxilyzer to ensure that the concentration is accurate.
 - Q. And do you check that periodically?
- A. Yes. We sample three bottles out of the batch we make, and it is sampled every time a test is run.
- Q. And how is the predicted value entered into the

Intoxilyzer 5000?

- A. That predicted value is entered in by the technical supervisor via a hidden menu on the instrument.
- Q. And does the test record reflect that the result of the reference analysis was within tolerance of the predicted reference sample value?
 - A. Yes, sir.
- Q. And what is within tolerance? What is the range for in tolerance?
- A. The tolerance on that reference value is 8.01. So as long as we fall between 8.07 and 8.09, that instrument is still reading accurately.
- Q. And what happens if the reference sample is out of tolerance?
- A. If the reference sample is out of tolerance, the instrument will give you an error that says, "Out of tolerance;" and it will print what we call an invalid test slip. So, below that first paragraph you would have none of that analytical data and it will say, "Reference, out of tolerance."
- Q. And what happened -- why is there another air blank after the reference sample?
- A. Again, that is to clear that sample chamber and make sure that instrument can set a zero reference

before taking a measurement.

- Q. And then what happens?
- A. And then the subject will provide their second breath test -- or their second breath sample.
- Q. Okay. And why does the subject give a second breath sample?
- A. That is another way we help fight against residual mouth alcohol. Those two breath samples have to agree within a .02 of each other. When you have mouth alcohol, you will see a sharp incline and then a sharp decline. So, your two samples would be really far apart. So, to ensure we don't take samples that have mouth alcohol, we narrow the standards on that. So, if they fall outside of that range, you will get an error slip.
- Q. Okay. There we see -- there's a final air blank given. Why is that final air blank run?
- A. Again, just one more time to clear that chamber, to check those ambient conditions, and to ensure the instrument can perform a zero set.
- Q. And after all this is said and done, what happens?
- A. After this is all said and done, the instrument will flash the test results three times and print out two copies of the test slip.

Q. And what were the results of the two breath slips of the subject in this case reflected on State's Exhibit Number --

THE COURT: Four.

- Q. (BY MR. VAZQUEZ) -- 4?
- A. The first test or the first sample was a .145. The second was a .146.
- Q. Are there subject results in the expression of numbers of grams of alcohol per 210 liters of breath?
 - A. Yes, sir.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

19

20

21

22

23

- Q. Were those two breath results within the allowed tolerance specified by the scientific director of the Texas Department of Public Safety?
 - A. Yes, sir.
- Q. Are the results of Jose Garcia -- Jose Garcia's breath analysis equal to or greater than an alcohol concentration of .08?
- A. Greater than.
 - Q. During the course of your training, do you learn about the effects of alcohol upon a person's mental and physical faculties?
 - A. Yes, sir.
 - Q. And based on your training and experience, how can alcohol affect a person's mental faculties?
- 25 A. With your mental faculties, it affects things

such as judgment, your inhibitions, your ability to coordinate multiple tasks at one time; these things which are needed to safely operate a motor vehicle.

- Q. And based on your training and experience, how can alcohol affect a person's physical faculties?
- A. It will affect things such as balance, your reaction times, your visual acuity which is the ability for the eye to communicate with the brain as to what it's seen, your depth perception. Again, all of these things are needed to safely operate a motor vehicle.
- Q. That was going to be my next question. Thank you.

Have you ever conducted any experiments on a person's alcohol level and their mental and physical faculties?

- A. When we host our operator schools, we will actually dose our operators. We have two drinking days, and we will dose them to about a .08 and have them come down and have their fellow classmates run them on the Intoxilyzer so they know what it's like, a, to run somebody who is impaired and, b, so those officers know what a .08 feels like and just for, you know, purposes out in the field.
- Q. And based on your experience and studies, do you have any opinion as to the alcohol concentration at

Tasha Israel - July 15, 2015 Direct Examination by Mr. Vazquez

```
1
   which a person does not have the normal use of his or
2
   her mental or physical faculties?
3
       Α.
            Yes.
4
            And what is that?
       Ο.
5
            That would be a .08.
       Α.
6
       O.
            And do you know of any organizations that hold
7
   the same opinion?
8
       Α.
            Off the top of my head, I cannot list but I am
9
   sure there some.
10
            In your opinion, would a person with an alcohol
   concentration of .145 have loss the normal use of his or
11
   her mental or physical faculties?
12
13
            Yes.
       Α.
            And what is the legal limit set by the Texas
14
15
   legislature?
16
       Α.
            .08.
       Q. How about tolerance? If a person has a
17
   tolerance to alcohol, do they have a normal use of his
18
19
   faculties?
20
                  MR. GUERRA: I'm going to object to
21
   speculation.
22
                  THE COURT: Sustained at this time.
23
                  MR. VAZQUEZ: I will withdraw it, Your
24
   Honor.
25
       Q. (BY MR. VAZQUEZ) Okay. We talked about the
```

defendant's blood alcohol concentration at 4:36 and 4:39. Those are the times of the breath test. Is it possible to determine a person's B.A.C. at the time of driving?

- A. If we have certain facts, then we can perform what we call a retrograde extrapolation which is just a back estimation.
 - Q. And what facts would you need for that?
- A. I would for sure need the time of last meal, the time of last drink, the time of stop and the breath test results.
 - Q. And do we have any of those facts in this case?
 - A. Oh, I don't -- I don't know.
- Q. If we did would you have provided an extrapolation result?
- A. If we did have the facts to do it, then, yes, I would have performed an extrapolation. But if we don't have the minimum facts, then we cannot.
 - Q. What is absorption?

- A. Absorption is the process of the alcohol absorbing through the mucosal membranes in the body and being distributed out to your tissues.
 - O. And what about elimination?
- A. Elimination is when your body starts
 eliminating that alcohol, when elimination is occurring

```
1
   faster than absorption, when your body is actually in
2
   the elimination phase. But when you were absorbing, you
3
   know, more than you are eliminating, your curve is going
4
   up.
5
                  MR. VAZQUEZ: Nothing further at this
6
   time, Your Honor.
7
                  THE COURT: Mr. Guerra.
                               Thank you.
8
                  MR. GUERRA:
9
                       CROSS-EXAMINATION
10
   BY MR. GUERRA:
11
             Good afternoon, Ms. Israel. How are you?
       Q.
12
       Α.
             Good. And yourself?
13
       Q.
             I am okay. I would like to ask you a few
14
   questions.
15
                  You began working with D.P.S. April of
16
   2014?
17
            Correct.
       Α.
18
       Q.
             This incident happened January of 2015?
19
             Yes, sir.
       Α.
20
       Q.
             So, you were on the job approximately nine or
21
   ten months?
22
       Α.
            Yes, sir.
23
             And where were you before April of 2015?
24
             I worked at Texas A & M in their Lower Division
       Α.
25
   Biology Instruction Program as a lab technician.
```

- Q. You weren't doing what you are doing today?
- A. No, sir, I was not.

- Q. Now, in those nine months, did you perform any of the maintenance that we discussed earlier on any of these machines?
- A. I was certified in November of 2014. So, starting December, I was doing monthly maintenance on the instruments. So, yes.
- Q. Okay. So, January of 2015, you had been doing the maintenance on these machines for about three months?
 - A. Yes, sir.
- Q. Now, specifically to this machine that we are discussing, did you do the maintenance on this machine?
- A. Not in January, but I had the first inspection in February.
 - Q. So, who did the maintenance in January?
- A. Nakithia Rogers did the beginning-of-the-month inspection, and Carly Bishop did the mid-month.
 - Q. So, these inspections are done bimonthly?
- A. With the Central, we do them twice a month due to the fact of the shared volume of tests that they run down there. Just to stay on top of the records, we check beginning of the month and mid month.
- Q. But you were not personally there for Ms.

```
1
   Rogers to do the beginning-of-the-month maintenance
2
   inspection, correct?
3
       Α.
            Correct.
4
             And you were not there when Ms. Bishop did the
       Ο.
   inspection mid month which was January 16, 2015,
5
6
   correct?
7
       Α.
           Correct.
8
       Ο.
            You have to rely on what they conveyed to you
9
   of their records, correct?
10
            Yes, sir.
       Α.
11
             So, you can't tell this jury with any
121
   certainty -- certainty that Ms. Rogers and/or Ms. Bishop
13
   did everything according to protocol?
14
             We are all trained to follow our S.O.G.s.
       Α.
15
   there is no doubt in my mind that they would stray from
16
   our S.O.G.s.
17
       Ο.
            But you weren't there?
18
       Α.
            No, sir, I was not there.
19
            Now, you talked a little bit about and the
       Ο.
20
   State asked you some questions about the specific
21
   science. Do you recall that?
22
       Α.
            Yes, sir.
23
            You testified that this is a scientific
       O.
24
   community.
25
       Α.
            Yes, sir.
```

- Q. How we -- is it a nationwide scientific community?
- A. Oh, yes. The infrared spectroscopy and Lambert Beer Law have both been around for a very, very long time.
 - Ο. So, is it your testimony that this science is used throughout the United States?
 - Α. Yes, sir.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

- Is it your testimony that these machines, the Q. 10 Intoxilyzer, are administered in every state in the 11 United States?
- 12 A. Not every state uses the 5000. There are, I 13 think, at least two other manufacturers of evidential 14 breath test instruments.
- 15 Q. And are those machines superior to the Intoxilyzer 5000? 16
- 17 I have no idea. A.
- Q. But we know several states that do not use 19 these specific machines?
- 20 A. Correct. Not every state uses the same 21 instrument.
- 22 Q. Okay. Now let me talk to you a little bit 23 about this process. Obviously, you get these results, 24 correct?
- 25 A. Yes, sir.

1 Okay. Now, this is a machine that measures Q. 2 specifically alcohol? 3 Α. Yes. 4 So, people that are brought in to the Central 0. 5 Intox, those people are under suspicion of consuming 6 alcohol to the point where it compromises their mental 7 or physical faculties or maybe above the legal limit, 8 correct? 9 Α. Correct. 10 And you have some training as to what some of 11 those indicators may be, correct? 12 Α. Yes. 13 For example, bloodshot eyes? Q. 14 Α. That could happen, yes. 15 Poor balance? Ο. 16 Α. Yes. 17 Slurred speech? Q. 18 Α. Yes. 19 Consumption of alcohol? O. 20 Α. Yes. 21 So, these people that are under suspicion of O. 22 consuming alcohol are brought to the station to provide 23 a breath sample --24 If they agree, yes. Α. 25 Q. -- under those circumstances that I just

described?

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

19

20

21

22

23

- A. If the officer sees that and assumes it's enough for probable cause, then I would assume they would bring him down, yes.
- Q. Okay. Now, I want to be clear to the ladies and gentleman of the jury that the results that you have here for Mr. Garcia are taken at 4:36 a.m.?
 - A. Yes, sir, I believe that is the time.
- Q. Okay. Are you aware that the initial contact with Mr. Garcia took place at approximately 2:30 or two hours prior to?
- 12 A. No, sir.
- Q. Okay. Those facts weren't relayed to you?
- 14 A. No, sir.
- Q. Now, so all you can testify -- or what you are testifying to here is that at 4:36, the alleged alcohol concentration was .145 and .146, correct?
- 18 A. Correct.
 - Q. You cannot testify that at 2:30, 2:40, when Mr. Garcia allegedly was operating a vehicle, he had this level of concentration or any other level of concentration of alcohol, correct?
 - A. Correct. I cannot say what his concentration was at the time of stop.
- Q. Okay. So -- and in your training and I'm sure

```
1
   you've testified, what the law requires as to the
2
   alcohol level, they have to prove that Mr. Garcia in
3
   this case was above a .08 at the time he was operating a
4
   motor vehicle?
5
       A. Yes, or the loss of mental and physical
6
   faculties.
7
                  THE COURT: The law is actually .08 or
8
   greater.
9
                  MR. GUERRA: Correct.
             (BY MR. GUERRA) .08 or greater at the time of
10
       O.
11
   operating a motor vehicle, correct?
12
       Α.
           Correct.
13
       Q.
           And we are just talking about alcohol, a .08 or
14
   greater. Okay.
15
                  And so just to be clear, you are not here
16
   testifying that at 2:40, 2:30, Mr. Garcia was above a
    .08, correct?
17
18
       Α.
            Correct. I have no way of knowing.
19
            And the State asked about extrapolation,
       Ο.
   testified a little bit about that. You need certain
20
21
   factors to be able to do that, correct?
22
       Α.
            Yes.
23
            And whose responsibility is it to obtain those
24
   factors?
25
            They are usually relayed to us by the
       Α.
```

```
1
   prosecutor.
2
            So, would it be fair to say that the officers
3
   that make the -- are suspicious of intoxication, those
4
   officers would be responsible to ask those pertinent
5
   questions as to extrapolation?
6
       Α.
            Yes. The officers usually do ask those
7
   questions.
8
       Ο.
            Okay. And some of the questions that are
9
   required are what they ate --
10
       Α.
            Yes.
11
            -- when was their first drink --
       Q.
12
            Yes.
       Α.
13
            -- when was their second drink or last drink?
       Q.
14
       Α.
            Yes.
15
       O.
            And obviously what the test results are,
16
   correct?
17
       Α.
            Correct.
18
            Now, the most important thing -- and this is
19
   extrapolation process -- is you have to have an accurate
20
   reading or alcohol test result, correct?
21
       Α.
            Yes.
22
       Q.
             If this is inaccurate, whatever you do is not
23
   going to be accurate, correct?
24
       A. Correct.
25
            Now, you testified about effects of alcohol,
       Q.
```

```
1
   correct?
2
            Yes, sir.
       Α.
3
            And you received some training on that,
       Q.
4
   correct?
5
       Α.
            Yes, sir.
6
            Now, some of the things that you testified to
7
   were -- was poor balance?
8
       Α.
            Yes.
9
            And now in your training and experience, could
       Q.
10
   poor balance be due to a medical condition?
11
             Some medical conditions can cause poor balance,
12
   vertigo, things like that.
13
            Concussions?
       Q.
14
            Yes, sir.
       Α.
15
            Okay. Now, you've testified that you are --
       Ο.
16
   you maintain these records, right?
17
            Yes, sir.
       Α.
18
            And as part of that process, you know, guys
19
   like us, defense attorneys, we submit a motion and you
20
   provide all of the discovery that's relevant to this
21
   specific machine?
22
       Α.
            Yes, sir.
23
            And in those discovery materials, you include
   some past results from other individuals?
241
25
            Yes, we include subject records.
       Α.
```

```
1
             And those are all taken within, I guess, that
       Q.
2
   month or the following month, correct?
3
             We do 30 days before and after.
       Α.
4
                  MR. GUERRA: May I approach the witness,
5
   Your Honor?
6
                  THE COURT: Yes.
7
             (BY MR. GUERRA) I'm going to show you what's
       Ο.
   been marked as Defendant's Exhibit 1 through 12. If you
8
9
   will take a look at those.
10
       Α.
             Uh-huh.
11
             Can you tell the jury what those are?
       Q.
12
       Α.
             These are test slips of other subjects.
13
       Q.
             Are they test slips of the Intoxilyzer 5000,
14
   specifically 68-012803?
15
             Yes, sir.
       Α.
16
       Q.
             That's the machine that is in question here
17
   today?
18
       Α.
             Yes.
19
             Are those records maintained in the normal
   course of business?
20
21
       Α.
            Yes.
22
       Q.
            Are they accurate? Do they reflect your
23
   records?
24
       Α.
             Yes.
25
                  MR. GUERRA: Your Honor, I would like to
```

```
1
   admit those -- tender them to the State and admit them
2
   as Defense 1 through 12.
3
                 MR. VAZQUEZ: Your Honor, I would object
4
   on the fact that none of these test slips pertain to the
5
   defendant in this case and, therefore, are irrelevant to
6
   the proceedings.
7
                  THE COURT: Let me take a look at them,
8
   please.
9
                  (At the Bench)
10
                 THE COURT: So, what's the relevance of
11
   all of the .00? They show no alcohol.
12
                 MR. GUERRA: That this machine is capable
13
   of making mistakes on that end. As to my client, Your
14
   Honor -- I'm sorry?
15
                 THE COURT: Is it your position because
16
   they are showing no alcohol that the machine is not
17
   working properly? Because these people are probably
18
   claiming that it is working properly since it was .00.
19
                 MR. GUERRA: I don't know what they're
20
   claiming. Under my point, Your Honor, if they are
21
   brought in under special D.W.I., the records of this
22
   machine are giving a zero result. That means there may
23
   be a problem with the machine. I can introduce the
24
   entire record if the Court wants.
                 THE COURT: At this time the selected
25
```

```
1
   records that you pulled out, Defense Exhibits 1 through
2
   12, that shows zero alcohol concentration for different
3
   subjects on different dates are not admissible. So, I
4
   am going to sustain your objection.
5
                  MR. GUERRA: Okay.
6
                  (Jury present)
7
             (BY MR. GUERRA) Ms. Israel, as part of the
       Ο.
8
   discovery process, you provided to the defense attorneys
9
   a disk, correct?
10
       Α.
            Correct.
11
            And that disk maintains a number of different
       Ο.
12
   records, right?
13
            Yes, sir.
       Α.
14
            It maintains your maintenance records?
       Ο.
15
            Yes.
       Α.
             It maintains when the maintenance records were
16
       Q.
17
   given or took place?
18
       Α.
            Yes.
19
            It maintains your standard operating procedure
20
   manual?
21
       Α.
            Yes.
22
       Q.
            And all of those records are maintained within
23
   the normal course of business, correct?
24
       Α.
            Correct.
25
                  MR. GUERRA: May I approach the witness?
```

```
1
                  THE COURT: You may.
2
            (BY MR. GUERRA) I am showing you here a disk.
       0.
3
   Would that CD contain those records that are in
4
   question?
5
       Α.
           Yes, sir.
6
       Ο.
            Okay. And those records are kept in the normal
7
   course of business?
8
       Α.
            Yes, sir.
9
            And you are familiar with those records?
       Q.
10
       Α.
            Yes, sir. I believe I did this discovery.
11
       Q.
            Okay.
                  MR. GUERRA: Can I tender to counsel
12
13
   Defendant's Exhibit No. 13 and ask for them to be
14
   admitted?
15
                  MR. VAZQUEZ: I haven't seen this, Your
16
   Honor, so I don't know what's on here.
17
                  THE COURT: Ladies and gentlemen, let's
18
   take our afternoon break. So, if you will please go
19
   with the deputy.
                  THE BAILIFF: All rise.
20
21
                  (Jury leaves courtroom)
22
                  THE COURT: Y'all may be seated.
23
                  Juan, what is it you're trying to do? Get
24
   to the test slips?
25
                  MR. GUERRA: I want to introduce the other
```

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

```
test slips under the suspicion of D.W.I., being
   intoxicated; they came back completely zero. And I will
   wrap up in closing that if this machine is capable of
   having 12 people come in under that suspicion and
   marking zero, it is certainly capable of the other end
   of somebody coming in with little or no alcohol and it
   may be a mistake. I think that's appropriate. It's
   proper. It's part of my defense. Not allowing me to do
   that I think violates my due process and Sixth Amendment
10
   right to put up a defense.
11
                 THE COURT: So, what I understand that you
12
   are trying to accomplish --
13
                 MR. GUERRA: Yes, ma'am.
14
                 THE COURT: -- is you want to introduce 12
15
   test slips that all show zero alcohol concentration,
16
   even culled out of discovery that was provided to you by
17
   the Department of Public Safety which presumably also
18
   contains slips that show the presence of alcohol, right?
19
                 MR. GUERRA: Correct.
20
                 THE COURT: And you want to introduce the
21
   limited exhibits for the purpose of the argument of,
22
   look, if there are 12 exhibits, 12 test slips that were
23
   produced to me that show a negative, there must have
24
   been something wrong with the machine?
25
                 MR. GUERRA:
                              Yes.
```

```
1
                 THE COURT: Okay. Doesn't that counter
2
   argument also apply which is maybe the machines were
3
   working properly? Because we don't know the factual
4
   circumstances behind each of those 12 test slips which
5
   have nothing to do with your client, and your client
6
   isn't at a .00. So --
7
                 MR. GUERRA: If the State wants to make
8
   that argument, they certainly can make that argument;
9
   but I think I am entitled to make the argument that I
10
   think is appropriate.
11
                 THE COURT: Let me ask you this question.
12
                 MR. GUERRA: Yes, ma'am.
                 THE COURT: This is on the issue of
13
14
   relevance. On those Exhibits 1 through 12, those test
15
   slips that show zero alcohol for presumably 12 different
16
   subjects over 12 different dates --
17
                 MR. GUERRA: Yes, ma'am.
18
                 THE COURT: -- how do they make -- how
19
   have you established thus far that they make it more or
20
   less probable that your client -- that there was a
   mistake in the machine, based on what you presented so
21
22
   far with this witness?
23
                 MR. GUERRA: I will admit all of them. If
24
   the Court wants me to admit all 200 slips, that's fine
25
   with me.
```

```
1
                 THE COURT: Well -- and I don't know
2
   whether they would be relevant or not. But I am asking
3
   you: How have you established the relevancy up to this
   point with this witness other than your speculation
5
   about why those are all zeros?
6
                 MR. GUERRA: Okay. Then I will stop, and
7
   I will bring her back as my own witness after I finish
8
   my case.
9
                 THE COURT: Okay.
10
                 MR. GUERRA: Then I can bring them in.
11
   mean, is that --
12
                 THE COURT: You may or may not be able to.
13
   That's why I'm asking you. How have you made these
14
   relevant? At this point, they are not relevant. So you
   haven't established the relevancy through this witness.
15
16
   You can't introduce them and then establish the
17
   relevancy. You have to establish it on the front end
18
   for them to be admissible. I see what you are saying,
19
   but you have to do it the right way.
20
                 MR. GUERRA: Okay.
21
                 THE COURT: Okay? So at this point, 1
22
   through 12 are inadmissible. And if you want to
23
   introduce the entire disk --
24
                 MR. GUERRA: I do.
25
                 THE COURT: -- then I'm going to let the
```

1 State have an opportunity to look at it and see if they 2 have any objections to all of the documents that are in 3 there. But if 1 through 12 are on that disk, I've 4 already ruled on the objection to 1 through 12. 5 MR. GUERRA: There is -- yes, they are on 6 that disk, along with every -- all of the other 7 documents that are provided with that machine. 8 Your Honor, how is all of the discovery 9 materials that pertain to this machine as to whether or 10 not it was maintained and working properly, whether they 11 follow protocol, how is that not admissible? THE COURT: You haven't established the 12 relevancy of one document that is on that disk. If you 13 14 are representing they are the maintenance records, you 15 haven't asked this witness a question about one 16 maintenance record that's on that disk or what the 17 meaning of those maintenance records are. And just 18 because they have revealed them in discovery does not 19 make them admissible. 20 MR. GUERRA: Okay. 21 THE COURT: Just like an offense report is 22 revealed in discovery. That by virtue of its revelation 23 does not make it admissible. 24 MR. GUERRA: I understand that, Your 25 Honor. But she has testified that her position is that

```
she believes this machine was working properly. That's
1
2
   her testimony.
3
                  THE COURT: What questions have you asked
4
   her that would substantiate your claim that a zero
5
   result indicates that it's not working properly?
                 MR. GUERRA: Well, the people that come in
6
7
   to take breath tests, it's specifically alcohol related,
8
   they come in under the -- under the factors that all of
   these officers have testified to that are -- may be
9
10
   related to intoxication due by alcohol.
11
                  THE COURT: To other people. Not your
12
   client, right?
13
                  MR. GUERRA: They said it about my client
14
   and other people as well.
15
                  THE COURT: Okay. I have made my ruling.
16
   Let's take a break.
17
                  (Recess taken)
18
                  THE COURT: We are ready for the jury.
19
                  THE BAILIFF: All rise.
20
                  (Jury enters courtroom)
21
                  THE COURT: Please be seated. Mr. Guerra,
22
   you may proceed, sir.
23
                  MR. GUERRA: Thank you, Your Honor.
24
             (BY MR. GUERRA) Ms. Israel, we were talking
       0.
25
   about the materials that you provided that relate to
```

1 this machine, correct? 2 Α. Correct. 3 Okay. Those materials include sample or test Ο. 4 slips from other individuals that perform the test on 5 this specific machine, correct? 6 Α. Yes. We provide 30 days before and after, if 7 available, of subject test records on that instrument. 8 O. Now, those individuals have nothing to do with 9 this case, correct? 10 Α. Correct. 11 Except for the fact that the test that they 12 took were administered -- was the same test that 13 Mr. Garcia gave a sample to, correct? 14 Α. Well, they were tested on the same instrument. 15 On the same instrument. Correct. Some of them Ο. 16 were tested some time before. Some of them were tested 17 on the same day? 18 Α. Correct. 19 And some were tested after the 18th, right? Ο. 20 Α. Yes, sir. 21 And you are familiar with those records, O. 22 correct? 23 Yes, sir. Α. 24 As a matter of fact, you testified that you are Q.

the one that created this CD for me, correct?

```
1
            Yes, sir.
       Α.
2
            And you reviewed those records?
3
       Α.
            Yes.
4
            Now, in those sample tests that we're
       Q.
5
   discussing, there is some tests that are completely
6
   invalid, correct?
7
       Α.
            Yes.
8
            Now, to be fair to you, there's some tests in
9
   there that show some or a significant amount of alcohol,
10
   correct?
11
       A. Correct.
12
       0.
            Now, there's also a test that show completely
13
   zero alcohol, correct?
14
            Yes, sir.
       Α.
15
            Okay. Now, these are all individuals who came
       Ο.
16
   into Central Intox, correct?
17
            Yes, sir.
       Α.
18
       Q.
            Under suspicion of D.W.I.?
19
                  MR. VAZQUEZ: Your Honor, may we approach?
20
   Objection.
21
                  THE COURT: What is your objection?
22
                  MR. VAZQUEZ: Still as to the relevance.
23
   And if I may be heard, Your Honor.
24
                  THE COURT: Okay. That question is
25
   sustained.
```

```
1
             (BY MR. GUERRA) Okay. So, these are all
       Q.
2
   individuals that were requested to give a sample,
3
   correct?
4
            Yes, they agreed to give a breath sample.
       Α.
5
            And they were all under suspicion of D.W.I.?
       Q.
6
       Α.
             I would assume so, yes.
7
       Q.
            Okay.
8
                  MR. VAZQUEZ: Calls for speculation, Your
9
   Honor.
10
                  THE COURT: Sustained.
11
             (BY MR. GUERRA) Well, you've had some training
       Q.
12
   in this area, correct?
13
       Α.
            Yes.
14
            A sample is not requested from an individual
15
   just for the sake of requesting it, correct?
16
                  MR. VAZQUEZ: Objection, Your Honor.
17
   still calls for speculation.
18
                  THE COURT: Sustained. As to this
19
   witness' knowledge.
20
       Q.
             (BY MR. GUERRA) As to your knowledge, okay --
21
   okay. So, the Intoxilyzer 5000, it is used to measure
   alcohol?
22
23
       Α.
            Correct.
24
            Correct. And they are -- the requests are made
       Q.
25
   for people to provide a breath sample, correct?
```

Tasha Israel - July 15, 2015 Redirect Examination by Mr. Vazquez

```
1
            Yes, sir.
       Α.
2
            That's how the test is performed?
       Q.
3
       Α.
             Yes, sir.
4
            Without that request, you can't perform the
       Q.
5
   test?
6
       Α.
            Correct.
7
            You need those samples?
       Q.
8
       Α.
            Correct.
9
            Now, approximately how many -- well, in these
       Q.
10
   records that we're discussing, about 20 of these samples
11
   came back with zero alcohol?
12
       Α.
            It's possible.
13
       Q.
            Well, you reviewed those records, correct?
14
            Yes, sir.
       Α.
15
       O.
             So, about 20 samples came back with zero
16
   alcohol, correct?
17
       Α.
            Yes, sir.
18
                  MR. GUERRA: I will pass the witness.
19
                  THE COURT: Mr. Vazquez.
20
                  MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you, Your Honor.
21
                      REDIRECT EXAMINATION
22
   BY MR. VAZQUEZ:
23
            Ms. Israel, those samples, do you know the
24
   facts of those cases?
25
       A. No, sir.
```

1 Is it possible to be intoxicated on something Q. 2 other than alcohol? 3 Α. Yes, sir. 4 And if you were intoxicated on something other O. 5 than alcohol, would that show up on the Breathalyzer 6 machine, instrument? 7 No, sir, just alcohol. Α. 8 Ο. So, if you were intoxicated based on a 9 combination of drugs, would you -- would you have a zero 10 result on your Intoxilyzer results? 11 Α. Yes. 12 MR. VAZQUEZ: Nothing further, Your Honor. 13 THE COURT: Mr. Guerra. 14 MR. GUERRA: Thank you, Your Honor. 15 **RECROSS-EXAMINATION** BY MR. GUERRA: 16 17 Q. I'm a little confused. Intoxilyzer measures 18 alcohol, correct? 19 Yes, sir. Α. 20 Q. So, the sample that is requested is to measure 21 the alcohol, correct? 22 Α. If they are believed to be impaired, yes. 23 So, if they are believed to be impaired by 24 alcohol, that's why you request this test? 25 A. Yes, sir.

```
1
             So, the people that were requested to take this
       Q.
2
   test were due to -- there was a belief that there was
3
   alcohol involved, correct?
4
                  MR. VAZQUEZ: Objection, Your Honor.
5
   There is no evidence to support that.
6
                  THE COURT: What is your legal objection?
7
                  MR. VAZQUEZ: Irrelevant, Your Honor.
8
                  THE COURT: Sustained.
9
                  MR. GUERRA: Can I have a quick second,
10
   Your Honor?
11
                  THE COURT: Sure.
12
       Ο.
             (BY MR. GUERRA) All right. Let me move to
13
   something -- and just a quick question. Let's move to
14
   something completely different.
15
                  You testified about effects of alcohol,
16
   correct?
17
            Yes, sir.
       Α.
18
            And one of the things that you discussed was
19
   depth perception?
20
       Α.
            Correct.
21
            Correct. You wear glasses?
       Ο.
22
       Α.
            Yes, sir.
23
            When you take your glasses off, what happens?
       Ο.
24
            I am pretty blind.
       Α.
25
            Okay. Your depth perception is altered?
       Q.
```

```
1
            Yes, sir, definitely.
       Α.
2
            What is your eyewear? What's your -- I don't
3
   know.
4
            Prescription?
       Α.
5
            Prescription.
       Q.
6
       Α.
            One eye, I think, is like a negative 3.5 and
7
   the other is a negative 3.25.
8
       Q.
            When you take off your glasses, are you a
9
   little weird, a little dizzy?
10
       Α.
            Oh, no. I can walk around just fine without
11
   them.
12
       O.
            But your depth perception is altered, correct?
13
       Α.
            Correct.
14
                  MR. GUERRA: Pass the witness.
15
                  THE COURT: Mr. Vazquez.
16
                  MR. VAZQUEZ: Nothing further, Your Honor.
17
                  THE COURT: All right. May this witness
18
   be excused? Any objections from the State?
19
                  MR. VAZQUEZ:
                                None.
20
                  THE COURT: Any from the defense?
21
                  MR. GUERRA: No.
22
                  THE COURT: Thanks for coming down, ma'am.
23
   You are excused.
24
                  Your next witness, State?
25
                  MR. VAZQUEZ: At this time the State would
```

```
1
   rest.
2
                 THE COURT: Mr. Guerra.
3
                 MR. GUERRA: I would like to take up a
4
   motion, Your Honor.
5
                 THE COURT: Do you want to do it up at the
6
   Bench, or do you want to take a break?
7
                 MR. GUERRA: I would like to do it outside
8
   the presence of the jury.
9
                 THE COURT: All right. Ladies and
10
   gentlemen, we are going to take a break. It won't be as
11
   long as the last one.
12
                  (Jury leaves courtroom)
13
                 THE COURT: Okay. Y'all may be seated.
14
   Go ahead.
15
                 MR. GUERRA: Your Honor, I am going to
16
   make a request for a directed verdict specifically on
17 l
   the issue of above a .08. There's been no testimony as
18
   to extrapolation regarding that issue. There's no
19
   testimony before this Court that at the time of
20
   operating, Mr. Garcia was above a .08. I understand
   that the jury can take that into consideration; but I
21
22
   would ask for a directed verdict, specifically on that
23
   paragraph, for it not to be included in the jury charge.
24
                 THE COURT: Okay. Are we about to discuss
25
   the charge. Or are you going to present a case?
```

```
1
                 MR. GUERRA: I'm going to present a case.
2
                 THE COURT: Okay. Let me -- if that's a
3
   charging issue, then we can address that later. But at
   this time, if you are asking me to direct them out on
4
5
   that particular definition of intoxication, that request
6
   will be denied.
7
                 MR. GUERRA: Okay. Thank you, Your Honor.
8
                 THE COURT: But we can talk about your
9
   charging concern at the appropriate time. Anything
10
   else?
11
                 MR. GUERRA: That's it.
12
                 THE COURT: All right. Let's bring in the
13
   jury.
14
                 (Recess taken)
15
                 THE COURT: All right. We are ready.
16
                 THE BAILIFF: All rise.
17
                 (Jury enters courtroom)
18
                 THE COURT: All right. Please be seated.
   All right. Mr. Guerra.
19
20
                 MR. GUERRA: Your Honor, at this time we
21
   call Mr. Garcia.
22
                 THE COURT: Mr. Garcia, please stand and
23
   raise your right hand for me.
24
                  (Oath administered)
25
                 THE COURT: Thank you, sir. Come on up.
```

```
1
   Have a seat up here. Be sure to speak loudly so we can
2
   all hear what you have to say.
3
                  You may proceed when you are ready.
4
                  MR. GUERRA: Thank you, Your Honor.
5
                         JOSE A. GARCIA,
6
   having been first duly sworn, testified as follows:
7
                       DIRECT EXAMINATION
8
   BY MR. GUERRA:
9
            Mr. Garcia, can you please state your name for
       Q.
10
   the record?
11
            Jose Alfredo Garcia.
       Α.
12
       Q.
            Mr. Garcia, where are you employed currently?
13
       Α.
             I am employed with Blue Green Vacation Club.
14
       Ο.
            For how long?
15
            Six months.
       Α.
16
       Q.
            Where were you employed before that?
17
            The Hilton New York.
       Α.
18
            Now, where do you currently live?
       Q.
19
             I am living in Harlingen because I took a
       Α.
20
   promotion to be the store manager in Harlingen.
21
       Ο.
            How long have you been in Harlingen?
22
       Α.
            Four months.
23
            Now, on January 18, where were you living?
       Ο.
24
             I had just recently moved from New York. I had
       Α.
25
   just been here two weeks, until I had my accident.
```

shortly after I moved to the valley.

- Q. Now, before we get to your accident, let me talk to you about your medical history. Do you have any medical conditions?
- A. I have a series of medical conditions. I have hypertension. I also have anxiety. I also have high blood pressure, and I take a series of medicines as well, which they have side effects, like dizziness, shortness of breath --
 - Q. Let me stop you there.
- 11 A. Uh-huh.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

17

- Q. Let me ask you: Let's start with high blood pressure. What medication do you take with high blood pressure?
- A. For the high blood pressure, I take the Bystolic, the 5 milligrams.
 - Q. How many times a day?
 - A. I take that one at night.
- 19 Q. Okay. How much do you take?
- A. How much I take?
- 21 O. Correct.
- 22 A. I take one pill every night.
- Q. Now, anxiety, what do you take for that?
- 24 A. I take the Hydroxyzine, and it is
- 25 | 25 milligrams. And I take that during the day.

- 1 Just any time during the day? Q. 2 Α. In the morning. 3 Okay. Now, the hypertension, what do you take 0. 4 for that? 5 Α. The hypertension, I take the Clonazepam. 6 O. How many times do you take that? 7 I take that one at night. Α. 8 Q. Okay. How many milligrams? 9 That one's 10 milligrams. No. That one is 1 Α. 10 milligram. 11 Ο. Okay. What are the side effects of that medication? 12 l 13 The side effects for the Clonazepam is -- the Α. 14 symptoms of urination, constant urination, also 15 dizziness, blurriness and speech -- those are the 16 symptoms on that one. 17 Okay. Now, when do you take that? Ο. 18 I take that every night. 19 Do you take it -- what time at night? Before 20 you go to bed or when? 21 I take it at -- right before bedtime. Α. Now, what is the affects if you take this 22 Q. 23 medication with alcohol?
- A. You cannot take alcohol before you take the Clonazepam because that's as per -- the psychiatrist

recommended that. You could go into a cardiac arrest if you take any kind of alcohol four hours prior to taking this medication.

- Q. So, you cannot take alcohol four hours prior to?
 - A. Correct.

- Q. Okay. There's been a lot of talk about your glasses. How long have you worn glasses?
 - A. Since I was five years old.
 - Q. Do you wear contacts or just always glasses?
- A. I have always worn glasses. On my driver's license, it says that I wear glasses. And, you know, you are asking about the glasses. During the accident that happened, the -- when the airbags deployed, they broke my glasses and, you know, I didn't find them.
- Q. Let me stop you there. Okay. So, tell the jury what happens when you don't have your glasses? What are the effects?
- A. I can't see clearly. I see blurry. I -- my balance is not where it should be. I see darker when I'm not wearing my glasses.
 - Q. Okay. Now, you've seen yourself on that video, correct?
 - A. Correct.
- Q. And you didn't have your glasses?

1 A. No. 2 Did that affect the way that you performed on 3 those field sobriety tests? 4 Α. Yes. 5 Q. All right. Let me bring you -- let's talk 6 about July (sic) 18 of 2015, okay? Let's start from 7 when you woke up. 8 Α. Okay. 9 What time did you wake up? Q. 10 You are asking me about --Α. 11 THE COURT: You said "July". Do you mean 12 January? 13 MR. GUERRA: I do, Your Honor. I'm very 14 tired. I'm sorry. 15 THE COURT: That's all right. 16 Q. (BY MR. GUERRA) January 18, 2015, what time did 17 l you wake up? 18 Α. Well, as I was -- I had just recently moved 19 here from Pasadena, from New York. I did not know the 20 city here in Houston. My phone had died on the --21 Q. Let me stop you. Okay. Are you a little 22 nervous? 23 Yeah, a little. Α. 24 Okay. It's okay. So we're talking about the Q. 25 day of the accident, January 18, 2015. Do you remember

that day? 1 2 Α. Yes. 3 Okay. So, let's talk about from the very Q. 4 beginning, okay? From what time did you wake up? 5 Okay. On the accident, when I was driving on 6 I-45 North, I woke up in the accident. 7 Hold on. Ο. 8 Α. Okay. Okay. Now I understand the question. 9 Maybe I'm just not asking the question Q. 10 correctly. 11 Okay. On January 18, the day of the 12 accident, where were you living? 13 I was living in Katy, Texas. Α. 14 With who? O. 15 With my sister. Α. 16 Q. Okay. On that day, what time did you wake up? 17 Α. Now I understand the question. Sorry. I woke 18 up at 7:00 o'clock in the morning. I started working 19 for my sister that owns a reception hall, and I was 20 working my whole entire day. 21 Okay. What kind of things were you doing? Ο. 22 Α. I was basically running errands, getting 23 prepared for an event that was going to happen that

weekend; and, you know, I had had a long day. I was

24

25

really tired.

- Q. Well, what kind of things were you doing? Tell the jury what you were doing.
- A. I was basically ordering flowers, getting arrangements for the hall, getting the caterers ready for the event, making sure that everything was set up for the hall day. I was working many hours with my sister when --
 - Q. Well, how big of an event was it?
- A. She usually has about 2,000 people, anywhere from 15 to 2500 people every weekend in her hall.
 - Q. Is this event center in Katy?
- 12 A. The what?

- Q. Where is the event center?
- A. She owns LaraUda Ballroom in Katy.
- Q. Okay. So, what time did you finish helping your sister set up that event?
 - A. I had finished like at 7:00 p.m., and I -- some friends from the valley that went to --
 - Q. Okay. Let's talk about that. Okay. So tell me about your friends from the valley.
 - A. Okay. I happened to know that friends from the valley were here in town; and they were meeting at one of my friends' house in Pasadena. So, we decided to get-together over there. They were going to have a barbecue since they were celebrating my coming to Texas

```
1
   back. Then we started barbecuing.
2
       Q.
           Let me stop you there. What time did you get
3
   over -- what's your friend's name? What time did you
4
   get over to his house?
5
            My friend's name is Carlos. I arrived at their
       Α.
6
   house around 7:00 o'clock.
7
            7:00 p.m.?
       Q.
8
       Α.
            Yes, right after I finished work.
9
            What time did y'all start barbecuing?
       Q.
10
            They had already started barbecuing by the time
11
   I got there. They started around 6:00, so I arrived
12
   there around 7:00, after I had completed working with my
13
   sister.
14
       Ο.
            What were y'all barbecuing?
15
            They had fajitas. They had chicken fajitas.
       Α.
16
   They had pico de gallo, quacamole.
17
            Did you help prepare any of the food?
       0.
18
                 MS. HAYNES: I'm sorry. May I interrupt
19
   for a moment, Your Honor?
20
                 THE COURT:
                              I'm sorry. What did you say?
21
                 MS. HAYNES: May I interrupt for a moment?
22
                 THE COURT: Yes.
23
                 MS. HAYNES: May we approach?
24
                 THE COURT:
                              Yes.
25
                  (At the Bench)
```

```
1
                               Judge, I just realized that
                  MS. HAYNES:
2
   nobody invoked the Rule at the beginning of the trial,
3
   and I'm not sure who that gentleman is. You're not
4
   calling him?
5
                  MR. GUERRA: I won't do that to you.
6
                  THE COURT: All right. Issue solved.
7
                  MS. HAYNES: Thank you.
8
                  (Jury present)
9
            (BY MR. GUERRA) Okay, Jose. At the barbecue,
       Q.
10
   you are having chicken fajitas, pico de gallo. Did you
11
   help prepare the barbecue?
12
       Α.
            I helped for a little bit.
13
            What kind of things were you doing?
       Q.
14
            Well, I was doing the pico de gallo and, you
       Α.
15
   know, flipping the meat on the grill and, you know,
16
   getting the -- everything prepared for the evening.
17
            Okay. What time did you guys have dinner?
       Ο.
            8:30, 9:00.
18
       Α.
19
            Okay. Now, while you were preparing, helping
       Ο.
20
   prepare the barbecue, the fajitas, the pico de gallo,
   did you have anything to drink?
21
22
       Α.
            When I arrived there, I had one beer. I had a
23
   Corona.
24
       Q.
            Okay. What size beer?
25
            A regular Corona Extra.
       Α.
```

- 1 Q. Bottle or can?
- A. Bottle.
 - Q. What time was this?
- 4 A. This was around 7:15, 7:30.
 - Q. Did you have anything to drink at dinner?
- 6 A. No.

3

5

7

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

- Q. Did you have anything to drink after dinner?
- 8 A. No.
 - Q. What time was -- what time did you and Carlos and -- who else was at the house?
 - A. It was like three or four friends of mine from the valley that were here in town, and we were just there at Carlos' house, when we met up.
 - Q. Tell the jury how you know these people, how you met them, how long you've known them and where in the valley they are from.
 - A. I met the people that I know from McAllen. I graduated with these people. I had just met up with them here because they were in town in Houston at the same time that they invited me to meet up with them, you know, at a house in Pasadena. You know, they invited me for this cookout that they were going to be having for me.
- Q. So, how long have you known Carlos and his friends in Pasadena?

A. Since elementary.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

16

17

18

19

24

- Q. How did you get in contact with Carlos and other friends through -- how did you get in contact with them?
- A. They Facebooked me or friends of friends gave me their numbers, and then I contacted them. I knew that they now live in Houston. When I came back to Houston, I looked them up; and I got in contact with them and --
- Q. So how long had this barbecue dinner -- how long had it been planned?
- A. Like maybe four days. I mean, that week that I called them, they said, Oh, so and so is here. So and so is here. So and so is here. Do you want to meet up with us?

And I said, "Yeah."

- Q. Well, let's be a little more specific. "So and so"? Are you talking about the same friends? Who are you talking about?
- A. The friends that we were going to meet up at that gathering, yes.
- Q. Okay. So, what time did you guys finish dinner?
 - A. Like 10:00 o'clock.
- Q. Okay. What did you do after 10:00 o'clock?

- A. We were just catching up with old times, with friends. We were just chatting and laughing about good ole times when we were kids.
 - Q. Now, after 10:00 o'clock, did you have anything to drink?
 - A. No.

4

5

6

7

8

- Q. Do you remember what time you left?
- A. I left their house around 1:45.
- 9 Q. Okay. Now, how did you get to their house?
- 10 Did you use the GPS system?
- 11 A. Yes, I used the GPS system.
- Q. Now, do you have a GPS system in your car? Or what kind of GPS system were you using?
- A. I was using the Google Maps on my iPhone. And actually on my way back, my phone went completely dead and that's where I got lost going north on I-45.
- Q. Where was your phone charger?
- A. I didn't have one that day. I had left it in the other vehicle that we use for the company.
- 20 Q. Okay. So, you left at 1:45?
- A. Correct.
 - Q. What time did your phone go off?
- A. I didn't hear the question. Sorry.
- Q. I'm sorry. What time did your phone go off or die?

```
1
            My charger -- my phone went off around 1:25,
2
   1:30. It was shortly after that I got lost here, since
3
   I didn't know the streets coming -- being here for two
4
   weeks, coming back from New York.
5
           All right. Well, let's -- you said you left at
       Ο.
   1:45, correct?
6
7
       Α.
           Correct.
8
            So your phone died before you left?
9
            No. My phone died around 2:20. I didn't mean
       Α.
10
   1:20. I'm sorry. 2:20.
11
             So, that was a mistake when you said 1:20?
       Q.
12
       Α.
            Correct.
13
       Q.
            Now, do you remember -- at that time you had
14
   been here, for how long?
15
            Like -- I had just recently changed my license
       Α.
16
   to --
17
            How long had you been in Houston?
       O.
18
       Α.
            Two weeks.
19
            And in those two weeks, how were you getting
       Ο.
20
   around Houston? Were you using GPS?
21
       Α.
            GPS, correct.
22
            Okay. So, your phone went off at about 2:20.
       Q.
23
   What happened after that?
24
       Α.
            Well, when I got lost, I had -- I was so tired
25
   from my day that shortly after, like 2:32, I -- or
```

around -- between 2:30 to 2:40 I had had the accident. I fell asleep on the road when I had the accident. And then when I woke up from the accident, I instantly took control of the vehicle to not damage or hurt anyone. I took control of the vehicle because the vehicle was spinning. In the midst of all of that, the bags deployed on me; and I, as I said, took control of the vehicle, got the vehicle to the side of the road. And at that point I was -- I couldn't call the police. So the police arrived.

- Q. Let me stop you there.
- 12 A. Uh-huh.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

13

18

19

20

21

22

- Q. I'm going to try to do this in question, okay?
- 14 A. Okay.
- |15| Q. Just try to answer the question that I ask.
- 16 So, before you left Carlos' house, did you have anything to drink?
 - A. No. I didn't have to drink because when I go to bed, I take the Clonazepam and the Bystolic; and you cannot have -- especially with a Clonazepam, you cannot have any kind of alcohol four hours prior to your -- to you going to bed with those medications.
 - Q. Did you have anything to drink in the car?
- 24 A. No.
- Q. Okay. So, we are talking about the accident.

Let's just talk about the accident itself, okay? What do you remember about the accident?

- A. Well, when I was -- when the accident happened, I know I had fell asleep on the vehicle. Then I instantly woke up in the accident, and I saw myself that the car was flipping. And then at that point I instantly reacted and took control of the vehicle to get it to the side of the road and not to hit any barriers or anything. And then I pretty much just got it to the side of the road until --
- Q. All right. Now you said "flipping." Do you mean the car flipped or was spinning?
- A. Spinning.

- Q. Okay. And that's what you remember, the car was spinning, not flipping?
- A. The car was not flipping. The car was spinning like it was going, you know --
- Q. Now when the car came to a stop, what do you remember then?
- A. Well, once the bags deployed, like on a Jetta which is a very safe car -- and luckily it was already on the side of the road. Actually, the -- you know, the mother collapses and like the car crunches up like an accordion. So, I mean, the car was no longer movable or able to continue operating after that point.

- 1 How do you know that? Q. 2 I know that because I used to sell Jettas. Α. 3 used to work at the Volkswagon store in the Valley when 4 I was younger, and I know the safetyness (sic) of the cars and what it has and entails and all that. 5 6 MR. VAZQUEZ: Your Honor, may I take the 7 witness on voir dire as to his qualifications as to the 8 safety of the vehicle? 9 THE COURT: Not right now. You may ask 10 him those questions on cross-examination. 11 MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you, Your Honor. 12 Ο. (BY MR. GUERRA) Just to be fair, how long ago 13 did you sell those Jettas? 14 Α. About six years ago. 15 Okay. And how long did you work there? Ο. 16 Α. Two years. 17 All right. Let's continue with the accident, Ο. 18 okay? 19 Α. Okay. 20 Q. So, the car is stopped. How long does it take for officers to get to you? 21
 - Q. Now, when they arrived, where are you?

They arrived about five minutes after the

22

23

24

Α.

accident.

25 A. I was really shook up in the driver's side,

waiting for assistance of the police officers to arrive at the scene, after my phone was since -- you know, able to call or anything like that. And I was -- I couldn't hold my urine. I don't know if that had to do -- you know, until they got there and then pretty much when they got me right away, took me into the police car. They didn't ask too much.

- Q. Tell me what you felt when the airbags deployed.
- A. When the airbags deployed, well, for one, it broke my glasses. They were in the car broken. I found them later on when I went to take out everything at the Kingwood Collision. I mean, I felt you know, hurt from them, like it hit me and --
 - Q. Where did they hit you?

- A. They hit me right in the face.
- Q. Was there any dust or particles that came out of the car -- or the airbags, sorry?
- A. Well, the radio, as you can see on the pictures that you have, everything was broken. So like the -- when the airbags deployed, you know, that's when the car was crashed and, you know --
- Q. Well, do you remember whenever the airbags went off, if there was dust, if there was smoke or anything like that?

- A. There was dust. There was smoke. There was --
- Q. Did any of that get in your eyes?
- A. A little bit, like the smoke that was coming out.
 - Q. Right.

- A. It did like, you know, coming into the car.
- Q. Okay. Now you talked about not being able to hold your urine.
 - A. Correct.
 - Q. How did that make you feel?
- A. It made me feel disgusted, you know, with having urinated in my car. I felt dizzy. I felt disoriented. I felt unbalanced. I felt --
- Q. So, when the officers got there, tell me what happened. Tell the jury what happened.
- A. When the officers got there, I needed assistance to go to like the hospital. They never told me at the scene that -- is there something hurting on you? Is everything okay? How do you feel? Nothing like that.

I was -- I feel that the police is here to serve the people. But, I mean, I didn't feel that way.

I felt that they didn't have any assistance for me, knowing that I was dizzy. I had a headache. I had -- I was shook up. I was --

- Let me stop you. Did the officers ask you if Q. you had a headache? Did they ask you any of those questions?
 - Α. No.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

21

22

23

- Did the officers make any comments about you Ο. urinating on yourself?
 - They didn't say anything about me urinating. Α.
- Ο. Did they -- do you remember them saying that they could smell it or anything like that?
 - Α. No, they didn't say that.
- Okay. So, what happens when they take you out Ο. 12 of the car?
 - When they take me out of the car, they put me Α. in a police car with the first officer that was here, and then they take me to the side. They did like a --
 - Q. Let me stop you. When they take you out of the car, do they handcuff you?
 - Α. Yes.
 - They put you in one car? Ο.
- 20 Α. Correct.
 - How long were you in that car? Ο.
 - Α. For like five minutes, until they got me to the other car.
 - So, then they take you to another car? Q.
- 25 Α. Yes.

Q. So, when you are in the first car or the second car, did any E.M.S. or fire department people, did anybody come up to you and ask you any questions?

- A. When -- they had the fire department checking on the car with a fire, with the smoke and all of that. They did not offer any kind of assistance to perform on me, to see if I was okay.
- Q. So, you heard Officer Gillham on the stand say that he believed that E.M.S. or the fire department came and talked to you and asked you if you were in need of medical attention. Is that accurate?
- A. No. E.M.S. was not there. The fire department was there to perform duties as far as the fires and that of the car.
- Q. So, nobody from the fire department -
 THE COURT: Just for clarification, when you say "E.M.S. was not there," you didn't see an ambulance there?

THE WITNESS: There was no ambulance.

- Q. (BY MR. GUERRA) So, did anybody from the fire department come over to car number one or car number two?
 - A. It was a single-car accident. But it was --
- Q. I'm sorry. What I meant is police car number one or police car number two.

- A. Oh, okay. Okay. I saw the fire department there to check for the fire.
- Q. I want you to tell the jury if anybody from the fire department, while you were there, ever came over to you and asked you any questions about how you felt, if you needed assistance or anything of that nature?
 - A. They didn't perform none of that, no.
 - Q. Okay. So, you're transported to Central Intox?
- A. Yes.

- Q. Do you remember how long that took?
- A. Well, when they transferred me from that car to the other car, then they just talked to me like for three minutes; and then they just took me straight into Central Intox. That's it.
- Q. Okay. Let's talk about the police station.

 All right? Now, you saw -- you've seen the video,

 correct?
 - A. Correct.
 - Q. Well, before I -- let me ask you one final question about the accident, okay?
- 21 A. Uh-huh.
 - Q. Three officers came in here and testified about the accident. Did any one of those officers ask you any questions about were you injured, were you hurt, do you have a headache, were you dizzy, or anything of that

1 | nature?

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

- A. No.
- Q. All right. Let's go to the police station. Do you remember how long it took to get from the accident to the police station?
 - A. I want to say like 20 minutes.
- Q. Now, I know this seems like a silly question; but did you have anything to drink while you were in the police cars?
 - A. In the police car, no. That -- no.
- Q. Okay. So, you get to the police station. Tell the jury what happens the moment you get there and walking out to Central Intox where we see the video?
- A. When I got off at the police department, I was walking into the -- and I needed to use the restroom. They did not allow me to use the restroom. So, I urinated myself again, and then they took me into the Intox room and they started performing this test. At that point, I was not --
- Q. Let me stop you real quick. So, when you walked from the police car into the police station --
 - A. Correct.
- 23 0. -- are you handcuffs?
- 24 A. Yes.
- Q. Now I just want to be clear. You said you

```
1
   urinated on yourself again?
2
       Α.
            Correct.
3
            Now, was that what we see on the video or was
       Ο.
4
   that before the video?
5
       Α.
            That was before the video. And then in there,
6
   I knew they were not going to let me use the restroom so
7
   I -- you know, I just urinated on myself again.
8
       O.
            So, it wasn't two times. It was three times?
9
            Three times, yeah.
       Α.
10
            Okay. Let's talk about the second time. How
11
   did that make you feel?
12
       Α.
            It made me feel that they are not here to serve
13
   you. I mean, they are -- they are not here to help you
14
   with the series of events in the order in which
   everything transpired. It was just not right. It was
15
16
   not professional. It was not something that people that
17
   are in public service should do.
18
                 MR. GUERRA: I will have to object, Your
19
   Honor.
           That's narrative.
20
                 THE COURT: Sustained.
21
            (BY MR. GUERRA) Let's try to break it up, okay?
       O.
22
       Α.
            Uh-huh.
23
            Now, did you urinate on yourself because you
24
   had way too much to drink?
```

25

Α.

No.

- Q. Was it because of your medicine or the accident?
- A. Well, on the Clonazepam, that's one of the symptoms that it has that you urinate, yes.
- Q. Okay. Well, has this -- have you ever -- before this accident, have you ever urinated on yourself like you did on this night?
- A. No, because every time that I need to go to the restroom, I will end up stopping at a gas station and go to the restroom. This time it happened when I had the accident. I couldn't move anymore. I was in a car accident. I was not in a situation where I can say, Oh, let me walk to a restroom or anything like that.
- Q. Okay. And, what, you asked to go to the restroom? Is that on video? Or is that outside the videoed room?
 - A. They didn't have that on video, no.
 - Q. Okay. Let's talk about when you get to the video room. Okay?
- 20 A. Yes.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

17

18

19

21

22

- Q. How many doors can you go in and out of?
- A. It was one door.
 - O. Can you describe the room for me?
- A. It was four walls. It was like a 12-by-12 room. Basically they had the machine on the corner.

They had like the lines where you had to do like the walking test that they do and the -- and all that. But it was not a very -- it's probably a 12-by-12 room.

Q. Cold or hot?

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

14

15

16

17

18

19

22

23

24

- A. It was pretty cold.
- Q. Really cold or very cold?
- A. To me it was cold, very cold.
- Q. Okay. Now, there was -- how many offices were in that room?
 - A. There was three officers.
- Q. Now -- and we can see it on the video -- more than one officer was giving you instructions?
- A. Correct.
 - Q. How many officers were giving you instructions?
 - A. Well, the officers were giving me different tests at, you know, at different times. Like, when I was taking the test, I had that officer that was taking the breath test. The other one was doing the line. You know, the other one was --
- Q. Well, tell the jury: Was that confusing to you? Did that confuse you a little bit?
 - A. Well, at that time I was very upset with everything that was going on, especially how I was treated at the scene. And I was very disappointed with everything that was going on and how they didn't even

```
1
   give me a chance to explain myself, how they did not ask
2
   me if I needed any kind of medical help. I had like a
   big headache that night. I was dizzy. I was
3
   unbalanced. I was slurring which is actually part of
5
   the -- the slurring is also part of the medication that
6
   I take.
7
                 MR. VAZQUEZ: Objection, Your Honor,
8
   narrative.
9
                 THE COURT: Sustained.
10
       Ο.
            (BY MR. GUERRA) Let's try to break it up,
11
   okay --
12
       Α.
            Uh-huh.
13
       Q.
            -- to when you are in that room. Okay?
14
            Uh-huh.
       Α.
15
            Explain to the jury, explain to them how that
       Ο.
16
   made you feel?
17
            It made me feel really bad that -- you know,
       Α.
18
   you are in a place. It's a police department, and they
19
   don't even let you use the restroom. It's just not
20
   right.
21
                 MR. VAZQUEZ: Objection, Your Honor,
22
   relevance.
23
                 THE COURT: Sustained.
24
            (BY MR. GUERRA) Did these officers ever tell
       Q.
25
   you that you were free to leave at any point?
```

A. No.

- Q. Now, there when you were in the video room at Central Intox, did those police officers ever tell you that you could refuse to do any tests?
- A. They didn't tell me that I could refuse to do any tests, no.
- Q. Okay. Now, you didn't have your glasses with you, correct?
 - A. Yes. I didn't have my glasses.
- Q. I may have already asked you this. But did that in any way affect your ability to do those tests?
 - A. Yes.
- Q. Now, you've talked about headaches and dizziness. Did that happen because of the accident or why did that happen?
- A. It could have been a combination of both, the medications and also the accident. With being so shook up and --
- Q. Well, let me ask you questions about your medication. Did you take any medication before you got in the car?
- A. I didn't take any medications until I got home.

 Because you cannot drive with those kind of medications

 because it gets you drowsy, gets you --
- Q. So, it's very important. Tell this jury about

```
1
   when -- did you take medications before you drove that
2
   night?
3
       Α.
            No.
4
            Are you sure about that?
       Q.
5
            I take medications every day, but I didn't take
       Α.
6
   any that night. I took in the morning.
7
            Okay. So, before you drove, before your
       Ο.
8
   accident, did you take any medications?
9
       Α.
            No.
10
            Now, in the video, we see officers asking you
       O.
11
   for a breath test. Do you remember that?
12
       Α.
            Yes.
13
       Q.
            And did you agree to give a breath test?
14
            Yes, because I felt that I didn't have anything
       Α.
   to hide.
15
16
       Q.
            Why did you feel that way?
17
            Because one beer at 7:00 o'clock in the
       Α.
   afternoon and being -- leaving, having an accident at
18
19
   2:30 in the morning doesn't feel like you have any kind
20
   of alcohol in your system.
            All right. So we've seen the results of this
21
       Ο.
22
   breath test. Do you think they are accurate?
23
       Α.
            No.
24
                  MR. GUERRA: I will pass the witness.
25
                  THE COURT: Mr. Vazquez.
```

```
1
                  MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you, Your Honor.
2
                       CROSS-EXAMINATION
3
   BY MR. VAZQUEZ:
4
             I need some clarification here because I'm
5
   totally confused. So, you are saying that the drugs
6
   make you urinate yourself, correct?
7
             The Clonazepam.
       Α.
8
       O.
            Yes or no, sir?
9
            Yes.
       Α.
10
             You are saying that the drugs make you dizzy?
       O.
11
       Α.
            Some --
12
       Q.
            Yes or no, sir?
13
            Yes, they do.
       Α.
14
       O.
            And u said the drugs make you drowsy, correct?
15
            Yes, they do.
       Α.
16
       Q.
            You are saying all of these things that the --
17
             The ones that made me --
       Α.
18
             I'm sorry, sir. I'm asking the question.
       Q.
19
                  MR. GUERRA: I would ask the State allow
20
   to witness answer his question.
21
                  THE COURT: Well, he didn't ask the
22
   question. Go ahead.
23
             (BY MR. VAZQUEZ) All of these things that the
24
   officers testified to, that you were off balance, that
25
   you were unable to maintain your balance on the one-leg
```

```
1
   stand, that you did not follow directions, that you
2
   urinated yourself, all of these are symptoms of your
3
   medications, correct?
4
       Α.
             Yes.
5
        Ο.
             And you just told us you didn't take any
6
   medication that day, correct?
7
             I take medication.
       Α.
8
        O.
             Yes or no, sir?
9
             I take -- I did not -- I took medications in
       Α.
10 l
   the morning, yes.
11
       Ο.
             Yes or no?
12
       Α.
             Yes.
13
             Were you taking your medications that day?
       Q.
14
       Α.
             Yes.
15
             In the morning?
        Q.
16
       Α.
             I take them at the time that I am supposed to
17 l
   take the medications.
18
       Q.
             And you are telling us that you are not
19
   supposed to drive after taking those medications,
20
   correct?
             Well, I didn't take my --
21
       Α.
22
       Q.
             Yes or no, sir?
23
             I didn't take my --
        Α.
24
        Q.
             Yes or no, sir?
25
                  THE COURT: Hold on.
```

```
1
            Can I explain how I take my medications and --
       Α.
2
                 THE COURT: Mr. Garcia, hold on. So it
3
   has to be in question-answer form. If your lawyer needs
4
   to clarify anything, he is going to have the opportunity
5
   to do that. Okay? So, if you can listen to the
6
   question that's being asked and do your best to answer
7
   that particular question.
8
                 THE WITNESS: Okay.
9
                 THE COURT: What is your question, sir?
                                                           Ι
10
   think it was: Did you take your medicine in the
11
   morning?
12
       0.
            (BY MR. VAZQUEZ) Did you take your medication
13
   that morning?
14
       Α.
            Yes.
15
            And you just told us that you are not supposed
       Ο.
16
   to drive when you take those medications, correct?
17
            You are not supposed to take certain
       Α.
   medications. The one that I take in the morning has
18
19
   nothing to do with the ones that --
20
                 MR. VAZQUEZ: Objection, nonresponsive.
21
                 THE COURT: Overruled. The one you take
22
   in the morning, what?
23
                 THE WITNESS: I take --
24
                  THE COURT: Just finish your sentence.
25
   The one in the morning has nothing to do with --
```

- A. -- with not being able to drive.
- Q. (BY MR. VAZQUEZ) Okay. So, the ones -- you just told us the medications you take in the morning make you dizzy, drowsy; and you are not supposed to drive. That's what you testified on direct.

MR. GUERRA: That's not accurate, Your Honor. That is a misrepresentation of the testimony.

Q. (BY MR. VAZQUEZ) When your counsel asked you if the medications make you dizzy or drowsy, you answered yes, correct?

THE COURT: Just rephrase your question.

- A. Every medication has different side effects. The one that I take in the morning, you are able to drive. The ones that you take at night, those are the ones that you cannot drive, which those are the ones that I was going to take whenever I got to my house.
 - Q. But you hadn't taken those?
 - A. No.

- Q. But you are not supposed to drink alcohol before you take those, right?
 - A. Absolutely.
- Q. But you just testified that between 7:00 and 2:30 in the morning, you felt that all of the alcohol was out of your system?
- A. You can take the alcohol four hours before the

```
1
   medication.
2
             Right. But you said between 7:00 and 2:30 in
3
   the morning, you felt that all of the alcohol was out of
4
   your system, correct?
5
       Α.
             Yes.
6
       Ο.
             So, that means you had been drinking that
7
   night?
8
       Α.
             I had one beer, yes.
9
            One beer?
       Q.
10
       Α.
             Yes.
11
             Now, during the night in question, you told the
       Q.
12
   police officers that you didn't have anything to drink?
13
             There's -- I told the officers that I had had
       Α.
14
   one drink in the afternoon.
15
       Ο.
             You've been here in the entire trial, correct?
16
       Α.
             Correct.
17
             And you've seen all of the officers testify,
       O.
18
   correct?
19
             And they testified differently. The first one
       Α.
20
   testified that --
21
       Q.
            I -- may I --
22
       Α.
             Yes.
23
            Can you just say yes or no? Did you see all of
24
   the officers testify in this trial or not? Yes or no?
25
       Α.
             Yes.
```

- 1 And any of those officers admit or say that, in Q. 2 fact, you had told them you had anything to drink? 3 Α. Yes. 4 They did? Ο. 5 One of them said, Yes. The other one said, No; 6 and the other one said, No. 7 Okay. And the police report that was written 0. 8 says in here, Suspect stated that he did not have 9 anything to drink tonight. 10 MR. VAZQUEZ: Objection, Your Honor. 11 Counsel is reading from a document that is not in 12 evidence. 13 THE COURT: Sustained. 14 (BY MR. VAZQUEZ) The officers wrote in the Ο. 15 police report that you hadn't had anything to drink and 16 they came in here and testified to that fact? 17 MR. GUERRA: Same objection. 18 THE COURT: Sustained. 19 (BY MR. VAZQUEZ) Okay. So, you are saying four Ο. 20 officers came in here, correct? 21 Three. Α. 22 Q. I counted four. Morales, Parker, Gillham, and 23 Carroll? 24
 - Α. And Carroll, yeah.

And Carroll was the first one on the scene? Q.

```
1
       Α.
            Correct.
2
            He testified that you told him you hadn't had
3
   anything to drink?
4
                  MR. GUERRA: That is actually a
5
   misrepresentation of the testimony, Your Honor.
6
                  THE COURT: Overruled.
7
             (BY MR. VAZQUEZ) Did he say that -- whether or
       0.
8
   not you had told him you had anything to drink?
9
       A. I had told them I had had one drink at 7:00
10
   o'clock, yes.
11
            I'm asking you if you had told him -- if he had
       Q.
12
   told us -- never mind.
13
                  So, Officer Parker came in here and
14
   testified, correct?
15
       Α.
            Okay.
16
       Q.
            Yes?
17
            Yes, he did.
       Α.
18
       Q.
            Did you tell Officer Parker that you had had
19
   one drink?
20
       Α.
            He didn't ask that question.
21
            Did you tell Officer Gilham that you had one
       O.
22
   drink?
23
            He didn't ask that question.
       Α.
24
            Did you tell Officer Morales that you had one
       Q.
25
   drink?
```

```
1
            He didn't ask that question.
       Α.
2
                 THE COURT: Okay. Just listen to his
3
   question.
              Okay?
4
                 THE WITNESS: Uh-huh.
5
                 THE COURT: The last question was:
                                                      Did
6
   you tell Officer Morales that you had one drink? Yes or
7
   no? Not whether that question was asked. Did you tell
8
   Officer Morales that you had one drink?
9
            I told him I didn't have a drink.
       Α.
10
            (BY MR. VAZQUEZ) Okay. So, you are saying that
11
   one officer did come in here and said -- testified that
   you had a drink. Which officer was that?
12
13
            The second one.
       Α.
14
           Officer Parker?
       Ο.
            That's the one that said --
15
       Α.
16
            Okay. And I just asked you if you had told
17
   Officer Parker if you had a drink; and you told me, no,
18
   that he didn't ask that question. So, how can Officer
19
   Parker testify --
            I said that that's what he testified here. He
20
       Α.
21
   didn't ask me directly that question.
22
                 THE COURT: Okay. The jury has heard what
23
   the other witnesses have had to say. So, please ask
24
   this witness the questions that pertain to him.
```

Q. (BY MR. VAZQUEZ) Okay. So, obviously somebody

1 is lying. Correct? 2 Α. Lying about what? 3 Lying about you -- whether or not you told them 0. 4 you had a drink? 5 Well, with four different officers -- I mean, Α. 6 you know, with all of the commotion of being dizzy and 7 unstable and everything, I can't say that I remember 8 clearly everything that happened. 9 Q. Okay. So, you don't remember telling them that 10 you had a drink? 11 I remember telling the first officer that at 12 7:00 -- when I had started my day, I had had one drink, 13 yes. 14 But he's not the one that came in here and 0. 15 testified and said that you had a drink. 16 MR. GUERRA: Your Honor, that is a 17 misstatement of the facts presented before this jury. 18 THE COURT: Okay. Just move on, please. 19 (BY MR. VAZQUEZ) I guess my question is: You Ο. 20 lied to somebody, correct? 21 Α. I didn't lie to anybody. 22 Q. You didn't lie to the officers and you didn't 23 tell them you didn't have anything to drink?

I already reiterated this, that I told the

officer that I had had one drink at 7:00 o'clock. After

24

25

Α.

that, the rest of the officers did not ask that question.

Q. Okay. I'm still confused, but I will move on. I think I've covered my point.

Tell me, you said you have hypertension and high blood pressure. What's the difference?

- A. High blood pressure is when you have episodes of -- that your pressure can go up to 180, 190. It's a medical condition that you get diagnosed, and they give you medications so that you can take daily for -- to not go into like a heart attack. Because if you don't get medications for high blood pressure or you --
- Q. I'm sorry. Maybe I miss -- maybe you didn't understand my question. I want to know the difference between hypertension and high blood pressure. I know what they are. I want to know if you know what the difference is between those two.

MR. GUERRA: Your Honor, I would object to that question. He's not a medical doctor.

THE COURT: Overruled.

- A. I am not a medical doctor.
- Q. (BY MR. VAZQUEZ) But you've been diagnosed with these issues, correct?
 - A. Yes.

Q. And you don't know what they are?

```
1
            I am not a medical -- I'm not a doctor to
       Α.
2
   answer those questions. I know what the symptoms are.
3
   And I go through them every day. I do take medications
4
   for them, and I -- that's how I live my life, take those
5
   medications so that I can feel good.
                 THE COURT: Hold on. Mr. Garcia, what is
6
7
   your understanding of the difference?
8
       Α.
            Well, hypertension is when you are really hyper
9
   and you -- the psychiatrist gives you medication so that
10
   you can calm down. That's for hypertension. I mean, I
11
   take a series of medications, and each one has a
12
   different affect and it is medicine that a psychiatrist
13
   gives you to control you from a breakout or from a, you
   know, a cardiac -- because I have been at work sometimes
14
15
   and --
16
                 THE COURT: All right. And so you believe
17
   that to be different than high blood pressure?
18
                 THE WITNESS: Yes.
19
                 THE COURT: Just to clarify the record.
20
                 THE WITNESS: Yes.
21
                 THE COURT: Okay. Move on.
22
            (BY MR. VAZQUEZ) Okay.
                                     I guess my
23
   understanding is a little different.
24
                 MR. GUERRA: I'm going to object to the
25
   side-bar, Your Honor.
```

1 THE COURT: Sustained. 2 (BY MR. VAZQUEZ) The medication that you take 0. 3 at night, that's for the hypertension or the high blood 4 pressure? 5 A. At night I take the Bystolic for the high blood 6 pressure, and I take the Clonazepam for the 7 hypertension. 8 Q. And those are prescribed by medical doctors? 9 Α. By psychiatrists. 10 Both of them? 0. 11 Correct. Α. 12 O. So a psychiatrist is prescribing high blood 13 pressure medication? 14 The high blood pressure is -- I see a medical Α. 15 doctor, and I see a psychiatrist. You are correct. The 16 high blood pressure is a regular doctor. 17 And the Clonazepam is the one that causes urination, dizziness, blurry speech and speech 18 19 impediment? 20 Α. Correct. 21 O. Do you wear diapers? 22 Α. No. 23 Do you wear a catheter? O. 24 Α. No. 25 Do you have a problem with frequent Q.

1 urination --

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

11

12

13

15

16

17

18

21

22

23

24

- A. But I go to nearby restrooms to go and do that.
- Q. Ever been in a situation where there is not a nearby restroom?
- A. No. I always -- I have a house where I can go to the restroom. I work at a place where I can walk to the restroom that's in the next room. That's it.
 - Q. How did you move here from New York?
- A. How did I move here?
- 10 O. Uh-huh.
 - A. I moved here from -- I moved back home. I'm from McAllen. I just moved back.
 - Q. Did you drive?
- 14 A. Yes.
 - Q. And in your drive, there was never a spot across maybe Kentucky or Georgia or one of those longer states where, when you were driving across it, there was never -- not a rest area?
- A. There are rest areas and always convenient stores to stop by to go to the restroom.
 - Q. Okay. So, that day -- and I believe counsel misspoke, so I may -- correct me if I'm wrong, counsel. He asked you about January 18th, what time you woke up. But I believe that was the day of the accident, in the morning. So the accident would have been January 17th,

```
1
   correct?
2
       Α.
            Correct.
3
             So, on January 17th, you got up, went to work
4
   for your sister, right?
5
       Α.
            Correct.
6
       Ο.
             You were getting ready for a big event,
7
   2000-plus people?
8
       Α.
            Yes.
9
             You got there about what time in the morning?
       Q.
10
       Α.
             I did not get to my house back at night.
11
             No. No. What time did you get to the job in
       Q.
12
   the morning?
13
       Α.
             I started working at 7:00 o'clock.
14
            7:00 a.m.?
       Ο.
15
            Correct.
       Α.
16
       Q.
             So, you worked for 12 hours?
17
             Yes.
       Α.
18
             On a long day, big event, lots of people, you
19
   worked 12 hours?
20
       Α.
          Correct.
21
                  MR. GUERRA: That's asked and answered,
22
   Your Honor.
23
                  THE COURT: Sustained.
24
             (BY MR. VAZQUEZ) From there you drove to your
       Q.
25
   friend's house in Pasadena?
```

```
1
       Α.
             Correct.
2
       O.
             And that's when you had your one Corona?
3
       Α.
             Yes.
4
             Nothing else to unwind after your long,
       Q.
5
   stressful day?
6
       Α.
             No.
7
             Nothing else after all of the stress of dealing
       Ο.
8
   with 2000 people?
9
       Α.
             No.
10
             Nothing after having seen your friends for --
11
   you hadn't seen for years?
12
       Α.
            No, because I knew I had to drive all the way
13
   to Katy, and I wasn't about to do that. Plus, I knew
14
   that I had to take those two -- the medications that I
   tell you I can't drink within four hours.
15
16
       Q.
             Nothing since, you know, you started sitting
17
   and cooking? Nothing?
18
       Α.
             No.
19
             Nothing at dinner?
       Ο.
20
       Α.
             No.
21
             Nothing, you know, before you left?
       Ο.
22
       Α.
                  I already answered that, no.
23
             How do you explain the .14 alcohol content?
       O.
24
             How did I explain what?
       Α.
25
             The .14 alcohol content in your system.
       Q.
```

```
1
            Can you rephrase that question?
       Α.
2
                  MR. GUERRA: Judge, that calls for
3
   speculation on his part.
4
                  THE COURT: Overruled.
5
             (BY MR. VAZQUEZ) Explain to the jury since you
6
   hadn't had anything to drink at 7:00 p.m., 7:00 p.m. to
7
   2:30 a.m.
8
       Α.
            I already answered that question.
9
            You had nothing to drink?
       Q.
10
       Α.
            No.
11
            Then at 4:30 in the morning -- in the police
       Q.
12
   car -- your counsel asked you: Did you have anything to
13
   drink in the police car? Did you have anything to drink
14
   in the police car?
15
            No, I already answered that.
       Α.
16
       Q.
            Did you have mouthwash?
17
       Α.
            No.
18
       Q.
            Did they give you any lipstick?
19
       Α.
            No.
20
       Q.
             Then explain to the jury at approximately 4:30
21
   in the morning, nine hours later, after your first beer,
22
   one and only beer, that you had a .14 blood alcohol
23
   content.
24
             I don't know how to explain that because it
25
   could be a multiple of things. It could --
```

1 Thank you. Did the medication, the medication Q. 2 you take, cause your blood alcohol content to raise? 3 I'm not a doctor to answer that question. Α. 4 MR. VAZQUEZ: May I have a moment, Your 5 Honor? 6 THE COURT: Yes. 7 (BY MR. VAZQUEZ) Mr. Garcia, we've all seen the Ο. 8 video. You are pretty talkative in the video, correct? 9 Α. Yes. 10 Tell me, at what point in the video did you ask 11 the officers for medical assistance? 12 Α. At that time of the scene, which there is no 13 video there. 14 You asked him at the time of the scene? Ο. 15 Α. Yes. 16 Q. That's not what you said earlier. You said 17 that they didn't provide you any investigation. 18 I asked them. They didn't give me the Α. 19 assistance. That's what I said. 20 Q. Okay. I don't believe that's what you said. 21 MR. GUERRA: Objection to the side-bar, 22 Your Honor. 23 THE COURT: Sustained. 24 (BY MR. GUERRA) So, you don't remember Ο. 25 everything that happened that night, right?

- A. At that time of the accident, as I had said before, I was dizzy. I was disoriented. I was -- my vision was blurry and fuzzy. I was unbalanced, and I was -- at that point. Then gradually after, you know, I was coming back to the senses after a while. Then I was getting ahold of what was going on.
 - Q. What did you hit?
 - A. A barrier.
 - Q. A barrier?
- 10 A. Yes.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

14

19

- Q. And your car was spinning and spinning and spinning?
- 13 A. Yes.
 - Q. And then you were able to take control of it?
- A. Correct.
- Q. And then you were able to drive it to the shoulder?
- A. Correct.
 - Q. Yet you told your counsel that the vehicle was completely undriveable after the accident?
- 21 A. The car was completely undriveable --
- 22 Q. Yes.
- A. Let me finish answering the question. The car was completely non-drivable up to the point where the airbags deployed and it was on the side of the road.

```
1
                 MR. VAZQUEZ: Objection, nonresponsive,
2
   Your Honor.
3
                 THE COURT: Sustained.
4
            (BY MR. VAZQUEZ) Can you -- was the car -- you
5
   told your counsel that the car was not drivable,
6
   correct?
7
       Α.
            The car was not drivable after I took it to the
   side of the road.
8
9
       Q. But it was drivable to get it to the side of
10
   the road?
11
       A. It was -- as it was flipping and in the midst
12
   of the accident, it just happened to fall on the side --
13
   get it to the side of the road, when I took control of
   the vehicle to get it to the side of the road.
14
15
       Q. Okay. I'm confused because that's not what you
16
   just said. You said you were able to take --
17
                 THE COURT: Okay. Stay away from the
18
   side-bar.
19
                 MR. GUERRA: Objection. That's
20
   argumentative, Your Honor. That is exactly what he
21
   said.
22
                 THE COURT: Guys, the side-bar comments
23
   are unnecessary. Just make an objection, and I will
24
   rule on it if you have an objection that --
25
                 MR. GUERRA: It's argumentative, Your
```

```
1
   Honor.
2
                  THE COURT: That is sustained. Refrain
3
   from your side-bar, argumentative comments.
4
                  MR. VAZQUEZ: Yes, Your Honor.
5
             (BY MR. VAZQUEZ) Mr. Garcia, how long did you
       Ο.
6
   spend in jail?
7
            Six hours.
       Α.
8
       Ο.
            In those six hours, did you ask anybody for
9
   medical assistance?
10
            Yes, I did.
       Α.
11
            Were you given medical treatment?
       Q.
12
       Α.
            As soon as I walked into the jail, they
13
   actually administered medicine. You know, I didn't know
14
   that they could administer medicine if you were
15
   intoxicated. That's one thing I can say about that.
16
       Q.
            What did they administer medicine for?
17
       Α.
            For my high blood pressure going crazy then.
18
       Q.
            Did they do an evaluation on you?
19
            Evaluation? I don't know what they do -- what
       Α.
20
   the medical people there do. I don't know.
21
            How did they find out your blood pressure was
       Ο.
22
   high?
23
            Because they took vitals. I mean --
       Α.
24
             So, they did an evaluation?
       Q.
25
       Α.
            Yes.
```

- Q. They checked you out?
- A. Yes.

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

13

14

15

16

21

23

- Q. Did you tell them you were dizzy?
- A. I told them I was dizzy and I wasn't feeling good.
 - Q. Did they evaluate you for a concussion?
- A. They did not evaluate me for anything like that. Only for my -- they actually gave me pills to control my depression.
 - Q. Did they evaluate -- did they treat you for any injuries that you sustained in the accident?
- 12 A. No.
 - Q. Did you sustain any injuries in the accident?
 - A. I don't -- I didn't have no injuries. I had headaches. I had -- like I had mentioned all of the other things that I had previously said, yes.
- Q. But you didn't tell the medical staff that, yes, I told the medical staff there; and they didn't evaluate you for a concussion?
- 20 A. No.
 - Q. They just took your blood pressure?
- A. Yeah.
 - Q. Now, Mr. Garcia, how long have you had high blood pressure?
- A. About a year.

Q. About a year?

- A. Since last August.
- Q. Did you educate yourself on it?
- A. It happened to me at work one day that I was working, and I had to call the ambulance because my pressure had gone up to like 186 and -- they finally got my pressure down. And then as -- I just left that day from work; and when I left, I actually had to call an ambulance because I couldn't even drive. Then they tested and they diagnosed the fact that I had high blood pressure. Then they started treating that.
- Q. I'm sorry, I was asking for after the fact that you were diagnosed. Did you like read any materials or anything like that?
 - A. No. The doctor did that for me.
 - Q. He gave you some material to review?
- A. The doctor prescribed me medications, and they diagnosed me with that. I don't -- I didn't have any knowledge about that because I'm not a doctor.
- Q. Did he tell you any of the possible signs and symptoms that you should look for if your blood pressure gets high?
- MR. GUERRA: Your Honor, I'm going to object to relevance at this point.
- THE COURT: Sustained.

```
1
             (BY MR. VAZQUEZ) If I told you, would you have
       Q.
2
   any reason to disagree that headaches could result as a
3
   result of high blood pressure?
4
             Then again, I'm not a doctor to answer that.
       Α.
                                                            Ι
5
   have a multiple series of medical issues that I don't
6
   know what is -- what happens with what. I just know
7
   that I take medications for the three different items
8
   that I listed, as to what I had mentioned earlier and --
9
                  MR. VAZQUEZ: Objection, Your Honor,
10
   nonresponsive.
11
                  THE COURT: Sustained.
12
       O.
             (BY MR. VAZQUEZ) Mr. Garcia, my question was:
   Would you object -- would you have any reason to object
13
14
   if I told you that one of the -- let me see if I can
15
   rephrase it. Would you have any reason to disagree if I
16
   told you that blood pressure, headaches, could be as a
17
   result of high blood pressure?
18
                  MR. GUERRA: Objection as to -- I would
19
   think that --
20
                  MR. GUERRA: Objection as to it being
21
   speculation on the part of this witness.
22
                  THE COURT: Overruled. Based on his
23
   personal experience.
24
             (BY MR. VAZQUEZ) You may answer the question.
       Q.
```

I would think that you would get headaches with

25

Α.

```
1
   high blood pressure, yes.
2
            So, when you got to the jail, your blood
3
   pressure was extremely high, correct?
4
            Correct.
       Α.
5
           And, indeed, a stressful situation such as a
       Ο.
6
   car wreck would cause your car to -- I mean, I'm
7
   sorry -- a car wreck would cause your blood pressure to
8
   go up, correct?
9
                 MR. GUERRA: Your Honor, I'm going to --
10
   that's speculation on the part of this witness.
11
                  THE COURT: Sustained.
12
       Ο.
            (BY MR. VAZQUEZ) The year that you've had high
13
   blood pressure, during stressful situations, as a
   result, your blood pressure increased?
14
15
       Α.
            No.
16
       Q.
            You haven't felt your blood pressure increase
17
   in stressful situations?
18
                 MR. GUERRA: Asked and answered, Your
19
   Honor.
                  THE COURT: Sustained.
20
21
       O.
            (BY MR. VAZQUEZ) When you got to the police
22
   station, you said you had a headache, correct?
23
       Α.
            Yes.
24
            How long after you left -- what's it called --
       Q.
25
   Central Intox were you seen by medical personnel?
```

```
1
            Right after I got -- they took the -- right
       Α.
2
   after they did the Intox test and then I requested to
3
   see the medical staff there because I wasn't feeling
4
   good.
5
             So, immediately after the Central Intox --
       Q.
6
       Α.
            Correct.
7
            -- you asked for medical personnel?
       Ο.
8
       Α.
            Correct.
9
            And that's when they determined that your blood
       Q.
10
   pressure was high?
11
       Α.
             Yes.
12
       0.
             So, at the time -- would it be safe for me to
13
   say that at the time you were at Central Intox, your
14
   blood pressure was high?
15
                  MR. GUERRA: Objection to speculation,
16
   Your Honor.
17
                  THE COURT: Sustained.
18
            Would you disagree with me if -- let me see if
19
   I can --
20
                  (Sotto voce discussion off the record)
21
                  MR. VAZQUEZ: I will withdraw, Your Honor.
22
             (BY MR. VAZQUEZ) Mr. Garcia, do you have any --
       Q.
23
   do you have your prescriptions with you?
24
       Α.
             Yes, I do. The same bag that I had the day of
25
   the accident, I have the same --
```

```
1
                  THE COURT: You have answered his
2
   question, sir.
3
                  MR. VAZQUEZ: May we see those
4
   prescriptions?
5
                  THE WITNESS:
                                Sure.
6
                  MR. VAZQUEZ: I can bring it back to you
7
   if you are okay with that.
8
                  THE WITNESS: Yes.
9
                  MR. VAZQUEZ: May I approach, Your Honor?
10
                  THE COURT: Yes, you may.
11
             There's the Bastolic. That's the Hydroxyzine.
12
   And the Clonazepam I just left at home because that one
13
   I take at night.
14
             (BY MR. VAZQUEZ) So, there aren't any other --
15
            I just take the three. The Clonazepam, I take
16
   at night. And that one I have at the house.
17
            Which one do you take in the morning?
       Ο.
18
       Α.
            The Hydroxyzine.
19
            The Hydroxyzine. This is the Hydroxyzine right
       Ο.
20
   here.
21
            Yes. That is for anxiety.
       Α.
22
            Can you read what that label says right there?
       Q.
23
            Blurred vision.
       Α.
            Read the whole thing, please, sir.
24
       Q.
25
       Α.
            This medicine may cause blurred vision.
```

```
1
             And.
       Q.
2
             On this sticker, that's what it says.
3
             This sticker right here, the top, yellow one.
       Q.
4
   Are you having a difficult time seeing it?
5
             May --
       Α.
6
       Ο.
             If you would like, I can read it for you.
7
             Yeah.
       Α.
8
                  MR. VAZQUEZ: Would that be okay with you,
9
   counsel?
10
                  MR. GUERRA: I would object as to it being
11
   hearsay, Your Honor.
                  THE COURT: Overruled.
12
13
             (BY MR. VAZQUEZ) And you looked at it, correct?
       Q.
14
             Yes. It's very small.
       Α.
15
             I haven't altered it here since you looked at
       Ο.
16
   it?
17
             No.
       Α.
18
             May cause drowsiness. Alcohol may make it
19
   worse. Use care when operating a vehicle or machinery.
20
                  Would that be a fair and accurate
21
   representation of what that says?
22
       Α.
             That's what it says, yes.
23
             And you take that in the morning?
       Ο.
24
             Yes, because I need it for -- that's how the
       Α.
25
   doctor instructed for me to take it.
```

```
1
            But so it says it may cause drowsiness and take
       Q.
2
   care when operating a machinery?
3
                  MR. GUERRA: Object as to asked and
4
   answered, Your Honor.
5
                  THE COURT: Sustained.
6
       O.
             (BY MR. VAZQUEZ) So you take that in the
7
   morning, and you drive to work?
8
       Α.
            That's how I'm -- I have to take that
9
   medication, how it's instructed by the physician.
10
   That's how --
11
       Q.
            Objection, nonresponsive, Your Honor.
12
                  THE COURT: Sustained.
13
       Q.
             (BY MR. VAZQUEZ) And so you took that
14
   medication the morning of the accident, correct?
15
       Α.
            Yes.
16
       Q.
            Yet it tells you as a caution not to operate
17
   machinery, correct, a vehicle?
18
       Α.
            Many people take that medication like that.
19
            Objection, nonresponsive, Your Honor.
       Ο.
20
                  THE COURT: Sustained.
21
             (BY MR. VAZQUEZ) Does the medication warn you
       Ο.
22
   not to drive or -- let me rephrase that. Does the
23
   medication caution you against driving while taking this
24
   medication?
25
                  MR. GUERRA: Asked and answered, Your
```

```
1
   Honor.
2
                 THE COURT: Sustained.
3
                 THE WITNESS: So how do --
4
                 THE COURT: You don't have to answer that.
5
   Next question.
6
       Q. (BY MR. VAZQUEZ) Did you take anything else
7
   that day?
8
       Α.
           No. I only take what I am prescribed by the
9
   physician.
10
       O.
            Those are the only prescriptions you have?
11
       Α.
            Yes.
12
       Q.
            And yet --
13
                 (Sotto voce discussion off the record)
                 MR. VAZQUEZ: Nothing further, Your Honor.
14
15
                 MR. GUERRA: No more questions, Your
16
   Honor.
17
                 THE COURT: All right. Mr. Garcia, you
18
   may resume your seat, sir. Thank you.
19
                 THE WITNESS:
                                Thank you.
20
                 THE COURT: Mr. Guerrra. Anything else?
21
                 MR. GUERRA: No, Your Honor. Defense
22
   rests.
23
                 THE COURT: State, you rest and close?
24
                 MR. VAZQUEZ: Yes, Your Honor.
25
                 THE COURT: And you close your case as
```

```
1
   well; is that correct?
2
                 MR. GUERRA: Yes, Your Honor.
3
                  THE COURT: Ladies and gentleman, we are
4
   going to talk about the jury charge. So, if you will go
5
   with the bailiff, we will have you in here shortly.
                 THE BAILIFF: All rise.
6
7
                  (Jury leaves courtroom)
8
                 THE COURT: All right. Y'all may be
9
            Okay. So, Terri gave y'all the proposed
   seated.
10
   charge. We obviously will take out the part about
11
   failing to testify. Wait. Is that in here?
12
                 THE COURT REPORTER: Yes, ma'am.
13
                 THE COURT: All right. That comes out.
   Does either side have any objections, requests for
14
   admissions or deletions to the charge?
15
16
                 MR. VAZQUEZ: Your Honor, at this time the
17
   State would ask to track the 49.01 of the Penal Code,
   intoxication, 49.01 (12)(a), it says not having the
18
19
   normal use of mental or physical faculties by the reason
20
   of the introduction of alcohol, controlled substance, a
21
   drug, dangerous drug or a combination of the two of
22
   those substances or a .08.
23
                 MR. VAZQUEZ: The definition of
24
   intoxication is in here.
25
                 MR. VAZQUEZ: It doesn't --
```

```
1
                 THE COURT: Means not having the normal
2
   use of mental or physical faculties by the reason of the
3
   introduction of alcohol in the body.
                 MR. VAZQUEZ: But I would like that --
4
5
                 THE COURT: Okay. You would like to add a
6
   controlled substance, drug, a dangerous drug or
7
   combination of two or more substances?.
8
                 MR. VAZQUEZ: Yes, Your Honor.
9
                 THE COURT: What evidence do you have to
10
   support that?
11
                 MR. VAZQUEZ: The defendant just testified
121
   that he took the medication that day and the fact that
13
   that medication he read allowed does caution against
14
   driving for operating a vehicle when taking the
   medication.
15
                 THE COURT: Okay.
16
                                    That request is denied.
17
   Anything else?
18
                 MR. GUERRA: I would -- oh, I'm sorry.
19
                 THE COURT: Hold on. He's not done.
20
   Anything else?
21
                 MR. VAZQUEZ: And you said we are taking
22
   out the part -- obviously. All right. No, Your Honor.
23
                 THE COURT: Mr. Guerra.
24
                 MR. GUERRA: Yes, Your Honor. I would ask
25
   for the paragraph of alcohol concentration means grams
```

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

per liters, that paragraph to be removed along with the intoxicated means not having -- well, intoxication means the normal use of mental or physical faculties by reason of the introduction of alcohol into the body or having alcohol concentration of .08 or more, I would ask that for that paragraph to be removed because there's been no evidence before this honorable court that at the time Jose Garcia was above a .08. Obviously, the jury can take the results into consideration; but because there's no extrapolation evidence or factors, the State has not proven -- there's not a scintilla of evidence that at the time of operating he was above a .08. The test was taken two hours after the fact, Your Honor. Respectfully, I think it's appropriate to take that out. THE COURT: All right. This is a really common mistake. I don't mean you to do it in your argument. It's .08 or greater. MR. VAZQUEZ: You've said it five times. THE COURT: I know everybody does it. The prosecutors do it regularly. I anticipated that you were going to ask me that, so I did some research and the case that I found is a Court of Criminal Appeals case callws Kirsh and so it -- based on Kirsh your request will be denied. If you have any subsequent case law that supports your position, I will consider it; but

```
1
   that's a 2010 case; Guerra we read Guerrita because we
2
   anticipated this coming up. I think it's
3
   distinguishable from this set of facts and I -- I don't
4
   remember why but --
5
                 THE COURT: Let's that a short break
   because I need to use the restroom anyways and I will
6
7
   let you finish your part.
8
                 MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you, Your Honor.
9
                 THE COURT: Okay. We are back on the
10
   record to -- I will allow you to continue your argument.
11
                 MR. GUERRA: I don't have a great part,
12
   Your Honor.
                I think the State has a point in this case.
13
   I think that case has two different scenarios where it
14
   will be -- it would be accurate or appropriate to grant
15
   my request. However, if the Court is not inclined to
16
   grant my request, I would ask that the definition be
   more clear that the alcohol concentration of .08 or more
17
18
   is required at the time of operating the vehicle.
19
                 THE COURT: Okay. So what this
20
   instruction does is it -- it clearly says that they have
21
   to find that they are intoxicated, operating a motor
22
   vehicle while intoxicated, then it tasks the jury with
23
   looking at the definition of intoxication. Now, there
24
   is another charge that where the application spells out,
25
   like if you believe beyond a reasonable doubt that the
```

```
person was operating the motor vehicle in a public place
1
2
   while intoxicated, namely not having the normal use of
3
   Mental or -- and then it goes on to discuss normal use
4
   of physical or alcohol concentration of .08 or greater,
5
   then you will find the defendant guilty. So that's
6
   another option. So if you would prefer that, where it's
7
   spelled out in the application paragraph, we can do
8
   that. I am referring to the last paragraph on Page 1.
9
                 MR. GUERRA: Yes, Your Honor, if it's okay
10
   with the Court, I would prefer that.
11
                 THE COURT: All right. Now, other than
12
   the previous objections that I have already ruled on,
   are there any objections to the charge as it currently
13
14
   is from either side? State?
15
                 MR. VAZQUEZ: May I have just a moment,
16
   Your Honor?
17
                 THE COURT: Yes.
18
                 MR. VAZQUEZ: Nothing from the State, Your
19
   Honor.
20
                 THE COURT: Mr. Guerra.
21
                 MR. GUERRA: Nothing from the defense,
22
   Your Honor.
23
                 THE COURT: All right. Bernie, let's
24
   bring in the jury.
25
                 THE BAILIFF: All rise.
```

```
1
                  (Jury enters courtroom)
2
                 THE COURT: Okay. Y'all may be seated.
3
   Thank you.
4
                 All right, ladies and gentleman, both
5
   sides having rested and closed their cases it is now
6
   time for me to read you the law that applies in this
7
   case. So this is the Court's Charge we talked about
8
   yesterday. You will get to take it back into the jury
9
   room with you when you start deliberating and it will
10
   serve as your guide to deliberations.
11
                 (Court's Charge read to the jury at this
12
                 time).
13
                 THE COURT: All right. Mr. Vazquez.
14
                 MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you, Your Honor.
                                                        May
   it please the Court.
15
16
                 THE COURT: Yes, sir.
17
                 MR. VAZQUEZ: Opposing counsel.
18
                 MR. VAZQUEZ: Ladies and gentlemen of the
19
   jury, I told you at the get go that this is a
20
   straightforward case. You just heard the judge's charge
   where she defined to you intoxication. I'm not going to
21
22
   go over it again. You are going to have the charge.
23
   You are going to be able to read it. Loss of mental
24
   faculties, the defendant didn't know where he was at.
25
   The officers testified that he thought he was in Katy.
```

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

The defendant lost control of his vehicle. Hit something. He and the defendant -- oh, I'm sorry hit a barrier. Hit a barrier. All right. Was unable to control his bladder, urinated himself. The defendant was unable to stand with one leg out for more than 30 seconds and hopped to keep his balance. Wasn't able to walk a line without losing his balance or putting his arms out to the side for help. Smelled of alcohol. Officers came in and told you, all of the officers came and told you -- that they smelled alcohol on his breath. All of the officers came in and told you that they noticed red, bloodshot eyes. You saw a picture of the defendant right after the accident or right after his arrest with red, bloodshot eyes. You saw a video where you can see on his shirt the wetness from his urination. All of those are loss of physical faculties.

In addition to that, the defendant told you -- he came in and told you that he had one beer at a friend's house after a long, stressful day at work, with friends he hadn't seen for quite -- a few years, couple years, I believe he said. Friends from elementary school. He had one drink. Yet when I asked him to explain how his blood alcohol content was .14, he had no answer. Why is that, ladies and gentleman? Well, it is a simple fact. The defendant did not have just one

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

beer. He had several drinks. He was hanging out with friends, had a long, stressful day. Had a few drinks in his system. He said that he thought from 7:00 o'clock to 2:30, somewhere around there, the alcohol had burned out of his system. If you had one beer, sure, that's probably out of your system by 2:30. More than one beer? Maybe. Several? Probably not.

This case involves a defendant that has high blood pressure. He has hypertension. He has anxiety. He takes medications for those. He told you he takes medications for those. It cause dizziness, drowsiness, headaches. He testified that shortly after his arrest the medical staff at the jail evaluated him and determined that his blood pressure was high. Yet he didn't tell any of the officers, from the first officer on the scene till the last officer, that came in contact with him that he had a headache. He didn't tell any of the officers that he felt dizzy. He didn't tell any of the officers that he was injured. He never ever asked any of the officers to provide medical assistance. You heard the officers testify that had he asked for medical assistance, their duty as a police officer is to provide that person with medical assistance. They are not E.M.T.s. They are not E.M.T.s. They are trained personnel in the Houston City, City of Houston that are

trained E.M.T.s that will go out and evaluate somebody if the police officers request them. They don't know to look for signs of concussions. If they see somebody who's just in a bad wreck, going to ask them a standard question: Are you okay? And if the defendant had told them right then and there, no, I am not, they would have contacted an ambulance. You heard them testify that they would have contacted an ambulance, and I'm pretty sure that that ambulance would have shown up. E.M.T.s would have seen the wreck and said off we go.

Yet none of that happened. Why did none of that happen? Because the defendant never asked for it. He never told the officers he was dizzy. He never told the officers he had a headache. You saw his picture. There is no bruising on his face anywhere. He testified that he was wearing his glasses at the time of impact, that the airbag came out and took those glasses right off. You saw the picture. Where are the marks?

You heard him testify that without his glasses he can't walk straight. Without his glasses, he's dizzy. He's unsteady on his feet. Yet without his glasses that's not going to cause him to blow a .14. At the very end, there has still been no explanation to how we got to that blood, alcohol content at .14. That in and of itself, ladies and gentleman, is enough for you

1 to follow the Court's instructions that if the blood 2 alcohol content was .08 or greater, you must find the 3 defendant guilty. 4 Are you okay? 5 VENIREPERSONS: Yeah. I just have to 6 cough. Sorry. 7 THE COURT: Go ahead, sir. Do you need 8 water? 9 A JUROR: I have some. Thank you. Sorry. 10 MR. VAZQUEZ: Without any other stuff, 11 even if you believe his story that his blood pressure 12 medication caused his unsteadiness, even if you believe 13 that his anxiety medication caused his unsteadiness. If 14 you believe the accident discombobulated him so bad that 15 he wasn't able to perform on this field sobriety tests, 16 counsel, defense made a good point or made it clear that 17 the field sobriety tests happened over two hours after 18 the accident. Now, that story of the accident causing 19 him to be dizzy and the accident causing him to be 20 unsteady, that might be believable if they did the field sobriety tests right then and there. He had two hours 21 22 to recover from that accident. He had two hours of 23 interaction with the police. He had interaction -- the

fire department was on the scene. None of that time did

he ever ask for help. So, you've got loss of mental

24

25

```
1
   faculties not knowing where he's at. He lost those
2
   mental faculties by the introduction of an alcohol,
3
   alcoholic beverage into his system. You've got loss of
4
   physical faculties. He lost those physical faculties by
5
   the introduction of alcohol into his system. And you
6
   have a .08 or greater breath result, specifically .14.
7
                 Ladies and gentlemen, given the totality
   of the circumstances and all of the evidence that's been
8
9
   presented here in the last two days, I feel you have no
10
   choice but to come back with a guilty verdict.
11
   you very much.
12
                 THE COURT: Thank you, Mr. Vazquez.
                                                       All
13
   right. Mr. Guerra.
14
                              Thank you, Your Honor.
                 MR. GUERRA:
15
                              To the unwilling and
                 MR. GUERRA:
16
   untrained, this is a simple D.W.I. But we are not the
17
   unwilling. We ask questions. We dig deeper. We want
   the truth, what we deserve, our family deserves. It's
18
19
   what our children deserve. Otherwise, innocent people
20
   go to jail. Innocent people are prosecuted.
21
                 Let's talk about the accident. Jose told
22
   you he loss control, he fell asleep. When the officers
23
   arrived there, what they smelled was pungent, fresh
24
   urine not alcohol. That's what they smelled. And in
25
   two minutes, three officers observed him, Jose in two
```

```
1
   minutes and decided he was in custody for suspicion of
   D.W.I. Two minutes. Untrained E.M.S. officers observed
2
3
   him for two minutes, handcuffed him, put him in the back
4
   of a patrol car. Didn't give him any E.M.S. treatment.
5
   Didn't ask for it. They didn't ask the questions that
6
   were important in this scenario. An accident, a serious
7
   accident. You saw the pictures. Airbags deployed.
8
   train and willing would ask the questions that are
9
   significant to a concussion. Do you have a headache.
10
   Are you dizzy? Can you stay on your feet? They didn't
11
   ask those questions. They weren't trained. And think
   about what a concussion is. We all like football.
12
13
   Football players get concussions all the time.
14
   doesn't take them two hours to recover. Some athletes
15
   because of concussions don't ever play again. And when
16
   you see those concussions -- those helmets, do you see
17
   any abrasions on their face? You see any marks on their
18
   face? No. I say to you the airbag is the reason why
19
   Jose here is the reason that he doesn't have any
20
   abrasions but has a concussion. Just like those
21
   football players you see on Sundays.
22
                 MR. VAZQUEZ: I would object to that, Your
23
           There is no evidence that the defendant had a
24
   concussion.
25
                 THE COURT: It's a reasonable doubt, Your
```

Honor.

17 l

THE COURT: Ladies and gentlemen, you heard it from the evidence, the evidence that came from the witness stand and the evidence admitted.

All right. Please continue.

MR. GUERRA: Thank you, Your Honor.

Officer Gillham, they all said the same thing. I want to be thorough. I want to be detailed. I want to be complete. And I suspect that they will do however you can't do it in two minutes. You can't do it by observation of someone in two minutes after a major accident. You can't do it. It's impossible. It takes more time than that.

Officer Gillham took Mr. Garcia to the police station and he -- because he wants to become D.W.I. Task Force asked to perform the field sobriety tests. Didn't let the more experienced officer provide those standardized field sobriety tests. He wanted to do them himself. What does that say? He jumped to a conclusion quickly, in two minutes. Said that's not urine. That's alcohol. He's unsteady on his feet. Signs of a concussion. Redness in the eyes. Airbags deploys. What happens when an airbag deploys? Douc debris comes out. He testified some of that got in his eyes. His glasses, it's frustrating to me. It reminds

me of the scene in a movie where I think it was my girl, her friend had just been beaten and died from bee stings and she -- he doesn't have his glasses, and she's upset because he needs his glasses. Otherwise, he can't see, and I feel the same way about this situation. He needs those glasses. He can't see without them. He's unsteady on his feet because of them because he doesn't have them. You heard him testify. You heard the way he talks. For us that don't know him, for somebody that doesn't know him, met him for the first time, yeah, I would suggest that it's a little slurred. It's a little slurred.

Now, these medications that he's taking, I want to be crystal clear, he has three different prescriptions. One he takes in the morning. He took that that morning, about 7:00 when he woke up. He didn't take anything the entire day. The accident happened about 2:30 in the morning. The medications that he's not supposed to take alcohol with are taken at night. Remember what he said about those medications. What happens if he drinks alcohol? Cardiac arrest potentially. He wasn't drinking. He had one beer. He had one beer.

They say use your common sense. That's what they say. Well, common sense tells us, officer --

```
1
   the technical supervisor said, testified, that in the
2
   samples that she provided to me, at least 20 people who
3
   were taken in to provide a breath test because they were
4
   under suspicion of drinking alcohol, this machine tests
5
   alcohol and nothing else. They were under suspicion --
6
                 MR. VAZQUEZ: Objection.
7
                 MR. GUERRA: -- to come in and provide a
8
   breath test?
9
                 THE COURT: What is your objection?
10
                 MR. VAZQUEZ: Mischaracterization of the
11
   testimony.
12
                 THE COURT: Ladies and gentlemen, once
13
   again, you will recall the testimony as you heard it.
14
                 MR. GUERRA: At least 20. At least 20.
15
   And they came back with a zero or on at-least 20
16
   occasions. What does that mean? Use your common sense.
17
   That's what they are asking you to do. That's what I'm
18
   asking you to do. That machine makes. It made mistakes
19
   at least two times, and what's good for the goose is
20
   good for the gander. If it can make a mistake when
21
   there is complete alcohol, it can may a mistake when
22
   there is not. That machine makes mistakes. So use your
23
   common sense what I'm asking .
24
                 Now, we heard from Mr. Garcia. We heard
25
   about his medical conditions. And the urination, it's
```

embarrassing. Let's be honest. Let's be brutally honest. It's embarrassing it really is. He said it so can see it on his face, okay? But let me say something to you. If in fact Mr. Garcia urinated on himself because of the introduction of alcohol, because he had too much to drink, do you think it would just be a .14? I submit to you it would be much, much, much higher. He urinated on himself because of the accident, because of his medical conditions. That's why. That's what the officer smelled. That's why they brought him in for suspicion of D.W.I. because they jumped the gun. They did not take the time to fully and thoroughly in detail, in detail, and investigate what was actually happening with Mr. Garcia.

Remember what Mr. Morales said. When they came in to give the breath test, the field sobriety tests, it's just an accident. They didn't tell him the airbags were deployed. They didn't tell him the car was inoperable. Didn't tell them that stuff. Now, everybody on that stand has said the same thing. Somebody with a recent head injury, concussion, the standardized field sobriety tests would affect those outcomes. They would compromise those tests. That's what happened here. That's why you see Mr. Garcia perform the way that he did. Recent head injury.

```
1
                 The breath test. I know, it's difficult
2
   to get around, Picked up one beer. Because he can't
3
   drink anymore, otherwise he would go into a cardiac
4
   arrest. Use your common sense. That result is
5
   compromised. It's a mistake. It's not accurate.
6
                 Thank you.
7
                 THE COURT: All right. Mr. Guerra --
8
   Mr. Vazquez, you have about two minutes. If you would
9
   like to use it.
10
                 MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you, Your Honor.
11
                 Ms. Israel, the D.P.S. lady that came in,
12 l
   she talked about the Intoxilyzer machine. She also
13
   spoke of how the alcohol leaves the body. She also told
14
   you how it would be easy to do an extrapolation related
15
   back to the time of the accident. But she didn't have
16
   enough information. She said she gets that information
17
   from the prosecutor. The prosecutor gets that
18
   information from the police. The police didn't have
19
   that information because the defendant never gave it to
20
   him.
         They asked him for it. He never provided it.
21
   Instead, he asked for their names. He said, I have
22
   nothing to hide. He was very talkative on the video,
23
   very talkative. Not once did he say, I was at my
24
   friend's house. I was at a barbecue. I had fajitas.
```

I had pico de gallo. All of it sounds pretty tasty.

25

```
1
   But he had never told the police officers any of that,
2
   and he never told them he had one Corona. Why did he
3
   not tell them any of that? Because it simply just
4
   wasn't true. He didn't have one Corona. He had
5
   several. And then he got behind the wheel of his car,
6
   slammed his car into a barrier and after that this
7
   investigation happened and we're here. Ladies and
8
   gentleman, there is no doubt that this defendant was
9
   intoxicated when he was driving his vehicle, and you
10
   have one choice, come back with a guilty verdict.
11
   you.
12
                 THE COURT:
                             Thank you, Mr. Vazquez.
                                                       All
13
   right. Ladies and gentlemen, you will now retire --
14
   gentleman. I keep saying men like there's more than
15
   one. You will retire to the jury room where you will
16
   begin your deliberations and we will stand in recess
   until we hear back from you all.
17
18
                 THE BAILIFF: All rise.
19
                  (Jury retired for deliberations)
20
                 THE COURT: Let's go on the record.
21
   Mr. Guerra, do you have something -- well, I want the
22
   record to reflect that the jury has buzzed and indicated
23
   that they have a verdict, but we have not taken the
24
   verdict yet because it was just brought to the Court's
25
   attention by Mr. Vazquez and Mr. Guerra have this issue
```

```
1
   that they wanted to address. And while we were
2
   discussing that is when the jury bus wed a verdict.
                                                         So
3
   before we take the verdict Mr. Guerra, I'm going to
4
   allow you to put some things on the record if you would
5
   like to, sir.
6
                 MR. GUERRA:
                               Sure.
                                      Thank you, Your Honor.
7
   Your Honor, shortly after we concluded with trial,
8
   Mr. Vazquez indicated to me that there were some 911
9
   recordings that were not previously turned over to the
10
   defense. I honestly think the State was -- they were
11
   not aware of these 911 tapes until probably today. But
12
   the information contained in those 911 tapes indicates
13
   that it was a two-vehicle accident, that somebody
14
   potentially hit Mr. Garcia and then left the scene.
   indicates that there was a tow truck driver -- tow truck
15
16
   driver, a wrecker there already at the scene.
17
   Obviously, if we would have had this information we
18
   would have been able to investigate who the truck driver
19
   was, what if anything they have to say regarding
   Mr. Garcia and/or the other vehicle that was involved.
20
   If the other vehicle that was involved was at fault in
21
22
   this accident, it makes a big difference as to how we
23
   move forward, how we present the case to the jury. I
24
   believe that these tapes would have been discovered in a
25
   timely fashion by both the State and myself. There
```

```
1
   could have been some investigation done on my part, on
2
   our part to investigate what those recordings say
   happened at the time of the accident. I would ask for
3
4
   those recordings to be presented or placed as part of
5
   the record. I believe it's four recordings and I would
6
   ask respectfully for a mistrial at this point based on
7
   those recordings.
8
                 THE COURT: Okay. Do you want to -- are
9
   they on one tape or disk?
10
                 MS. HAYNES: We can download them, I
11
   believe to a disk, Your Honor.
12
                 THE COURT: So, I would like to hear the
13
   recordings before I rule on your motion for a mistrial.
14
                 MR. GUERRA: Thank you, Your Honor.
15
                 THE COURT:
                             If you will play -- I guess
16
   you will mark it as an exhibit, right, for the record?
17
                 MR. GUERRA: Yes, ma'am.
18
                 THE COURT:
                              If it ends up being a guilty
19
   verdict.
             So, you can mark it -- you don't have a 23.
20
                 MR. GUERRA:
                               I was all off base, Your
21
   Honor.
22
                 THE COURT: You didn't have a 14, either.
23
                 MR. GUERRA: I think I have a disk here or
241
   at least a cover with -- we can use this as -- I was
25
   going to use this as 13. I was going to use this as 13.
```

```
1
                 THE COURT: You have 13. Let's do it as
2
   12 since it will be -- since it's after the fact.
3
                 MR. GUERRA: That's fine.
4
                  THE COURT: And we are going to put the
5
   recordings on defense Exhibit No. 23 which is a disk
6
   which I will admit for the purposes of your motion for
7
   mistrial in the event that I deny it and this is a
8
   guilty verdict. Okay. So, let's hear the recordings.
9
                 MR. VAZQUEZ: Your Honor, we don't have
10
   any audio disks here, so I'm going to go find one while
11
   the recordings are playing if that's all right.
12
                 THE COURT: Okay.
13
                  (Defense Exhibit 23 played before the
14
                 Court.)
15
                 THE COURT: Is that it?
16
                 MR. VAZQUEZ: Your Honor.
17
                 THE COURT: Anything else from either side
18
   before I rule on your motion?
19
                 MR. VAZQUEZ: I just would like to add,
20
   Your Honor, that the fact -- this jury -- this jury
   based on what they heard, they take that accident --
21
22
   they are going to take that accident into account and
23
   into consideration and they are blaming him, Mr. Garcia,
24
   without question; and he did testify he believed he fell
25
   asleep. But now we have a second vehicle that is
```

Jose A. Garcia - July 15, 2015 Cross-Examination by Mr. Vazquez

```
1
   involved. The fact that there is a second vehicle
2
   involved and it's a hit-and-run situation, Your Honor, I
3
   believe that that open tends to be exculpatory. So on
4
   that point, again I would reurge my motion for a
5
   mistrial at this point.
6
                 THE COURT: Okay. Your motion for a
7
   mistrial is denied. So we are going to bring in the
8
   jury and find out what their verdict is. In the event
9
   that it is a quilty and in the event that your client
10
   appeals the matter, then you will have this as a part of
11
   the record.
12
                 MR. GUERRA: Yes, ma'am.
13
                 THE COURT: All right. Let's bring in the
14
   jury.
15
                 THE BAILIFF: All rise.
16
                 (Jury's enters.)
17
                 THE COURT: Please be seated. Ladies and
18
   gentleman, have you reached a verdict?
19
                 THE JURY: Yes, we have.
20
                 THE COURT: Is it unanimous, ma'am?
21
                 THE JURY: Yes, it is.
                 THE COURT: Pass it to the bailiff.
22
23
   Mr. Garcia, remain standing. All right. This is Cause
   No. 2004882, "the State of Texas versus Jose A. Garcia.
24
25
   We, the jury, find the defendant guilty. Signed by the
```

Jose A. Garcia - July 15, 2015 Cross-Examination by Mr. Vazquez

```
1
   foreperson." Anything more from either side?
2
                 MR. VAZQUEZ: Nothing from the State, Your
3
   Honor.
4
                 MR. GUERRA: Nothing from us.
5
                 THE COURT: All right. Ladies and
6
   gentlemen, I will accept your verdict and this will
7
   conclude your jury service. So, if you will step into
8
   the back one last time. I will be back there with your
9
   work excuse forms. And does anybody want a bus pass? I
10
   forgot to tell the jury about that yesterday. Y'all are
11
   all entitled to a free bus pass. It also works on Metro
12
   Rail. It will be effective for today. Does anyone need
13
   one?
14
                 VENIREPERSONS: No.
15
                 THE COURT: All right. If y'all will step
16
   back in the back, I will be back there shortly.
17
                 THE BAILIFF: All rise.
18
                 (Jury leaves courtroom)
19
                 THE COURT: I know that you are coming to
20
   the Court for punishment. I don't know if you guys
   wanted to talk before so that they can make a
21
22
   recommendation or if you want to have a punishment
23
   hearing where I will make a decision about what the
24
   punishment should be. All right. Let me go talk to the
25
   jury while you guys talk.
```

1 (Recess taken) 2 THE COURT: Okay. The jury having found 3 Mr. Garcia quilty of the offense of driving while 4 intoxicated, it is now time to move on to the punishment 5 phase of the trial. I understand that when we took a 6 break after the verdict, both sides had an opportunity 7 to talk and come to an agreement; is that correct? 8 MR. VAZQUEZ: Yes, Your Honor. 9 MR. GUERRA: It is, Your Honor. 10 THE COURT: What is the recommendation of 11 the State and the agreement by the Defense? 12 MR. VAZQUEZ: Your Honor, the State would offer 15 months probation, a 1,000-dollar fine. Of 13 14 course, all the standard conditions that come with 15 probation, including D.W.I. education, random 16 urinalysis, the D.A.E.T., Thinking for a Change class, 17 \$50, Crime Stoppers; 24 hours community service; and breath test refusal. 18 19 MR. GUERRA: That is our understanding, 20 Your Honor. 21 MR. VAZQUEZ: Your Honor, I'm not sure it 22 will be helpful; but we've discussed -- because he lives 23 in Harlingen, the State is not opposed to transfer his 24 probation to Harlingen. 25 THE COURT: Mr. Garcia, I know when you

Jose A. Garcia - July 15, 2015 Cross-Examination by Mr. Vazquez

```
1
   first came to court I put bond conditions on you that
2
   you indicated that you have not a car. And I know your
3
   car was wrecked. Have you since acquired a car?
4
                 THE DEFENDANT: The first month I was on a
5
   home device; and since I got a car, you honored to put
6
   it on a car.
7
                 THE COURT: Oh, I've allowed you to put it
8
   on a car?
9
                 THE DEFENDANT: Yes.
10
                 THE COURT: There is not an amended
11
   condition in here so I allowed you to do it through your
12
   officer.
13
                 MR. VAZQUEZ: I will check, Your Honor.
14
                 THE COURT: I know there hasn't been any
   violations because there is a violation report, so you
15
16
   do have the interlock on your car.
17
                 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, ma'am.
18
                 THE COURT: Where is it that you are
19
   working in Harlingen? I didn't catch it.
20
                 THE DEFENDANT: I am working in Harlingen.
21
                 THE COURT: Doing what?
22
                 THE DEFENDANT: I'm a store manager for
23
   Outdoor Traveler at Bass Pro shop.
24
                 THE COURT: Bass Pro Shop. All right.
25
   The jury having found you guilty I am now going to
```

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

```
assess your punishment at 180 days in jail. That will
be probated for a period of 15 months. There will be a
$500 fine. $50 to Crime Stoppers, 24 hours of community
service. Random drug and alcohol testing.
                                           There will
also be a drug and alcohol evaluation. If it's
determined that you need some treatment, you will have
to follow the treatment recommendations. You will
attend a D.W.I. education course. You are also not
going to be allowed to drive without a valid license,
insurance and that ignition interlock device on your
vehicle. And I will grant consent to allow you to
transfer it to -- what county is that?
              THE DEFENDANT: Hidalgo County.
              THE COURT: Hidalgo County.
              THE DEFENDANT: I was wondering if I could
move to Las Vegas. I am right now in Hidalgo County,
but I definitely want to leave Texas. I was wondering
if I could transfer the probation to Las Vegas.
              THE COURT: I cannot answer that question
for you right now because Las Vegas would have to accept
supervision of you. So that is something that once you
start probation in Hidalgo County, if you make that
request then their transfer unit will have to get
permission from Las Vegas for them to even except you as
a probationer there. And then you wouldn't be able to
```

```
1
   transfer without their permission. It has to do with
2
   state-to-state agreements. So I -- we can't make that
3
   decision right now.
4
                 THE DEFENDANT:
                                  Okay.
5
                 THE COURT: So as you start this
6
   probation, since you currently reside in Hidalgo County,
7
   that's where you will be supervised once there is a
8
   transfer. Our probation officer has left for the day so
9
   you are going to have to come back tomorrow morning. So
10
   I will ask that you be here by 9:30 so that she can go
11
   over all of these conditions with you.
12
                 THE DEFENDANT: Okay.
13
                 THE COURT: Okay.
14
                 THE DEFENDANT: I was going to ask if I
15
   could come back like next week to complete it. It's
16
   just like I have an emergency in the valley.
17
                 THE COURT: No, sir. You have to come
18
   back tomorrow. You do. I'm sorry about your emergency,
19
   but you have to be back tomorrow because you are
20
   technically sentenced today. So you have to come back
21
   and go over your conditions tomorrow. But if you are
22
   hear at 9:30, she will get you out of here as soon as
23
   she can. You will be probably one of the first people
24
   that she seize in the morning, okay?
25
                 THE DEFENDANT: Do I come to this Court?
```

Trial on Merits July 15, 2015

THE COURT: You will come to this Court. And the probation people will know before you are here to what -- to expect and ideally she will have the paperwork ready for you by the time you get here. That concludes this trial. I do need to tell you that because you were convicted, you do have a right to appeal this matter. You have 30 days to file your notice of appeal. You can discuss that option with your lawyer if you choose to do so. All right. With that, this trial is concluded. Thank you. MR. GUERRA: Thank you, Your Honor. MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you, Your Honor. (Proceedings concluded)

1 STATE OF TEXAS
2 COUNTY OF HARRIS

I, Terri L. Johnstone, Official Court Reporter in and for the County Criminal Court at Law No. 1 of Harris County, State of Texas, do hereby certify that the above and foregoing contains a true and correct transcription of all portions of evidence and other proceedings requested in writing by counsel for the parties to be included in this volume of the Reporter's Record in the above-styled and numbered cause, all of which occurred in open court or in chambers and were reported by me.

I further certify that this Reporter's Record of the proceedings truly and correctly reflects the exhibits, if any, offered by the respective parties.

ا ک

/s/Terri L. Johnstone

Terri L. Johnstone, CSR
Texas CSR 2430
Official Court Reporter
County Criminal Court No. 1
Harris County, Texas
1201 Franklin
Houston, Texas 77002
Telephone: 713-755-0778
Expiration: 12/31/2017